



**Minutes
July 21, 2022**

The City of Salisbury Historic Preservation Commission met in a regular session at 5:30 p.m. on Thursday, July 21, 2022, at 217 South Main Street in the Council Chamber.

Present: Steve Cobb, Ellie Goodnow, Will James, Larry Richardson, Jon Planovsky, Andrew Walker, and Acey Worthy

Absent: Sue McHugh and Marcelo Menza

Staff Present: Graham Corriher, Hannah Jacobson, and Emily Vanek

CALL TO ORDER AND INTRODUCTIONS

The meeting was called to order by the Chairperson, Andrew Walker. Members introduced themselves.

PURPOSE AND PROCEDURE

The purpose and procedure of the meeting was presented by Chairperson, Andrew Walker.

**EX PARTE COMMUNICATION/
CONFLICT OF INTEREST OR APPEARANCE OF CONFLICT**

Steve Cobb reported ex parte communication regarding case H-17-2022. He recused himself from that case.

Emily Vanek was sworn in.

Jon Planovsky made a motion to recuse Steve Cobb from the dais; it was approved by a unanimous voice vote by all members present.

Mr. Planovsky made a motion to accept Ellie Goodnow to the dais. All members present voted AYE. Ms. Goodnow reported no ex parte communication or conflict of interest to any of the cases to be presented tonight.

NEW CERTIFICATES OF APPROPRIATENESS

H-17-2022, 313 West Fisher Street; Brad Garrigues, Owner; (Parcel ID: 010 087)

Request

After-the-fact replacement of front walkway and steps.

Identification of Property

Emily Vanek made a staff presentation, including COA history. The Colonial Revival style house was built ca. 1910-1930, and is considered “Contributing” to the West Square Local Historic District.

Staff Findings

Staff finds the following element of the project to be not incongruous with the character of the West Square Local Historic District:

- 1) The applicant has requested after-the-fact approval for the installation of a brick front walkway. The walkway has a bordered herringbone pattern. Standard 4.2.10 states that brick is an appropriate material for walkways within the historic districts. The former walkway was concrete.
- 2) The applicant has also installed two granite steps from the sidewalk to the brick walkway. Granite is an appropriate material according to Standard 4.2.10.

Staff Recommendations

Based on the preceding findings, staff recommends that the Commission approve H-17-2022 at the house located at 313 West Fisher Street, within the West Square Local Historic District (Parcel ID: 010 087).

Applicant Testimony

Mr. Garrigues was sworn in. He had nothing to add, except that the contractor was under the impression that approval had already been obtained.

Public Comment

None.

Deliberation

Members agreed the project was straightforward, and used appropriate materials.

Findings of Fact

Will James made the following MOTION, “I have reviewed the case and all presented testimony and facts and am familiar with the property in question and, therefore, move that the Commission find the following facts concerning HPC case #**H-17-2022**

- 1) That **Brad Garrigues, Sr., agent for Brad Garrigues, Jr., owner,** appeared before the Commission and sought a Certificate of Appropriateness for the property located at **313 West Fisher Street** and designated within the **West Square** Local Historic District.
- 2) The proposed project is **not incongruous** as detailed in the application and staff finding numbers 1-2 and incorporated herein.”

Larry Richardson seconded the MOTION with all members present VOTING AYE (6-0)

Roll Call: Ellie Goodnow (AYE), Will James (AYE), Jon Planovsky (AYE), Larry Richardson (AYE), Andrew Walker (AYE), Acey Worthy (AYE).

Action

Will James continued, “I, therefore, move based on the testimony presented, the adopted Findings of Fact, and the adopted Local Historic Design Standards that the Commission: **Approve H-17-2022.**”

Larry Richardson seconded the MOTION with all members present VOTING AYE (6-0)

Roll Call: Ellie Goodnow (AYE), Will James (AYE), Jon Planovsky (AYE), Larry Richardson (AYE), Andrew Walker (AYE), Acey Worthy (AYE).

Mr. Planovsky made a motion to receive Steve Cobb back to the dais; it was approved by all members present.

H-31-2022, 329 South Church Street, La Cava Realty, Owner; Gianni Moscardini, Agent/Applicant; (Parcel ID: 101 596)

Request

Installation of patio awning.

