



**Minutes
September 8, 2022**

The City of Salisbury Historic Preservation Commission met in a regular session at 5:33 p.m. on Thursday, September 8, 2022, at 1 Water Street.

Present: Steve Cobb, Ellie Goodnow, Will James, Marcelo Menza, Jon Planovsky, Larry Richardson, Acey Worthy

Absent: Andrew Walker

Staff Present: Victoria Bailiff, Graham Corriher, Hannah Jacobson, Jenni Pfaff, and Emily Vanek

CALL TO ORDER AND INTRODUCTIONS

The meeting was called to order by the Vice-Chair, Ellie Goodnow. Members introduced themselves.

PURPOSE AND PROCEDURE

The purpose and procedure of the meeting was presented by the Vice-Chair, Ellie Goodnow.

**EX PARTE COMMUNICATION/
CONFLICT OF INTEREST OR APPEARANCE OF CONFLICT**

Ellie Goodnow reported communication regarding H-49-2022, and recused herself from this case. Will James is a neighbor and friend to the Applicants for H-43-2022, so recused himself.

Emily Vanek was sworn in.

NEW CERTIFICATES OF APPROPRIATENESS

**H-42-2022, 329 South Church Street; La Cava Realty, Owner; Brian Pfaff, Agent/Applicant;
(Parcel ID: 101 596)**

Request

Construct wooden accessibility ramp.

Identification of Property

Emily Vanek made a staff presentation that included COA history. The F.B.C. Lodge was built 1890-1910 in Late Gothic Revival style, and is considered “Contributing” to the West Square Local Historic District.

Staff Findings

Staff finds the following element of the project to be not incongruous with the character of the West Square Local Historic District:

- 1) The applicant has requested approval to construct a wooden accessibility ramp leading from the rear parking lot to the side patio. The ramp would be constructed of wood, with wooden balustrade to match the front. The ramp will be 15' long and 36" wide. Standard 3.8.3 says to locate new ramps on inconspicuous elevations and Standard 5.5.9 says to paint or stain decks in a natural wood color. The ramp will be stained to match the front ramp.

Staff Recommendation

Based on the preceding findings, staff recommends that the Commission approve H-42-2022 at the F.B.C. Lodge located at 329 South Church Street, within the Downtown Local Historic District (Parcel ID: 101 596).

Applicant Testimony

Brian Pfaff was sworn in. Mr. Pfaff explained that the new ramp will match the existing ramp, and that they may need to include a small concrete pad.

Public Comment

None.

Deliberation

Members agreed the project meets standards.

Findings of Fact

Jon Planovsky made the following MOTION: "I have reviewed the case and all presented testimony and facts and am familiar with the property in question and, therefore, move that the Commission find the following facts concerning HPC case #**H-42-2022**

- 1) That **Brian Pfaff, agent for La Cava Realty, owner,** appeared before the Commission and sought a Certificate of Appropriateness for the property located at **329 South Church Street** and designated within the **West Square** Local Historic District.
- 2) The proposed project is **not incongruous** as detailed in the application and staff finding number 1 and incorporated herein; the application also complies with Standards 3.8.1 and 3.8.2 regarding health and safety."

Will James seconded the MOTION with all members present VOTING AYE (8-0)

Roll Call: Steve Cobb (AYE), Ellie Goodnow (AYE), Will James (AYE), Sue McHugh (AYE), Marcelo Menza (AYE), Jon Planovsky (AYE), Larry Richardson (AYE), Acey Worthy (AYE).

Action

Jon Planovsky continued, “I, therefore, move based on the testimony presented, the adopted Findings of Fact, and the adopted Local Historic Design Standards that the Commission **approve H-42-2022** subject to any conditions detailed in the Findings of Fact.”

Sue McHugh seconded the MOTION with all members present VOTING AYE (8-0)

Roll Call: Steve Cobb (AYE), Ellie Goodnow (AYE), Will James (AYE), Sue McHugh (AYE), Marcelo Menza (AYE), Jon Planovsky (AYE), Larry Richardson (AYE), Acey Worthy (AYE).

