



**Minutes
June 8, 2023**

The City of Salisbury Historic Preservation Commission met in a regular session at 5:30 p.m. on Thursday, June 8, 2023, in City Council Chambers at 217 South Main Street.

Present: Steve Cobb, Ellie Goodnow, Will James, Sue McHugh, Jon Planovsky, Spencer Dixon

Absent: Larry Richardson, Jeff Richen, Marcelo Menza

Staff Present: Graham Corriher, Jenni Pfaff, Emily Vanek

CALL TO ORDER AND INTRODUCTIONS

The meeting was called to order by the Chair, Sue McHugh.

PURPOSE AND PROCEDURE

The purpose and procedure of the meeting was presented by the Chair, Sue McHugh.

**EX PARTE COMMUNICATION/
CONFLICT OF INTEREST OR APPEARANCE OF CONFLICT**

None.

Emily Vanek was sworn in.

NEW CERTIFICATES OF APPROPRIATENESS

H-23-2023, 130 West Kerr Street, FCX Real Estate Holdings, Owner; Ralph Young, Applicant (Parcel ID: 011 058)

Request

Installation of internally illuminated monument signage.

Identification of Property

Emily Vanek made a staff presentation that included COA history. The commercial building was built in 2005, and is considered "Non-Contributing" to the Downtown Local Historic District.

Staff Findings

Staff finds the following elements of the project to be partially incongruous with the character of the Downtown Local Historic District:

- 1) The applicant has requested approval to install a 4'6" by 6' internally illuminated monument sign. Standard 4.7.4. says to introduce signage that is compatible with the architectural character of the building. Standard 4.7.10. says that signs illuminated from within are generally not appropriate.
- 2) Standard 4.7.11. says to install freestanding signs appropriately on well-landscaped areas.

Staff Recommendation

Based on the preceding findings, staff recommends that the Commission approve H-23-2023 at the located at 130 West Kerr Street, within the Downtown Local Historic District (Parcel ID: 011 058), subject to the following condition:

- 1) The signage shall not be internally illuminated.

Applicant Testimony

Ralph Young was sworn in. He verified that the building is not historical, and that the sign will include landscaping.

In response to questions, Mr. Young verified the size of the sign and how it would be affixed to the ground, the sight line, and that it will be facing North Church Street.

Public Comment

None.

Deliberation

Members agreed the request meets city guidelines and requirements, and that the standards address internally illuminated signs.

In their discussion regarding illuminated signs in the immediate vicinity, members agreed that a lighted sign would provide light for pedestrians, and would fit within its surroundings. Allowing an internally illuminated sign would open the door for more in the future.

Findings of Fact

Will James made the following MOTION: "I have reviewed the case and all presented testimony and facts and am familiar with the property in question and, therefore, move that the Commission find the following facts concerning HPC case #H-23-2023

- 1) That **Ralph Young, agent for FCX Properties, owner,** appeared before the Commission and sought a Certificate of Appropriateness for the property located at **130 West Kerr Street** and designated within the **Downtown** Local Historic District.

- 2) The proposed project is **incongruous** as detailed in the application and staff finding number 1-2 and incorporated herein; the applicant added that landscaping would be installed around the sign.

- 3) The findings are subject to the 1 condition recommended by staff and incorporated herein.”

Jon Planovsky seconded the MOTION. All members present VOTED AYE (6-0), via voice vote.

Action

Will James continued, “I, therefore, move based on the testimony presented, the adopted Findings of Fact, and the adopted Local Historic Design Standards that the Commission **Approve H-23-2023** subject to the condition detailed in the Findings of Fact.”

Jon Planovsky seconded the MOTION. All members present VOTED AYE (6-0), via voice vote.

H-24-2023, 422 East Fisher Street; Balbina Soriano, Owner; Nelly Olivares, Applicant (Parcel ID: 010 377)

Request

Replacement of siding, roofing; installation of light fixtures.

Identification of Property

Emily Vanek made a staff presentation, including COA history. The Shaver-Crowell-Fisher House is classified as “Contributing” to the Brooklyn-South Square Local Historic District. The Victorian cottage was built in 1875.

