



**Minutes
January 12, 2023**

The City of Salisbury Historic Preservation Commission met in a regular session at 5:30 p.m. on Thursday, January 12, 2023, in City Council Chambers at 217 South Main Street.

Present: Steve Cobb, Spencer Dixon, Ellie Goodnow, Will James, Jon Planovsky, Larry Richardson, Andrew Walker, Acey Worthy

Absent: Marcelo Menza

Staff Present: Jenni Pfaff, Emily Vanek

CALL TO ORDER AND INTRODUCTIONS

The meeting was called to order by the Chair, Andrew Walker. Members introduced themselves.

PURPOSE AND PROCEDURE

The purpose and procedure of the meeting was presented by the Chair, Andrew Walker.

**EX PARTE COMMUNICATION/
CONFLICT OF INTEREST OR APPEARANCE OF CONFLICT**

None.

Emily Vanek was sworn in.

NEW CERTIFICATES OF APPROPRIATENESS

H-01-2023, 209 South Long Street; Paris Construction Company, Owner; Darian Paris, Applicant (Parcel ID: 019 073)

Request

New house construction on a vacant lot.

Identification of Property

Emily Vanek made a staff presentation. There is no COA history. The property is located in the Brooklyn-South Square Local Historic District.

Staff Findings

Staff finds the following element of the project to be not incongruous with the character of the Brooklyn-South Square Local Historic District:

- 1) The applicant has requested approval for the construction of a new 1,250 square foot single-family house. The lot was clear cut in October without COA approval.

Setbacks and Orientation

- 2) Standard 5.1.1. says to keep setbacks of the proposed building consistent with adjacent buildings within the district. Proposed and required setbacks and front setbacks for adjacent properties are listed in the table below:

	Proposed Setbacks	Required Setbacks
Front	33'	10'
South Side	22'	20% total (16' total)
North Side	30'	20% total (16' total)
Rear	37'	25'

	Front Setbacks
215 S Long St (non-contributing)	53'
221 S Long St	30'
210 S Long St	10'
206 S Long St	10'
200 S Long St	7'
Average Existing	22'
Average Contributing	14.25'

- 3) Standard 5.1.3. says to make the distances between the proposed building and adjacent buildings consistent with other buildings within the district. Proposed distances and current distances are listed in the table below:

	North Side	South Side
Proposed 209 S Long St	49'	28'
215 S Long St	28' (proposed)	22'
221 S Long St	22'	41'
210 S Long St	21'	Empty lot
206 S Long St	9'	21'
200 S Long St	Corner lot	9'
Average existing	17.3'	28'

- 4) The building is proposed to face South Long Street, which is consistent with Standard 5.1.4.
- 5) Standard 5.1.7. says that parking should be accessed from alleys or side streets if possible. No alternative access is available at this lot and the proposed driveway is located near the north property line. There is an existing curb cut near the south property line. Driveways are located on South Long Street at 215 and 221 South Long Street. The material and size of the driveway is not specified and no walkway from the driveway to the proposed building is identified in the site plan.

Size and Scale

- 6) Standard 5.2.1. says to design the height of the new building to be compatible with the height of historic buildings on the same block. Houses on this block range from one to two stories. The proposed building is two stories. Standard 5.2.2. says to design the ratio of the proposed building's height and width to be consistent with contributing buildings in the district. Adjacent houses to this lot are typically wider than they are tall, with exceptions at 221 and 229 South Long Street.
- 7) Standard 5.2.3. says to introduce windows and doors that are compatible in proportion, shape, position, pattern, and size with those found on contributing structures within the district. The fenestration pattern of the façade on the first story is similar to 206, 210, and 218 South Long Street and similar to 221 South Long Street on the first and second stories. The predominant roof form is gable with shed style dormer. The porch has a gable roof and the rear has gable and hipped roofs. On this block, there are a mix of gable and hipped roof forms. The proposed roof forms are consistent with Standard 5.2.4.