Identification of Property

Emily Vanek made a staff presentation, including COA history. The FBC Lodge was built between 1890 and 1910, in the Late Gothic Revival style. It is considered “Contributing” to the West Square Local Historic District.

Staff Findings

Staff finds the following element of the project to be **not incongruous** with the character of the Downtown Local Historic District:

- 1) The applicant has requested approval to install an aluminum patio awning. There was a canvas patio awning previously installed on the building, but was damaged by weather. **Standard 4.7.14** says that aluminum awnings are generally not appropriate, but can be used if they are compatible with the historic character of the building.

Staff Recommendations

Based on the preceding findings, staff recommends that the Commission approve H-31-2022 at the F.B.C. Lodge located at 329 South Church Street, within the Downtown Local Historic District (Parcel ID: 101 596).

Applicant Testimony

Gianni Moscardini was sworn in. Mr. Moscardini would like to use materials that will stand up to the weather, while keeping with the design of the restaurant. The aluminum would be broken up by spaces of clear Plexiglas. In response to questions from the Commission, he explained how the new awning would look from the street, and how he chose the new material. It will work in the same manner as a patio, in keeping heat and weather out.

Public Comment

None.

Deliberation

Members agreed the awning could be considered temporary, as it can be removed; also that its design allows it to be visually unobtrusive, and in keeping with surrounding architecture.

Findings of Fact

Will James made the following MOTION, “I have reviewed the case and all presented testimony and facts and am familiar with the property in question and, therefore, move that the Commission find the following facts concerning HPC case #**H-31-2022**

- 1) That **Gianni Moscardini, agent for La Cava Realty, owner,** appeared before the Commission and sought a Certificate of Appropriateness for the property located at **329 South Church Street** and designated within the **West Square** Local Historic District.
- 2) The proposed project is **not incongruous** as detailed in the application and staff finding number 1 and incorporated herein. The proposed awning would be bronze with Plexiglas instead of solid metal, and located on the north side of the building. It will be the same height and slope of the previous canvas awning/patio cover.”

Jon Planovsky seconded the MOTION with all members present VOTING AYE (7-0)

Roll Call: Steve Cobb (AYE), Ellie Goodnow (AYE), Will James (AYE), Jon Planovsky (AYE), Larry Richardson (AYE), Andrew Walker (AYE), Acey Worthy (AYE).

Action

Will James continued, “I, therefore, move based on the testimony presented, the adopted Findings of Fact, and the adopted Local Historic Design Standards that the Commission: **Approve H-31-2022.**”

Jon Planovsky seconded the MOTION with all members present VOTING AYE (7-0)

Roll Call: Steve Cobb (AYE), Ellie Goodnow (AYE), Will James (AYE), Jon Planovsky (AYE), Larry Richardson (AYE), Andrew Walker (AYE), Acey Worthy (AYE).

H-32-2022, 214 East Innes Street; Innes Street Holdings, LLC, Owner; Bradley Nance, Applicants; (Parcel ID: 010 293)

Request

Replace roof and terra cotta coping with aluminum coping.

Identification of Property

Emily Vanek made a staff presentation that included COA history. The property is a brick commercial building, built in 1949, and considered “Contributing” to the Downtown Local Historic District.

Staff Findings

Staff finds the following element of the project to be incongruous with the character of the Downtown Local Historic District:

- 1) The applicant has requested approval to replace the terra cotta coping with metal coping, while reroofing the building. Standard 3.4.2 says to retain historic roofing material whenever possible.

Staff Recommendations

Based on the preceding findings, staff recommends that the Commission deny H-32-2022 at the commercial building located at 214 East Innes Street, within the Downtown Local Historic District (Parcel ID: 010 293).

Applicant Testimony

Bradley Nance was sworn in. He testified that the roof needs replaced, and will be, however, he was told by his contractor that using terra cotta coping instead of aluminum would subtract 3 to 5 years from the life of the roof. The roof will be very expensive to replace, and he would like the replacement to last longer. He clarified for the Commission that if the terra cotta to remain, the membrane used to repel water would not be sufficient. The new roof would match the roof on the other building. The extent of damage to the roof will be revealed once the current one is removed.

Mr. Nance was asked if he or the contractor considered using a decorative capping once the terra cotta was removed. He had not. Neighboring buildings have the same terra cotta on the side, and have accomplished the replacement of roofs.

Public Comment

None.