Sue McHugh move to recuse Will Smith from case H-43-2022. Jon Planovsky seconded the motion. All present voted in favor.

H-43-2022, 801 South Fulton Street, Laura and Jason Young, Owners; Brian Pfaff, Agent/Applicant; (Parcel ID: 015 111)

Request

Construct detached wooden accessory structure.

Identification of Property

Emily Vanek made a staff presentation that included COA history. The Watson-McKenzie House was built in 1912, in Victorian style, and is considered “Contributing” to the West Square Local Historic District.

Staff Findings

Staff finds the following element of the project to be not incongruous with the character of the West Square Local Historic District:

- 1) The applicant has requested approval to construct a 12’ by 10’ storage shed. The shed will be 8.5’ tall from the ground to the bottom of the roof. Standard 3.6.5 says to keep the proportion of new outbuildings consistent with those found in the district.
- 2) The shed will have beveled, wooden siding, a hipped roof with asphalt shingles, and a solid wooden door. The shed will be painted the same colors as the house. Standard 3.6.6 says to use traditional roof forms, materials, and details that are compatible with the main building when constructing new outbuildings.
- 3) The shed will be located in front of the existing fence near the end of the driveway. Standard 3.6.7 says to locate outbuildings in the rear yard and in a traditional relationship with the main building.

Staff Recommendation

Based on the preceding findings, staff recommends that the Commission approve H-43-2022 at the Watson-McKenzie House located at 801 South Fulton Street, within the West Square Local Historic District (Parcel ID: 015 111).

Applicant Testimony

Jason Young was sworn in. He verified the location of the new building. Mr. Young explained the reason for additional storage by showing Members photos of a smaller existing building that is not sufficient. The new shed will open towards the front of the property, facing Fulton Street. Mr. Pfaff explained that wooden siding will be used, mimicking the siding on the house, and will be smaller than shown on the existing shed.

Public Comment

None.

Deliberation

Members agreed the project clearly meets standards mentioned in Staff Findings, as well as 3.6.7, which says outbuildings will be located in rear yards and in a traditional relationship to the main building.

Findings of Fact

Sue McHugh made the following MOTION: "I have reviewed the case and all presented testimony and facts and am familiar with the property in question and, therefore, move that the Commission find the following facts concerning HPC case #**H-43-2022**

- 1) That **Brian Pfaff, agent and Jason Young, owner,** appeared before the Commission and sought a Certificate of Appropriateness for the property located at **801 South Fulton Street** and designated within the **West Square** Local Historic District.
- 2) The proposed project is **not incongruous** as detailed in the application and staff finding number 1-3 and incorporated herein."

Jon Planovsky seconded the MOTION with all members present VOTING AYE (7-0)

Roll Call: Steve Cobb (AYE), Ellie Goodnow (AYE), Sue McHugh (AYE), Marcelo Menza (AYE), Jon Planovsky (AYE), Larry Richardson (AYE), Acey Worthy (AYE).

Action

Sue McHugh continued, "I, therefore, move based on the testimony presented, the adopted Findings of Fact, and the adopted Local Historic Design Standards that the Commission **approve H-43-2022** subject to any conditions detailed in the Findings of Fact."

Jon Planovsky seconded the MOTION with all members present VOTING AYE (7-0).

Roll Call: Steve Cobb (AYE), Ellie Goodnow (AYE), Sue McHugh (AYE), Marcelo Menza (AYE), Jon Planovsky (AYE), Larry Richardson (AYE), Acey Worthy (AYE).

Sue McHugh moved to reinstate Will James. Marcelo Menza seconded the motion. All present approved.

H-44-2022, 218 West Horah Street; Michael and Phyllis Ehart, Owners/Applicants; (Parcel ID: 010 172)

Request

Install porch railing.