Staff Findings

Staff finds the following element of the project to be **incongruous** with the character of the Brooklyn-South Square Local Historic District:

- 1) The applicant has requested approval to replace the siding of the house with cementitious siding. The house is clad with replacement asbestos siding with wooden siding underneath. The proposed siding has a thickness of .312” and can have a vertical exposure of 5-8”. Standard 3.1.9, says that it is recommended to remove later siding and restore the original. Standard 3.1.10, says cementitious siding can be reviewed on a case-by-case basis.
- 2) The metal roof is proposed to be replaced with asphalt shingles. Standard 3.4.2, says to retain character defining roofing and replace with material that matches the original.
- 3) A light fixture is proposed to be installed next to the front door. Standard 4.3.1 and 4.3.2 say to introduce unobtrusive exterior lighting in residential areas that is understated and compatible with the residential quality of the property and district and Standard 4.3.3, 4.3.4, and 4.3.5 say to introduce subtle, low-level lighting at the edge of the property for the safety of pedestrians and Standard 4.3.6 says to ensure lighting does not spill onto other properties.

Staff Recommendation

Based on the preceding findings, staff recommends that the Commission approve H-23-2023 at the Shaver-Crowell-Fisher House located at 422 East Fisher Street, within the Brooklyn-South Square Local Historic District (Parcel ID: 010 377), subject to the following condition:

- 1) The roof shall not be replaced with asphalt shingles.

Applicant Testimony

Nelly Olivares and Kevin Hall, roofing contractor, were sworn in. Mr. Hall explained that there is evidence that the original roof was standing seam metal, however, the existing metal roof is not, and he recommends replacing it with asphalt in order to protect the house from further leakage. Mr. Hall has installed asphalt roofs in this district.

Regarding replacement of asbestos siding with hardie plank, Ms. Olivares explained that she planned to wrap the original siding as opposed to tearing it off. During their examination of photos, members expressed concern with the condition of the windows, and explained that wrapping would only exacerbate water leakage, and that replacing the small bits of broken asbestos would be much more cost effective.

In response to questions on the requested lighting, Ms. Olivares explained that it would be for her safety, mounted under the soffits, and motion-activated.

Public Comment

None.

Deliberation

The board agreed that asphalt shingles would be appropriate for the roof, given the preceding testimony, and that the existing roof is not original. They continued the discussion of their concern regarding wrapping the house with cementitious siding, as that would entail driving nails into the asbestos, and would exacerbate existing problems. The addition of security lighting showed no issues, as long as the fixtures are installed underneath the soffits.

Findings of Fact

Steve Cobb made the following MOTION: "I have reviewed the case and all presented testimony and facts and am familiar with the property in question and, therefore, move that the Commission find the following facts concerning HPC case #H-24-2023

- 1) That **Nelly Olivares, agent for Balbina Soriano, owner,** appeared before the Commission and sought a Certificate of Appropriateness for the property located at **422 East Fisher Street** and designated within the **Brooklyn-South Square** Local Historic District.
- 2) The proposed project is **partially incongruous** as detailed in the application and staff finding number 1-3 and incorporated herein; Kevin Hall, roofing contractor, testified to the feasibility of various roof options.

- 3) The findings are subject to the following conditions recommended by staff and incorporated herein:
- a. The metal roof may be removed and replaced with asphalt shingles,
 - b. The lighting shall be installed under the soffits of the house,
 - c. The use of cementitious siding is not approved.”

Spencer Dixon seconded the MOTION with all members present VOTING AYE (6-0), via voice vote.

Action

Steve Cobb continued, “I, therefore, move based on the testimony presented, the adopted Findings of Fact, and the adopted Local Historic Design Standards that the Commission **Approve H-24-2023** subject to any conditions detailed in the Findings of Fact.”

Spencer Dixon seconded the MOTION with all members present VOTING AYE (6-0), via voice vote.

H-26-2023, 602 North Main Street; Charles Shuler, Owner/Applicant; (Parcel ID: 011 096)

Request

Demolition.

Identification of Property

Emily Vanek made a staff presentation, including COA history. The CMU block storage building, built in the 1960’s, is classified as “Non-Contributing” to the Downtown Local Historic District.