Deliberation

Ms. Vanek clarified that roof replacement is not part of the recommendation to deny, as it can be approved at staff level.

The Commission agreed the terra cotta is a very obvious feature, and that they need to decide based on the standards. In reviewing photos from other properties, they assumed it could be repaired using terra cotta. Mr. Nance reiterated that keeping terra cotta would lessen the life of the roof.

Since decisions should be based on facts given during the hearing, information given has been hear-say from the contractor. Members felt they didn't have sufficient information to make an informed decision.

Findings of Fact

Findings of Fact were not necessary, as the case is to be tabled.

Action

Jon Planovsky continued, "I, therefore, move based on the testimony presented, and the adopted Local Historic Design Standards that the Commission: **Table** H-32-2022 to August 11, 2022 to gather the following additional evidence: regarding reuse of existing terra cotta, evidence of the condition of the existing terra cotta, and how neighboring properties accomplished re-roofing using existing terra cotta."

Larry Richardson seconded the MOTION with all members present VOTING AYE (7-0)

Roll Call: Steve Cobb (AYE), Ellie Goodnow (AYE), Will James (AYE), Jon Planovsky (AYE), Larry Richardson (AYE), Andrew Walker (AYE), Acey Worthy (AYE).

H-33-2022, 202 North Main Street; Rowan County Museum, Owner; Alyssa Nelson, Urban Design Planner, Agent (Parcel ID: 103 449)

Request

Installation of permanent sculpture. The sculpture "American Buffalo" is now part of the City of Salisbury's permanent collection. This request is to allow the sculpture to remain at its current location, at 202 North Main Street on the West Council St. side of the property.

Identification of Property

Emily Vanek made a staff presentation including COA history. The Rowan County Museum is classified as "Pivotal" to the Downtown Local Historic District. It is a Greek Revival style building, built in 1855.

Staff Findings

Staff finds the following element of the project to be not incongruous with the character of the Downtown Local Historic District:

- 1) The applicant has requested approval for the permanent installation of the "American Buffalo" sculpture. The sculpture would remain at its current location. Standard 4.6.1 says that artwork should be appropriately scaled for its location and Standard 4.6.6 says that artwork should be constructed of durable materials.

Staff Recommendations

Based on the preceding findings, staff recommends that the Commission approve H-33-2022 at the Rowan Museum located at 202 North Lee Street, within the Downtown Local Historic District (Parcel ID: 103 449).

Applicant Testimony

Alyssa Nelson was sworn in. The artist is local to Salisbury, and the City has purchased the sculpture. It is not permanent to the building, it can be moved in the future, but the museum would like it to stay. She was told by the Rowan Museum that buffalo did reside in the area at one time.

Public Comment

Clyde was sworn in. He believes that City sculptures should not remain in the same place, based on the purpose of the Sculpture Show, therefore, objects to this one remaining at the museum.

Deliberation

The Commission has to decide based solely on standards, and the request meets those. There are many permanent sculptures throughout the City. Members expressed their approval of the piece in question, and had a quick discussion of whether the subject was a buffalo or bison.

Findings of Fact

Jon Planovsky made the following MOTION: “I have reviewed the case and all presented testimony and facts and am familiar with the property in question and, therefore, move that the Commission find the following facts concerning HPC case #H-33-2022

- 1) That **Alyssa Nelson, agent for Rowan Museum, owner,** appeared before the Commission and sought a Certificate of Appropriateness for the property located at **202 North Main Street** and designated within the **Downtown** Local Historic District.
- 2) The proposed project is **not incongruous** as detailed in the application and staff finding number 1 and incorporated herein”

Larry Richardson seconded the MOTION with all members present VOTING AYE (7-0)

Roll Call: Steve Cobb (AYE), Ellie Goodnow (AYE), Will James (AYE), Jon Planovsky (AYE), Larry Richardson (AYE), Andrew Walker (AYE), Acey Worthy (AYE).

Action

Jon Planovsky continued, “I, therefore, move based on the testimony presented, the adopted Findings of Fact, and the adopted Local Historic Design Standards that the Commission: **Approve** H-33-2022.”

Larry Richardson seconded the MOTION with all members present VOTING AYE (7-0)

Roll Call: Steve Cobb (AYE), Ellie Goodnow (AYE), Will James (AYE), Jon Planovsky (AYE), Larry Richardson (AYE), Andrew Walker (AYE), Acey Worthy (AYE).