Identification of Property

Emily Vanek made a staff presentation that included COA history. The house was built 1890-1910, in Colonial Revival style, and is considered “Contributing” to the West Square Local Historic District.

Staff Findings

Staff finds the following element of the project to be not incongruous with the character of the West Square Local Historic District:

- 1) The applicant has requested approval to install a wooden porch railing around the front porch. The railing is a simple design, which is consistent with the simple Classical entablature and Doric columns of the porch. Standard 3.5.4 says to replace missing porch details with a design that is compatible with the historic character of the building.

Staff Recommendation

Based on the preceding findings, staff recommends that the Commission approve H-44-2022 at the house located at 218 West Horah Street, within the West Square Local Historic District (Parcel ID: 010 172).

Applicant Testimony

Michael Ehart was sworn in. Mr. Ehart explained the safety issues requiring installation. In response to questions from Members, he verified the illustration shown of the railing, and that it would not be installed on the steps. The railing will be secured to the columns and center.

Public Comment

None.

Deliberation

Members discussed the fact that the double cap on the railing is unique, but matches the scale of the house.

Findings of Fact

Sue McHugh made the following MOTION, “I have reviewed the case and all presented testimony and facts and am familiar with the property in question and, therefore, move that the Commission find the following facts concerning HPC case #**H-44-2022**

- 1) That **Michael Ehart, owner**, appeared before the Commission and sought a Certificate of Appropriateness for the property located at **218 West Horah Street** and designated within the **West Square** Local Historic District.
- 2) The proposed project is **not incongruous** as detailed in the application and staff finding number 1 and incorporated herein; the project also adheres to Standards 3.8.1 and 3.8.2, regarding accessibility and safety requirements.”

Jon Planovsky seconded the MOTION with all members present VOTING AYE (8-0)

Roll Call: Steve Cobb (AYE), Ellie Goodnow (AYE), Will James (AYE), Sue McHugh (AYE), Marcelo Menza (AYE), Jon Planovsky (AYE), Larry Richardson (AYE), Acey Worthy (AYE).

Action

Sue McHugh continued, “I, therefore, move based on the testimony presented, the adopted Findings of Fact, and the adopted Local Historic Design Standards that the Commission **approve H-44-2022** subject to any conditions detailed in the Findings of Fact.”

Jon Planovsky seconded the MOTION with all members present VOTING AYE (8-0)

Roll Call: Steve Cobb (AYE), Ellie Goodnow (AYE), Will James (AYE), Sue McHugh (AYE), Marcelo Menza (AYE), Jon Planovsky (AYE), Larry Richardson (AYE), Acey Worthy (AYE).

WITHDRAWN - H-45-2022, Alley between 111 East Innes Street and 121 East Innes Street; LMY, Inc. and Belle Realty Development Co., Owners; Alyssa Nelson, Agent/Applicant

H-46-2022, 420 East Bank Street; TFL Properties, LLC, Owner; Todd Littleton, Agent/Applicant; (Parcel ID: 019 082)

Request

Replace rear door, remove rear window, and install rear window.

Identification of Property

Emily Vanek made a staff presentation that included COA history. The Cox-Ruffy Rental House was built in 1915, as a Late Victoria Cottage, and is considered “Contributing” to the Brooklyn-South Square Local Historic District.

Staff Findings

Staff finds the following element of the project to be **not incongruous** with the character of the Brooklyn-South Square Local Historic District:

- 1) The applicant has requested approval to replace all windows on the house. The proposed new windows are one over one, double hung windows and will be the same size as the existing windows, with one exception on the rear. One rear window will be reduced in

size from 66” to 42”. Standard 3.3.3 says to replace windows with new that match the material, design, and size of the existing.

- 2) A window at the rear of the house is requested to be removed completely. Standard 3.3.9 says it is not appropriate to fill windows if it would diminish the original design of the structure.
- 3) The rear door is proposed to be replaced with a French door. Standard 3.3.3 says to replace doors with those that match the original in material, size, and design.