Staff Findings

Staff finds the following element of the project to be not incongruous with the character of the Downtown Local Historic District:

- 1) The applicant has requested approval for demolition of the structure at 602 North Main Street. The structure was built in the 1960’s and the walls have structural damage. HPC may institute a demolition delay of 365 days, but staff recommends allowing immediate demolition. Staff has not discovered any historical or archeological significance associated with the structure.

Staff Recommendation

Based on the preceding findings, staff recommends that the Commission approve H-26-2023 at the building located at 6002 North Main Street, within the Downtown Local Historic District (Parcel ID: 010 096).

Applicant Testimony

Charles Shuler was sworn in. Mr. Shuler provided a history of the building, and his reasons for requesting demolition. Photos illustrated that the building will fall on its own, if not demolished.

Public Comment

None.

Deliberation

Members agreed with Mr. Shuler's assessment.

Motion

Ellie Goodnow made a MOTION, "I have reviewed the case and all presented testimony and facts and am familiar with the property in question and, therefore, move that the Commission find the following facts concerning HPC case **#H-26-2023**

- 1) That **Charles Shuler, owner**, appeared before the Commission and sought a Certificate of Appropriateness for the property located at **602 North Main Street** and designated within the **Downtown** Local Historic District. Mr. Shuler gave evidence that the building is not historically or architecturally significant.
- 2) The proposed project is **not incongruous** as detailed in the application and staff finding number 1 and incorporated herein."

Jon Planovsky seconded the MOTION. The motion carried with all members present VOTING AYE (6-0), via voice vote.

Action

Ellie Goodnow continued, "I, therefore, move based on the testimony presented, the adopted Findings of Fact, and the adopted Local Historic Design Standards that the Commission **Approve H-26-2023** subject to any conditions detailed in the Findings of Fact."

Spencer Dixon seconded the MOTION. The motion carried with all members present VOTING AYE (6-0), via voice vote.

H-27-2023, 430 South Fulton Street; Brandon and Kimberly McNeely, Owners; Natalie Baird, Applicant; (Parcel ID: 009 169)

Request

Installation of backyard pool and walkways.

Identification of Property

Emily Vanek made a staff presentation, including COA history. The Colonial Revival house, built 1890-1910, is classified as "Contributing" to the West Square Local Historic District.

Staff Findings

Staff finds the following element of the project to be **not incongruous** with the character of the West Square Local Historic District:

- 1) The applicant has requested approval to install a backyard pool. This will include removing the back-yard deck, which is a modern addition, and replacing with concrete steps off the rear door.

- 2) The pool will be located in the rear yard, behind a privacy fence, and not visible from the front. Standard 4.5.4. says that it is not appropriate to install contemporary site features, such as a swimming pool, if it would compromise the historic character of the site or be visible from the street.
- 3) Existing concrete paving will be removed in the rear yard and concrete walks and areas will be installed. Standard 4.2.10. says that typical walkways and paths are constructed of brick, stone, gravel, or similar materials.
- 4) No additional lighting is proposed, except for the lights within the pool. This is consistent with Standard 4.3.3.
- 5) The pool and walkways could be removed in the future and the property could be returned to its original appearance, which is consistent with the Secretary of the Interior's Standard #10.

Staff Recommendation

Based on the preceding findings, staff recommends that the Commission approve H-27-2023 at the House located at 430 South Fulton Street, within the West Square Local Historic District (Parcel ID: 009 169).

Applicant Testimony

Natalie Baird was sworn in. She explained that she has also installed the pool next door to the applicants, and that fencing will not be modified. The proposed walkways will use both stone and concrete; standards allow for concrete.

Public Comment

None.

Deliberation

Members required very little deliberation.

Motion

Spencer Dixon made a MOTION, "I have reviewed the case and all presented testimony and facts and am familiar with the property in question and, therefore, move that the Commission find the following facts concerning HPC case **#H-27-2023**

- 1) That **Natalie Baird, agent for Kimberly McNeely, owner,** appeared before the Commission and sought a Certificate of Appropriateness for the property located at **430 South Fulton Street** and designated within the **West Square** Local Historic District.
- 2) The proposed project is **not incongruous** as detailed in the application and staff finding number 1-5 and incorporated herein."