Materials, Design Elements, and Rhythm

- 8) Finishing materials on the proposed house include asphalt shingles, cementitious shakes and lap siding, brick foundation, wooden windows and exterior doors, wooden tapered columns, porch floors, steps, and balustrade. Standard 5.3.1. says to use materials that are commonly found in the district in new construction, such as wood, brick, and metal. Standard 5.3.2. says that cementitious siding may be used in place of wood siding on new houses if the siding is non-grained, has the same thickness and vertical exposure as wooden siding on historic houses nearby, and corner boards and trim will be used.
- 9) Standard 5.3.3. says to make the scale of the proposed building compatible with contributing buildings. Standard 5.3.4. says to introduce architectural details that compliment contributing structures in the district. Tapered columns are found on 200 and 221 South Long Street and brick foundations and front porches are common along this block. Shake siding can be found on other Craftsman style houses in the district, including at 319 and 305 East Fisher Street. Standard 5.3.6. says to avoid large expanses of blank walls. Standard 5.3.8. says to design new construction to be compatible with historic buildings in the district, but does not directly copy them.

Staff Recommendation

Based on the preceding findings, staff recommends that the Commission approve H-01-2023 at the property located at 209 South Long Street, within the Brooklyn South Square Local Historic District (Parcel ID: 019 073), subject to the following conditions:

- 1) Smooth cementitious lap siding shall be used instead of the engineered wood lap siding. The applicant shall submit specifications to staff before installation;
- 2) The material of the proposed driveway shall be gravel to match other driveways on the block;
- 3) The applicant shall return to HPC with window and exterior door specifications.

Applicant Testimony

Darian Paris was sworn in. Mr. Paris had no additional information to add, however, provided specifications for the windows and doors. In response to questions from Members, he explained that windows and doors will be wood; windows will be true divided light, with individual panes. The porch railings will be wood; shakes will be 36-inch sections. The back door will have a window. The comparable house shown during the presentation was also built by Mr. Paris, using materials he plans to use for this house, with exception to doors, windows, and porch columns. Two large trees had fallen and several others were removed.

Public Comment

Sue McHugh was sworn in. Ms. McHugh expressed concern that the property had been clear-cut, and asked that the board ensure that mature trees be planted as replacements. She stressed the importance of trees as a part of the character of the district.

Deliberation

The Chair reminded Members to consider scale, dimension, and materials, as opposed to the size of the building or lot. He asked them to consider how new construction fits into the district.

Members agreed the design is compatible with the neighborhood, including the use of certain substitute materials. Regarding replacement of trees, the Standards require removed trees to be replaced, so Ms. Vanek will consult with the City Arborist on size and species.

Findings of Fact

Ellie Goodnow made the following MOTION: “I have reviewed the case and all presented testimony and facts and am familiar with the property in question and, therefore, move that the Commission find the following facts concerning HPC case #H-01-2023

- 1) That **Darian Paris, agent for Paris Construction Company LLC, owner,** appeared before the Commission and sought a Certificate of Appropriateness for the property located at **209 South Long Street** and designated within the **Brooklyn-South Square** Local Historic District.

- 2) The proposed project is **not incongruous** as detailed in the application and staff finding number 1-9 and incorporated herein; Sue McHugh requested that HPC apply a condition requiring removed trees be replaced with mature trees of a similar size and species.
- 3) The findings are subject to the following conditions recommended by staff and incorporated herein;
 - 1) Smooth cementitious lap siding shall be used instead of the engineered wood lap siding. The applicant shall submit specifications to staff prior to installation;
 - 2) A tree planting plan shall be created with the City Arborist and implemented by the applicant to replace removed trees to meet Standard 4.5.2.
 - 3) Windows and exterior doors shall be wooden with true-divided lights. The applicant shall submit specifications to staff prior to installation.”

Will James seconded the MOTION with all members present VOTING AYE (8-0), via voice vote.