Staff Recommendation

Based on the preceding findings, staff recommends that the Commission approve H-46-2022 at the Cox-Ruffy Rental House located at 420 East Bank Street, within the Brooklyn-South Square Local Historic District (Parcel ID: 019 082), subject to the following condition:

- 1) The back door shall not be replaced with the proposed French door.

Applicant Testimony

Todd Littleton was sworn in. He verified that the windows will be wooden, and that siding will match when the center window is removed. The reduced window is over the kitchen sink, and will retain the original molding. The current back door is metal.

In response to questions about the back door, Mr. Littleton said the opening and awning overhead will both be extended. The doors will be full glass, as in the example shown. The back door is not visible from the street.

Public Comment

None.

Deliberation

Finding 1 – Members found the request to be straightforward, adhering to standards.

Finding 2 – Though not original, rhythm of siding would continue between remaining windows.

Finding 3 – There was disagreement on whether the replacement follows standards, however, architectural elements would remain despite the change in proportion. According to the City Attorney, the Board cannot request the metal door be reused as part of this approval.

In response to further questions, Mr. Littleton said the back door is damaged, and other areas around it will need to be repaired.

Members discussed possible mitigating factors to justify the replacement with French doors. Those who objected cited the size and style of the door.

Findings of Fact

This case was divided into two sections, A and B.

Sue McHugh made the following MOTION: “I have reviewed the case and all presented testimony and facts and am familiar with the property in question and, therefore, move that the Commission find the following facts concerning HPC case #**H-46-2022-A**

- 1) That **Todd Littleton, agent for TFL Properties, owner,** appeared before the Commission and sought a Certificate of Appropriateness for the property located at **420 East Bank Street** and designated within the **Brooklyn-South Square** Local Historic District.
- 2) The proposed project that details the changes to the windows in the home is **not incongruous** as detailed in the application and staff finding numbers 1 and 2, and incorporated herein; no additional testimony was provided.”

Jon Planovsky seconded the MOTION with all members present VOTING AYE (8-0)

Roll Call: Steve Cobb (AYE), Ellie Goodnow (AYE), Will James (AYE), Sue McHugh (AYE), Marcelo Menza (AYE), Jon Planovsky (AYE), Larry Richardson (AYE), Acey Worthy (AYE).

Action

Sue McHugh continued, “I, therefore, move based on the testimony presented, the adopted Findings of Fact, and the adopted Local Historic Design Standards that the Commission **approve H-46-2022-A** subject to any conditions detailed in the Findings of Fact.”

Jon Planovsky seconded the MOTION with all members present VOTING AYE (8-0)

Roll Call: Steve Cobb (AYE), Ellie Goodnow (AYE), Will James (AYE), Sue McHugh (AYE), Marcelo Menza (AYE), Jon Planovsky (AYE), Larry Richardson (AYE), Acey Worthy (AYE).

Findings of Fact

Sue McHugh made the following MOTION: “I have reviewed the case and all presented testimony and facts and am familiar with the property in question and, therefore, move that the Commission find the following facts concerning HPC case #**H-46-2022-B**

- 1) That **Todd Littleton, agent for TFL Properties, owner,** appeared before the Commission and sought a Certificate of Appropriateness for the property located at **420 East Bank Street** and designated within the **Brooklyn-South Square** Local Historic District.
- 2) The proposed project that details the changes to the windows in the home is detailed in the application and staff finding number 3, and incorporated herein; the mitigating circumstance is that the door is not visible from the street, and the applicant is retaining some of the original architectural details.”

Jon Planovsky seconded the MOTION with all members present VOTING AYE (8-0)

Roll Call: Steve Cobb (AYE), Ellie Goodnow (AYE), Will James (AYE), Sue McHugh (AYE), Marcelo Menza (AYE), Jon Planovsky (AYE), Larry Richardson (AYE), Acey Worthy (AYE).