Will James seconded the MOTION. The motion carried with all members present VOTING AYE (6-0), via voice vote.

Action

Spencer Dixon continued, “I, therefore, move based on the testimony presented, the adopted Findings of Fact, and the adopted Local Historic Design Standards that the Commission **Approve H-27-2023** subject to any conditions detailed in the Findings of Fact.”

Will James seconded the MOTION. The motion carried with all members present VOTING AYE (6-0), via voice vote.

H-28-2023, 1101 North Main Street; Freedom Properties, LLC, Owner; Larry Cooper, Applicant; (Parcel ID: 007 052)

Request

After-the-fact replacement of exterior door.

Identification of Property

Emily Vanek made a staff presentation, including COA history. The Della Vista Tourist Home, built ca. 1950, is classified as “Fill” in the North Main Street Local Historic District.

Staff Findings

Staff finds the following element of the project to be not incongruous with the character of the North Main Street Local Historic District:

- 1) The applicant has requested after-the-fact approval to replace the front exterior door. The previous door was a nine lite, two panel wooden door and the replacement door is a wooden oval lite door, which is a more modern style. Standard 3.3.3, says if replacement of a door is necessary to replace with a new door that matches the original in size, material, style, and detail.

Staff Recommendation

Based on the preceding findings, staff recommends that the Commission approve H-28-2022 at the Della Villa Tourist Home located at 1101 North Main Street, within the North Main Street Local Historic District (Parcel ID: 007 052).

Applicant Testimony

Larry Cooper was sworn in. He was not aware that he needed to replace the door with a similar one, and will do that if necessary. He saw this style door on another house in the neighborhood.

Mr. Cooper would also like to install security cameras for the tenants; he will discuss that with Ms. Vanek.

Public Comment

None.

Deliberation

Members asked to see the previous door. They noted that the current one is wood, and fits the opening. Mr. Cooper will caulk around the perimeter.

Motion

Steve Cobb made a MOTION, “I have reviewed the case and all presented testimony and facts and am familiar with the property in question and, therefore, move that the Commission find the following facts concerning HPC case #H-28-2023

- 1) That **Larry Cooper, agent for Freedom Properties LLC, owner,** appeared before the Commission and sought a Certificate of Appropriateness for the property located at **1101 North Main Street** and designated within the **North Main Street** Local Historic District.
- 2) The proposed project is **not incongruous** as detailed in the application and staff finding number 1 and incorporated herein.”

Spencer Dixon seconded the MOTION. The motion carried with all members present VOTING AYE (6-0), via voice vote.

Action

Steve Cobb continued, “I, therefore, move based on the testimony presented, the adopted Findings of Fact, and the adopted Local Historic Design Standards that the Commission **Approve H-28-2023** subject to any conditions detailed in the Findings of Fact.”

Spencer Dixon seconded the MOTION. The motion carried with all members present VOTING AYE (6-0), via voice vote.

OTHER BUSINESS

Committee Reports

In their meeting, the HPI Grant Committee updated the guidelines to increase the maximum city participation for low to moderate income applicants to \$7,500. HPC members received a copy of the revised guidelines. Spencer Dixon made a motion to approve the new HPI grant guidelines. Jon Planovsky seconded the motion, and all members present voted AYE.

Sue McHugh, Will James, Ellie Goodnow, Larry Richardson, and Steve Cobb have volunteered to serve on the new Cultural Preservation Committee. A meeting will be scheduled; members preferred Tuesday or Thursday, during the day, after the second week in July.

Minor Works Report

Emily Vanek clarified items on the report. Jon Planovsky made a motion to approve the Minor Works Report. Spencer Dixon seconded the motion, and all members present voted AYE.

Approval of Minutes

May, 2023 HPC minutes were approved as written by all Members present.

Architectural Survey

Ms. Vanek updated members regarding the ongoing architectural survey. She will inquire if the city can perform these surveys independently in the future without the use of a consultant.

ADJOURNMENT

The meeting adjourned at 7:22 pm. The next meeting will be held on Thursday, June 13, 2023, in City Council Chambers.

Sue McHugh, Chair

Jennifer Pfaff, Secretary