Action

I, therefore, move based on the testimony presented, the adopted Findings of Fact, and the adopted Local Historic Design Standards that the Commission: **Approve H-01-2023** subject to any conditions detailed in the Findings of Fact.”

Will James seconded the MOTION. The motion carried with members present VOTING (7-1), via voice vote.

H-02-2023, 1711 North Main Street, Lillian and James Cancer, Owners/Applicants; (Parcel ID: 007 112)

Request

After-the-fact prefabricated storage building in front side yard.

Identification of Property

Emily Vanek made a staff presentation that included COA history. The Marsh House was built in 1940, in the English Cottage Style, and is considered “Contributing” to the North Main Street Local Historic District.

Staff Findings

Staff finds the following element of the project to be incongruous with the character of the North Main Street Local Historic District:

- 1) The applicant has requested after-the-fact approval for the installation of a prefabricated storage shed with standing seam metal gable roof. Standard 3.6.6 says that prefabricated storage buildings are appropriate provided they have a shingle roof and are constructed of wood painted in a color that compliments the house. The body and roof style of the shed should complement the house as well.

- 2) Standard 3.6.7 says to locate new outbuildings in rear yards in a traditional relationship with the main building.

Staff Recommendation

Based on the preceding findings, staff recommends that the Commission deny H-02-2023 at the Marsh House located at 1711 North Main Street, within the North Main Street Local Historic District (Parcel ID: 007 112).

Applicant Testimony

Lillian and James Cancer were sworn in. Ms. Cancer testified that they were unaware of the COA procedure when they purchased the shed. The couple relocated to Salisbury from another state, and had installed the shed before they were aware of Historic District Standards.

Public Comment

None.

Deliberation

Members discussed the mitigating circumstance of a late receipt of notification vs. the burden being on the homeowner to research conditions on a property. The Cancers said it was not possible to move it behind the house, so Members explored, using photographs provided by staff, how far back the shed could be moved in the side yard to comply with the Standards.

Findings of Fact

Spencer Dixon made the following MOTION: “I have reviewed the case and all presented testimony and facts and am familiar with the property in question and, therefore, move that the Commission find the following facts concerning HPC case **#H-02-2023**

- 1) That **Lillian Cancer, owner**, appeared before the Commission and sought a Certificate of Appropriateness for the property located at **1711 North Main Street** and designated within the **North Main Street** Local Historic District.
- 2) The proposed project is detailed in the application and staff finding number 1-2 and incorporated herein; the owners did not receive a notification letter until the shed had already been installed, and don’t believe it is possible to move the shed to the rear of the house.”

Larry Richardson seconded the MOTION with all members present VOTING AYE (8-0), via voice vote.

Action

Spencer Dixon continued, “I, therefore, move based on the testimony presented, the adopted Findings of Fact, and the adopted Local Historic Design Standards that the Commission: **Table H-02-2023** to a date certain 02/09/2023 to gather the following additional evidence: HPC has requested more information on the ability to move the shed to the rear yard, behind the back corner of the house.”

Larry Richardson seconded the MOTION with all members present VOTING AYE (8-0), via voice vote.

H-03-2023, 131 East Innes Street; Steiman Dunn Properties, LLC, Owner; Charles Steinman, Applicant; (Parcel ID 105 526)

Request

Replace fabric awnings with aluminum standing seam awnings.

Identification of Property

Emily Vanek made a staff presentation, including COA history. The Hardiman Building was built in 1925/1926, and is considered “Contributing” to the Downtown Local Historic District.

Staff Findings

Staff finds the following element of the project to be incongruous with the character of the Downtown Local Historic District:

- 1) The applicant has requested approval to replace the existing canvas awnings with aluminum standing seam awnings. Standard 4.7.14. says that metal awnings are generally not appropriate unless they are compatible with the historic character of the building. Nearby buildings, including Bankett Station and the Tourism building, have metal awnings, but both were constructed after 2000. The proposed awnings would be installed where the existing are and would be the same size, which meets Standards 4.7.15, 4.7.16, and 4.7.17. The proposed color is Leaf Green.