Action

Sue McHugh continued, “I, therefore, move based on the testimony presented, the adopted Findings of Fact, and the adopted Local Historic Design Standards that the Commission **approve H-46-2022-B** subject to the condition that the applicant retain the exterior architectural details in the canopy to fit the new door.”

Larry Richardson seconded the MOTION with members present VOTING (4-4)

Roll Call: Steve Cobb (AYE), Ellie Goodnow (AYE), Will James (NO), Sue McHugh (AYE), Marcelo Menza (NO), Jon Planovsky (NO), Larry Richardson (AYE), Acey Worthy (NO).

The motion failed due to lack of a majority.

WITHDRAWN - H-47-2022, 427 South Church Street; Yvonne Wright, Owner/Applicant

H-48-2022, 202 South Fulton Street; Sue Fisher, Owner; Robin Fisher, Applicant; Steve Fisher and Chad Vriesema, Agents; (Parcel ID: 010 039)

Request

Replace concrete walkway with brick.

Identification of Property

Emily Vanek made a staff presentation that included COA history. The Ella Brown Cannon House was built in 1905, in the Southern Colonial Revival style, and is considered “Pivotal” to the West Square Local Historic District.

Staff Findings

Staff finds the following element of the project to be not incongruous with the character of the West Square Local Historic District:

- 1) The applicant has requested approval for the replacement of the front concrete walkway to a brick walkway with a bordered herringbone pattern, including the walkway that leads from the sidewalk to the road. The public sidewalk will remain concrete. Standard 4.2.10 states that brick is an appropriate material for walkways within the historic districts. Brick is found on the foundation of the house.

Staff Recommendation

Based on the preceding findings, staff recommends that the Commission approve H-48-2022 at the Ella Brown Cannon House located at 202 South Fulton Street, within the West Square Local Historic District (Parcel ID: 010 039).

Applicant Testimony

Steve Fisher was sworn in. He had nothing to add to the proceedings.

Public Comment

None.

Deliberation

In response to a question, the Commission was informed that the City approved replacing that portion between the public sidewalk and curb with brick, and that the width is not increasing.

Findings of Fact

Jon Planovsky made the following MOTION: “I have reviewed the case and all presented testimony and facts and am familiar with the property in question and, therefore, move that the Commission find the following facts concerning HPC case #**H-48-2022**

- 1) That **Chad Vriesema, agent for Sue Fisher, owner,** appeared before the Commission and sought a Certificate of Appropriateness for the property located at **202 South Fulton Street** and designated within the **West Square** Local Historic District.
- 2) The proposed project is **not incongruous** as detailed in the application and staff finding number 1 and incorporated herein.”

Larry Richardson seconded the MOTION with all members present VOTING AYE (8-0)

Roll Call: Steve Cobb (AYE), Ellie Goodnow (AYE), Will James (AYE), Sue McHugh (AYE), Marcelo Menza (AYE), Jon Planovsky (AYE), Larry Richardson (AYE), Acey Worthy (AYE).

Action

Jon Planovsky continued, “I, therefore, move based on the testimony presented, the adopted Findings of Fact, and the adopted Local Historic Design Standards that the Commission **approve H-48-2022** subject to any conditions detailed in the Findings of Fact.”

Larry Richardson seconded the MOTION with all members present VOTING AYE (8-0)

Roll Call: Steve Cobb (AYE), Ellie Goodnow (AYE), Will James (AYE), Sue McHugh (AYE), Marcelo Menza (AYE), Jon Planovsky (AYE), Larry Richardson (AYE), Acey Worthy (AYE).

Sue McHugh moved to recuse Ellie Goodnow, Larry Richardson seconded the motion, and all members present voted in favor.

H-49-2022, 419 South Main Street; Lisa Pope, et. Al., Owners; James Maynard, Tonya Haddock, and Stephen Brock, Agents/Applicants; (Parcel ID: 010 199)

Request

Adaptive reuse of five existing buildings and new construction.