H-34-2022, 722 South Fulton Street; Kate Fisher, Owner/Applicant; (Parcel ID: (015 048))

Request

Install prefabricated storage shed.

Identification of Property

Emily Vanek made a staff presentation, including COA history. The Bean-Cathey-Gillam Rental House is classified “Contributing” to the West Square Local Historic District. It is a bungalow, built in 1905.

Staff Findings

Staff finds the following element of the project to be not incongruous with the character of the West Square Local Historic District:

- 1) The applicant has requested approval to install an 8’ by 12’ pre-fabricated accessory building. The building has wooden, vertical siding and a gable, black standing seam metal roof, similar to the front porch of the house. Standard 3.6.6 states that new outbuildings should use traditional roof forms, materials, and details compatible with the main building.

Staff Recommendations

Based on the preceding findings, staff recommends that the Commission approve H-34-2022 at the Bean-Cathey-Gillam Rental House located at 722 South Fulton Street, within the West Square Local Historic District (Parcel ID: 015 048).

Applicant Testimony

Kate Fisher was sworn in. She said the shed would now be 10x12 instead of 8x12.

Public Comment

None.

Deliberation

Members reviewed aerial photos. Agreed the request was straightforward and met the standards. A shingle roof was not necessary since the main house does not have a shingle roof.

Findings of Fact

Ellie Goodnow made the following MOTION: “I have reviewed the case and all presented testimony and facts and am familiar with the property in question and, therefore, move that the Commission find the following facts concerning HPC case **#H-34-2022**

- 1) That **Kate Fisher, owner,** appeared before the Commission and sought a Certificate of Appropriateness for the property located at **722 South Fulton** and designated within the **West Square** Local Historic District.
- 2) The proposed project is **not incongruous** as detailed in the application and staff finding number 1 and incorporated herein.”

Larry Richardson seconded the MOTION with all members present VOTING AYE (7-0)

Roll Call: Steve Cobb (AYE), Ellie Goodnow (AYE), Will James (AYE), Jon Planovsky (AYE), Larry Richardson (AYE), Andrew Walker (AYE), Acey Worthy (AYE).

Action

Ellie Goodnow continued, “I, therefore, move based on the testimony presented, the adopted Findings of Fact, and the adopted Local Historic Design Standards that the Commission: **Approve H-34-2022.**”

Larry Richardson seconded the MOTION with all members present VOTING AYE (7-0)

Roll Call: Steve Cobb (AYE), Ellie Goodnow (AYE), Will James (AYE), Jon Planovsky (AYE), Larry Richardson (AYE), Andrew Walker (AYE), Acey Worthy (AYE).

H-35-2022, 419 South Main Street; Lisa Pope, et. al, Owner; Andrew Spaulding, Red Clay Design, Agent (Parcel ID: 010 199)

Request

New construction.

Identification of Property

Emily Vanek made a staff presentation, including the COA history. The City Motor Company buildings were built from 1946-1958 in the Modern style.

Staff Findings

Staff finds the following element of the project to be partially incongruous with the character of the Downtown Local Historic District:

Building Setback and Orientation

- 1) The applicant has requested approval to construct a new three-story apartment building on the northern portion of the property. The building is proposed to be three feet setback from the property line along East Horah Street. Standard 5.1.1 says to keep setbacks consistent with adjacent structures and Standard 5.1.2 says that buildings downtown should be built close to the property line.

Size and Scale

- 2) To the west of the proposed location there is a two-story apartment building and to the east is a one-story house. Across the street are three one to two-story houses. Standard 5.2.5 says that downtown buildings may have flexibility in height if the overall scale of the new building is consistent with adjacent buildings. Standard 5.2.6 says that buildings on the interior part of a block may not be more than one-story taller than adjacent buildings.

- 3) The roof will be 12/12 hipped roof, covered with TPO membrane, with an elevator house, to be brick to match main building. Standard 5.2.4 says to keep roof forms consistent with those in the district.