Staff Recommendation

Based on the preceding findings, staff recommends that the Commission deny H-03-2023 at the Hardiman Building located at 131 East Innes Street, within the Downtown Local Historic District (Parcel ID: 105 526).

Applicant Testimony

Charles Steinman was sworn in. Dr. Steinman would like to replace the awning with a more sturdy and longer lasting material. He listed several buildings in the district that had metal awnings, and remarked that design in the interest of historical character is open for interpretation. He exhibited a large, historical photograph of the building that depicts what may have been a metal awning in the same location.

In response to a question, Dr. Steinman said the new awnings will look the same as the existing ones, and will fit within the same opening.

Public Comment

Sue McHugh spoke in favor of the replacement.

Bryce Evans was sworn in. He brought photos of the awnings they would like to use, and reiterated that they had already been approved for use on a building on Lee Street.

Deliberation

Members generally agreed that the request was clear and appropriate, since there is a trend towards replacing canvas awnings with metal in the interest of continued maintenance. They discussed the possibility of reviewing the Standards regarding replacement of canvas awnings with metal, as they should assume it will happen more regularly.

Findings of Fact

Steve Cobb made the following MOTION, “I have reviewed the case and all presented testimony and facts and am familiar with the property in question and, therefore, move that the Commission find the following facts concerning HPC case #**H-03-2023**

- 1) That **Charles Steinman, owner**, appeared before the Commission and sought a Certificate of Appropriateness for the property located at **131 East Innes Street** and designated within the **Downtown** Local Historic District.
- 2) The proposed project is **not incongruous** as detailed in the application and staff finding number 1 and incorporated herein; Sue McHugh spoke in favor of the request, and Bryce Evans provided documentation of the type of awnings to be used.”

Will James seconded the MOTION with all members present VOTING AYE (8-0), via voice vote.

Action

Steve Cobb continued, “I, therefore, move based on the testimony presented, the adopted Findings of Fact, and the adopted Local Historic Design Standards that the Commission: **Approve H-03-2023** subject to any conditions detailed in the Findings of Fact.”

Will James seconded the MOTION with all members present VOTING (6-2), via voice vote.

H-04-2023, 1427 North Main Street; Bivvy Homes, LLC, Owner; Bobby Robinson, Applicant; (Parcel ID 007 079)

Request

After-the-fact porch renovation, door and roof replacement, install new shutters and paint.

Identification of Property

Emily Vanek made a staff presentation; there is no COA history. The Beaver-Kluttz House was built in 1913, and is considered “Contributing” to the North Main Street Local Historic District.

Staff Findings

Staff finds the following element of the project to be **not incongruous** with the character of the North Main Street Local Historic District:

- 1) The applicant has requested after-the-fact approval for changes made to the front porch. Staff sent a scoping letter to the property owner regarding the changes in October 2022 and a Notice of Violation was sent by Code Enforcement in November 2022. The property owner contacted staff in December 2022 and began the COA process.
- 2) The turned porch posts, which were likely original, were removed and replaced with square columns. Standard 3.5.1. says to retain original porch elements and Standard 3.5.2. says to replace porch elements with those that match the original in material, size, and style. The balustrade that was modified from the original was removed and has not yet been replaced. A simple balustrade has been proposed, which is consistent with the style of the house and meets Standard 3.5.4.
- 3) The asphalt shingle roof was replaced with new asphalt shingles in a color that is pre-approved by HPC. This change meets Standard 3.4.2.
- 4) The front door has been replaced. The material of the new door appears to be fiberglass and the style is more suited for a Craftsman style rather than Victorian style. Standard 3.3.3. says to replace doors with new that match the original in material, style, shape, and pane and panel division.
- 5) The applicant has requested approval to replace the existing stationary shutters with new that are the same size in a shaker style. Standard 3.3.7. says that new shutters should be composed of wood and mounted so that they are operable.
- 6) The applicant has requested approval to install a new porch light. The proposed light is a black metal lantern style exterior light. Standard 4.3.1. says to install exterior lights that are compatible with the structure in design, material, and size.
- 7) The applicant has proposed two color schemes for the house; Scheme A: SW Snowboard for siding and trim, SW Gray's Harbor for exterior doors, and SW Repose Gray for shutters. Scheme B: SW Repose Gray for siding, SW Domino for exterior doors and shutters, and SW Ibis White for trim. Both color schemes meet the color Standard found in Chapter 3.9.