Identification of Property

Emily Vanek made a staff presentation that included COA history. The City Motor Company was built 1946-1958, in the Modern style, and is considered “Contributing” to the Downtown Local Historic District.

Staff Findings

City Motor Company Building

- 1) The storefront windows have been approved by HPC to be restored. The stucco has been removed by suggestion of the State Historic Preservation Office for potential listing to the National Register of Historic Places.
- 2) New aluminum storefront windows with horizontal mullions are proposed to replace the existing garage doors. Each window will have 6 lights. These windows have been selected to reflect the appearance of the existing garage doors. There are two garage doors on the front façade and one on the rear elevation. Standard 3.3.10 says to not introduce new windows if it would diminish the original design of the building.
- 3) Existing masonry will be cleaned, repaired, and repointed. This is appropriate according to Standard 3.2.1.
- 4) Existing windows will be repaired and restored and the front doors will be retained and repaired. This is appropriate according to Standard 3.3.1 and 3.3.2.

Sales Office

- 5) New aluminum storefront windows with horizontal mullions are proposed to replace the existing garage doors. Each window will have 5 lights. These windows have been selected to reflect the appearance of the existing garage doors. There are three garage doors on the southwest elevation and one on the northeast elevation. Standard 3.3.10 says to not introduce new windows if it would diminish the original design of the building.
- 6) Existing masonry will be cleaned, repaired, and repointed. This is appropriate according to Standard 3.2.1.
- 7) Existing windows will be repaired and restored and the front doors will be retained and repaired. This is appropriate according to Standard 3.3.1 and 3.3.2.

Quonset Hut

- 8) New windows that match the existing will be cut on each elevation of the Quonset hut. Standard 3.3.10 says to not introduce new windows if it would diminish the original design of the building.
- 9) The corrugated metal walls will be cleaned and restored. This is appropriate according to Standard 3.2.1.

- 10) Existing windows and doors will be retained and repaired. This is appropriate according to Standard 3.3.1 and 3.3.2.

Warehouse Building

- 11) A new aluminum storefront window with horizontal mullions is proposed to replace the existing garage door. The window will have 6 lights. This window have been selected to reflect the appearance of the existing garage door. Standard 3.3.10 says to not introduce new windows if it would diminish the original design of the building.
- 12) Existing masonry will be cleaned, repaired, and repointed. This is appropriate according to Standard 3.2.1.
- 13) Existing windows and doors will be retained and repaired and glass will be reintroduced in areas that do not currently have glass. This is appropriate according to Standard 3.3.1 and 3.3.2.

Maintenance Building

- 14) The exterior of this building will remain the same.

New Construction

Building Setback and Orientation

- 15) The applicant has requested approval to construct a new three-story apartment building on the northern portion of the property. The building is proposed to be ten feet setback from the property line along East Horah Street, consistent with the two adjacent structures. Standard 5.1.1 says to keep setbacks consistent with adjacent structures and Standard 5.1.2 says that buildings downtown should be built close to the property line. Standard 5.1.3 says to make the distance between buildings consistent in new construction.

Size and Scale

- 16) To the west of the proposed location there is a two-story apartment building and to the east is a one-story house. The new building has a maximum height of 34’, the adjacent apartment building has a maximum height of 33’, and the adjacent house has a maximum height of 20’. Across the street are three one to two-story houses. Standard 5.2.5 says that downtown buildings may have flexibility in height if the overall scale of the new building is consistent with adjacent buildings. Standard 5.2.6 says that buildings on the interior part of a block may not be more than one-story taller than adjacent buildings.