Design, Rhythm, and Materials

- 4) Standard 5.3.3 says to orient new buildings toward the street, consistent with existing buildings. The entrances to the apartments will be facing towards the parking lots, which will be located in the interior of the block. Standard 5.1.7 says to locate new parking areas in the interior portion of the block.
- 5) The building is proposed to be finished with brick veneer, board and batten vinyl siding, and horizontal lap vinyl siding. Two open stairwells will be located on either side of the building. The railings on the stairwells are proposed to be vinyl. All windows are proposed to be composed of vinyl. Windows on the brick portions of the building will have brick headers.
- 6) Standard 5.3.1 says to use materials that are compatible with the historic district including brick, wood, metal, and stone. Standard 5.3.2 says that contemporary materials can be considered on a case-by-case basis if the materials are used on a limited basis, have the physical properties of the material they are intended to mimic, and are not composed of plastic or vinyl.

Existing Structures

- 7) The applicant is seeking Historic Rehabilitation tax credits for the five existing buildings, and therefore will only require staff-level review once the SHPO approval is submitted.

Staff Recommendations

Based on the preceding findings, staff recommends that the Commission approve H-35-2022 at the City Motor Company located at 419 South Main Street, within the Downtown Local Historic District (Parcel ID: 011 135) subject to the following conditions:

- 1) The siding, exterior doors, windows, and railings shall be composed of wood on the new building. The applicant shall submit the material specifications to staff and receive a Minor Works COA before construction begins.

Applicant Testimony

Lisa Pope and Andrew Spaulding were sworn in. She introduced the people on the team responsible for construction and development. She said they were excited to work on rehabilitation of the current building, and that the new construction would provide additional living for residents of varying ages. She gave the Commission information on the numbers of units for the total project.

Members were shown aerial views of the property line and where the new construction would be placed. They reviewed placement in relation to property line and other buildings.

Andrew Spaulding walked the members through the materials to be used in the new construction. Pending approval of the SHPO National Register designation is not contingent upon this decision.

Public Comment

None.

Deliberation

Ms. Goodnow broached the subject of accepting metal as an approved material as it would fit within the district, and has many beneficial properties for this type of project. Members discussed that it is not currently listed in standards as appropriate, and they must decide based on current ones. Members reviewed elevations and photographs from the request. The project is located within a residential area where many houses are in the process of being restored. The proposed building does not fit within the scale required in standards for buildings being placed within a neighborhood. The location of the proposed building speaks to the commission's hesitation.

Findings of Fact

Steve Cobb made the following MOTION: "I have reviewed the case and all presented testimony and facts and am familiar with the property in question and, therefore, move that the Commission find the following facts concerning HPC case #**H-35-2022**

- 1) That **Andrew Spaulding, Red Clay Design, agent for Lisa Pope et. al., owner,** appeared before the Commission and sought a Certificate of Appropriateness for the property located at **419 South Main Street** and designated within the **Downtown** Local Historic District.
- 2) The proposed project is **incongruous** as detailed in the application and staff finding numbers 1-7 and incorporated herein; in addition, the building does not meet Standard 5.3.4, which specifies requirements for scale in relation to other buildings within the district."

Will James seconded the MOTION with all members present VOTING AYE (7-0)

Roll Call: Steve Cobb (AYE), Ellie Goodnow (AYE), Will James (AYE), Jon Planovsky (AYE), Larry Richardson (AYE), Andrew Walker (AYE), Acey Worthy (AYE).

Action

Steve Cobb continued, "I, therefore, move based on the testimony presented, the adopted Findings of Fact, and the adopted Local Historic Design Standards that the Commission: **Deny** H-35-2022."

Will James seconded the MOTION with all members present VOTING AYE (7-0)

Roll Call: Steve Cobb (AYE), Ellie Goodnow (AYE), Will James (AYE), Jon Planovsky (AYE), Larry Richardson (AYE), Andrew Walker (AYE), Acey Worthy (AYE).

OTHER BUSINESS

Minor Works Report

The Minor Works report was approved.

Approval of Minutes

June 2022 minutes were approved as written by voice vote.

Quasi-Judicial Training

Quasi-judicial training will be conducted by the City Attorney on Thursday, August 25, at 4:00 pm in Council Chambers.

Historic Preservation Incentive (HPI) Grant

The City is now accepting applications for the HPI grant, until September 16, 2022.

ADJOURNMENT

The meeting adjourned at 7:30 p.m. The next meeting will be held on Thursday, August 11, 2022.

Andrew Walker, Chair

Jennifer Pfaff, Secretary