Staff Recommendation

Based on the preceding findings, staff recommends that the Commission approve H-04-2023 at the Beaver-Kluttz House located at 1427 North Main Street, within the North Main Street Local Historic District (Parcel ID: 007 079), subject to the following conditions:

- 1) The porch columns shall be replaced with wooden columns that match the original turned posts in size and design;

- 2) The existing shutters may either be removed or remain and be repainted; replacement stationary shutters shall not be installed;
- 3) The applicant shall return to the Commission with a new front door that is compatible with the Victorian style of the structure.

Applicant Testimony

Bobby Robinson was sworn in. He has already repainted the existing shutters as requested in the staff recommendation. In response to questions, Mr. Robinson said the posts needed to be replaced, as they were deteriorating; the asphalt shingles were on the house when he purchased the property. He displayed the design for the balustrade, and told the HPC that treads will be put on the steps; he will not replace the rails on the steps, as it's not required. In replacing the porch floor, he matched the sturdiest portion, which had decking boards instead of porch tongue and groove boards.

Mr. Robinson purchased the house from a wholesaler, and was not informed of its location within a local historic district.

Public Comment

Sue McHugh spoke in gratitude for the rehabilitation of this part of North Main. She is in favor of the posts, as she doubts the spindles were original to the house. She believes the scale of the material and balustrade are in keeping with the character of the district.

Deliberation

Members were happy that the shutters have already been repainted, in keeping with Standards. Mr. Robinson will need to return for approval of the door. Classification of the house is in question, and when asked, Mr. Robinson said the chimney was capped when the roof was replaced.

Findings of Fact

Steve Cobb made the following MOTION, "I have reviewed the case and all presented testimony and facts and am familiar with the property in question and, therefore, move that the Commission find the following facts concerning HPC case #H-04-2023

- 1) That **Bobby Robinson, agent for Bivvy Homes LLC, owner,** appeared before the Commission and sought a Certificate of Appropriateness for the property located at **1427 North Main Street** and designated within the **North Main Street** Local Historic District.
- 2) The proposed project is **not incongruous** as detailed in the application and staff finding number 1-7 and incorporated herein; Sue McHugh spoke in favor of the application, commenting that the appearance of the columns is appropriate.

- 3) The findings are subject to the 2 remaining conditions recommended by staff and incorporated herein; Mr. Robinson shall return to the Commission with a new wooden front door that is compatible with the architectural style of the structure.”

Larry Richardson seconded the MOTION with all members present VOTING AYE (8-0), via voice vote.

Action

Steve Cobb continued, “I, therefore, move based on the testimony presented, the adopted Findings of Fact, and the adopted Local Historic Design Standards that the Commission: **Approve H-04-2023** subject to any conditions detailed in the Findings of Fact.”

Larry Richardson seconded the MOTION with all members present VOTING AYE (8-0), via voice vote.

H-05-2023, 918 North Main Street; Santiago Homes, LLC, Owner; Abby Gamboa and Rogelio Santiago, Applicants; (Parcel ID 011 135)

Request

After-the-fact changes to approved new construction plans.

Identification of Property

Emily Vanek made a staff presentation, including COA history. The Craftsman style house was built in 2022, and is considered “Non-contributing” to the North Main Street Local Historic District.