Building	Maximum Height
New Construction	34’
111 East Horah Street	33’

125 East Horah Street	20'
Motor City Company Building	28'
Sales Office	16'
Quonset Hut	21'
Warehouse Building	20'

- 17) The ratio of the height and width of the proposed new construction is similar to the City Motor Company Building, which is appropriate according to Standard 5.2.7. Standard 5.2.8 says that building with variations of scale may be appropriate on larger lots in the fringe of districts.
- 18) The roof will be 12/1 hipped roof, covered with TPO membrane, with an elevator house, to be cementitious siding to match main building. Standard 5.2.4 says to keep roof forms consistent with those in the district.

Design, Rhythm, and Materials

- 19) Standard 5.3.3 says to orient new buildings toward the street, consistent with existing buildings. Two entrances to the apartments will face East Horah Street, one to be finished with a canopy, and one entrance will face the interior parking area. Walkways composed of concrete will lead from the stairway entrances to the sidewalk along Horah Street.
- 20) The building is proposed to be finished with brick veneer, board and batten cementitious siding, and horizontal lap cementitious siding. Two open stairwells will be located on the Horah side and one will be located on the parking lot side of the building. The railings on the stairwells are proposed to be aluminum. All windows are proposed to be composed of vinyl. Windows on the brick portions of the building will have brick headers.
- 21) Standard 5.3.1 says to use materials that are compatible with the historic district including brick, wood, metal, and stone. Standard 5.3.2 says that contemporary materials can be considered on a case-by-case basis if the materials are used on a limited basis, have the physical properties of the material they are intended to mimic, and are not composed of plastic or vinyl.

Paving, Parking, and Landscaping

- 22) 88 parking spaces in asphalt and concrete lots are proposed throughout the project. A majority of the parking areas are located within the interior of the block, the exceptions on South Main and South Lee Street. Standard 5.1.7 says to locate new parking areas in the interior portion of the block and Standard 4.2.6 says to create perimeter planting strips around parking lots and to subdivide large expanses of parking with planting areas.
- 23) A new driveway is proposed to link the parking lot behind the new construction to South Lee Street.

24) A dumpster enclosure is proposed to be located between the City Motor Company building and the new building.

25) Existing block retaining walls throughout the site will remain. The existing chain link fences will be removed.

Staff Recommendation

Staff recommends the Commission approve H-49-2022 at the City Motor Company at 419 South Main Street (Parcel ID: 010 199), subject to the following condition:

- 1) Vinyl windows shall not be used on the new construction.

Applicant Testimony

Tonya Haddock, Lisa Pope, and James Maynard were sworn in. Ms. Pope made a presentation that included the history of the site and property. Ms. Haddock explained how the project was to be funded, and that it would be the first residential reuse of an automobile sales establishment.

Mr. Maynard testified that National Register approval is in process, and that the standards are the same as those used by SHPO and the Parks Service. He brought an example of the window to be used; since quality wood is difficult to find, this type is a good bridge between wood and vinyl, being constructed from cellular pvc. They will be operational, and will most likely have screens. Windows used in existing buildings will be metal to match those remaining, and they will try to salvage as many as possible. Replacement garage doors will use the style required by the Parks Service.

The Quonset Hut will have new windows installed and will house apartments.

The chain link fence around property will be removed, and the back fence will remain if it is in good shape. If not, it will be replaced with black chain link fencing.

Responses to questions from the Commission:

- Landscaping will be included on the Horah Street side, as indicated in the plan included in the packet. They will add greenery outside the National Register boundary.
- Existing lighting will remain, with repairs to broken fixtures. Duke Energy will participate in the lighting plan. Existing pole mounted lights will illuminate the parking lot.
- Parks Service and HPC standards differ regarding landscaping in parking lots. The Applicants reduced the paved area of the property.
- The new building will be 20 feet from the property line of one existing house, and 10 feet from another.
- When asked if they considered metal windows for the new building, the Applicants said, no, that would be cost prohibitive.
- Ms. Vanek verified that they would need a COA for zoning, SRU, and engineering review and approval for the new building.

Public Comment

Ray Pope, husband to one of the Applicants, spoke in favor of the project.