Staff Findings

Staff finds the following element of the project to be not incongruous with the character of the North Main Street Local Historic District:

- 1) The applicant has requested after-the-fact approval for changes to approved new construction plans. Staff sent an email to the property owner regarding the changes in December 2022. The property owner responded and began the COA process.
- 2) The gables are clad with half-timbering siding and lap siding while the approved plans specify brick and cementitious shakes. Half-timbering siding is not a common feature of Craftsman houses in the district and is inconsistent with Standard 5.3.5.
- 3) The size and design of the 12” wooden, square columns has been changed from the approved plans. The existing columns are similar to those found on 922 North Main Street, a contributing structure of the same architectural style. Other Craftsman style houses on the block have tapered columns and larger square columns similar to those approved plans. The installed columns are consistent with Standard 5.3.5. The wooden balustrade on the front porch as approved has been installed, but has not yet been painted. A similar balustrade has been installed around the back porch, but is consistent with Standard 5.3.1., but should be painted to meet Standard 5.5.9.

- 4) Other architectural details shown on the approved plans, including dentil blocks and louver gable vents, are missing from the house.

Staff Recommendation

Based on the preceding findings, staff recommends that the Commission approve H-05-2023 at the house located at 918 North Main Street, within the North Main Street Local Historic District (Parcel ID: 011 135), subject to the following conditions:

- 1) Half-timbering style siding shall be replaced with cementitious shakes or lap siding as previously approved to be consistent with Standard 5.3.5.

Applicant Testimony

Rogelio Santiago and Jorge Lopez were sworn in. They explained the deviation from the original, approved, plans as due to materials cost. Venting for the roof has remained, but placed in a different location.

Public Comment

Sue McHugh, who lives two doors down from the house, expressed disappointment that the applicants have not followed the approved design. She objected to them ignoring the previous decision. She also commented that the company had completely taken over the corner of her street, by parking trucks and equipment in front of her house and the neighbor's, as well as leaving litter and construction debris.

Deliberation

Discussion centered on the need to emphasize the importance of following the decision of the HPC for new construction.

Findings of Fact

Will James made the following MOTION, "I have reviewed the case and all presented testimony and facts and am familiar with the property in question and, therefore, move that the Commission find the following facts concerning HPC case #H-05-2023

- 1) That **Abby Gamboa and Rogelio Santiago, agents for Santiago Homes LLC, owner,** appeared before the Commission and sought a Certificate of Appropriateness for the property located at **918 North Main Street** and designated within the **North Main Street** Local Historic District.
- 2) The proposed project is **not incongruous** as detailed in the application and staff finding number 1-4 and incorporated herein; Sue McHugh urged the HPC to adhere to the original, approved, decision.

- 3) The findings are subject to the 1 condition recommended by staff, as well as an additional condition that the rectangular gable vent on the front gable shall be installed as shown on the approved plans; and incorporated herein.”

Spencer Dixon seconded the MOTION with all members present VOTING AYE (8-0), via voice vote.

Action

Will James continued, “I, therefore, move based on the testimony presented, the adopted Findings of Fact, and the adopted Local Historic Design Standards that the Commission: **Approve H-05-2023** subject to any conditions detailed in the Findings of Fact.”

Spencer Dixon seconded the MOTION with all members present VOTING AYE (8-0), via voice vote.

OTHER BUSINESS

Minor Works Report

The Minor Works report was approved.

Approval of Minutes

December HPC minutes, and the December Historic Preservation Incentive Grant meeting minutes were approved as written by all Members present.

Adopt 2023 Schedule

All Member present voted to adopt the 2023 schedule.

2022 Highlights and 2023 Goals

Ms. Vanek presented the National Register map, as well as a list of all casework completed, and grants awarded in 2022.

Suggestions for 2023 goals included a guide for new owners within local historic districts and workshops geared toward historic renovations and maintenance.

ADJOURNMENT

The meeting adjourned at 8:00 p.m. The next meeting will be held on Thursday, February 9, 2023, in City Council Chambers.

Andrew Walker, Chair

Jennifer Pfaff, Secretary