Jeremy Tatum, who owns a neighboring house, asked about the percentage of subsidized units. 36 of 64 units will be subsidized for age 62+. He asked the Applicants to verify if the new building will have balconies.

Ed Clement spoke in favor of the project by recounting the significance of the City Motor Company; one of the few landmarks left in the area. He explained that South Main Street is an important entrance to the city, and this project could kickstart additional adaptive reuse.

Deliberation

The Commissioners agreed that using a modern material for windows that is compatible with the original was appropriate. The new building has its own style that compliments existing structures.

They expressed appreciation in the effort and energy of the Applicants in revitalizing the district with creative adaptive reuse. Lighting should be appropriate for a residential area.

Concerns included the height difference between the new building and surrounding houses, as well as its roof pitch. They discussed flipping the new building to tie in better with the flow of the street.

Findings of Fact

Sue McHugh made the following MOTION: "I have reviewed the case and all presented testimony and facts and am familiar with the property in question and, therefore, move that the Commission find the following facts concerning HPC case #H-49-2022

- 1) That **James Maynard and Tonya Haddock, agents, and Lisa Pope, owner** appeared before the Commission and sought a Certificate of Appropriateness for the property located at **419 South Main Street** and designated within the **Downtown** Local Historic District.
- 2) The proposed project is **not incongruous** as detailed in the application and staff finding number 1-25 and incorporated herein; Ray Pope, Jeremy Tatum, and Ed Clement gave public comment in favor of the project. A mitigating factor regarding the new building is that the materials used blend with existing material."

Jon Planovsky seconded the MOTION with all members present VOTING AYE (7-0)

Roll Call: Steve Cobb (AYE), Will James (AYE), Sue McHugh (AYE), Marcelo Menza (AYE), Jon Planovsky (AYE), Larry Richardson (AYE), Acey Worthy (AYE).

Action

Sue McHugh continued, "I, therefore, move based on the testimony presented, the adopted Findings of Fact, and the adopted Local Historic Design Standards that the Commission **approve H-49-2022** subject to any conditions detailed in the Findings of Fact."

Jon Planovsky seconded the MOTION with all members present VOTING AYE (7-0)

Roll Call: Steve Cobb (AYE), Will James (AYE), Sue McHugh (AYE), Marcelo Menza (AYE), Jon Planovsky (AYE), Larry Richardson (AYE), Acey Worthy (AYE).

Jon Planovsky made a motion bring Ellie back to the dais, Sue McHugh seconded the motion. All present approved.

OTHER BUSINESS

Public Hearing – National Register Nomination – 419 South Main Street, City Motor Company

Ms. Vanek made a presentation regarding the nomination, and there was no public comment.

Jon Planovsky made a motion to support the nomination. Steve Cobb seconded the motion, and all members present approved the motion via voice vote.

Minor Works Report

The Minor Works report was approved.

Approval of Minutes

Jon Planovsky moved to approve the August minutes. Larry Richardson seconded the motion, and all present voted in favor.

Sue McHugh made a motion to approve the minutes from the Quasi-Judicial training session. Ellie Goodnow seconded the motion, and all members present approved.

Local Historic Design Standards

Ms. Vanek pointed out an adjustment in the Standards suggested by SHPO.

Sue McHugh moved to approve the Local Historic Design Standards. Jon Planovsky seconded the motion, and all members present voted in favor.

Historic Preservation Incentive Grants

HPI grants are due September 16, 2022. The subcommittee will include Andrew Walker and Sue McHugh.

Blockwork

This year's event will take place on October 22, 2022 at the 500 block of West Council Street. The block is located within the Ellis Street Graded School Local Historic District. So far, projects will require only staff approval.

ADJOURNMENT

The meeting adjourned at 8:18 p.m. The next meeting will be held on Thursday, October 13, 2022.

Ellie Goodnow, Vice-chair

Jennifer Pfaff, Secretary