



**Minutes
March 9, 2023**

The City of Salisbury Historic Preservation Commission met in a regular session at 5:30 p.m. on Thursday, March 9, 2023, in City Council Chambers at 217 South Main Street.

Present: Steve Cobb, Ellie Goodnow, Marcelo Menza, Jon Planovsky, Larry Richardson, Spencer Dixon, Acey Worthy

Absent: Andrew Walker, Will James

Staff Present: Hannah Jacobson, Jenni Pfaff, Emily Vanek

CALL TO ORDER AND INTRODUCTIONS

The meeting was called to order by the Vice-Chair, Ellie Goodnow. Members introduced themselves.

PURPOSE AND PROCEDURE

The purpose and procedure of the meeting was presented by the Vice-Chair, Ellie Goodnow.

**EX PARTE COMMUNICATION/
CONFLICT OF INTEREST OR APPEARANCE OF CONFLICT**

None.

Emily Vanek was sworn in.

NEW CERTIFICATES OF APPROPRIATENESS

**H-11-2023, 225 West Thomas Street, William and Faith Parsons, Owners/Applicants;
(Parcel ID: 015 216)**

Request

Install black powder coated steel center handrail on concrete, front porch steps.

Identification of Property

Emily Vanek made a staff presentation that included COA history. The Cicero W. Smith House was built in 1922, in the Dutch Colonial Revival Style, and is considered "Contributing" to the West Square Local Historic District.

Staff Findings

Staff finds the following element of the project to be not incongruous with the character of the West Square Local Historic District:

- 1) The applicant has requested approval to install a center railing on the front porch steps. The railing would be steel with black powder coating and similar in design to the railing on the concrete steps. The steps are 72” wide so 36” of clearance would be given on either side of the railing. Standard 3.5.4 says to replace missing porch elements with new that are compatible with the historic character of the building in height, proportion, materials, detail, and color.

Staff Recommendation

Staff finds the finding numbered 1 consistent with the Local Historic Design Standards, and therefore recommends that the Commission approve H-11-2023 at the Cicero W. Smith House located at 225 West Thomas Street, within the West Square Local Historic District (Parcel ID: 015 216).

Applicant Testimony

William Parsons was sworn in. His wife is president of the West Square Neighborhood Association, and they need to make the front steps accessible for members when meetings are held at the house.

Public Comment

None.

Deliberation

Members saw no issues with the request. It was noted that the proposal follows two additional standards that relate to accessibility: 3.8.2, and 3.8.5.

Findings of Fact

Jon Planovsky made the following MOTION: “I have reviewed the case and all presented testimony and facts and am familiar with the property in question and, therefore, move that the Commission find the following facts concerning HPC case #H-11-2023

- 1) That **William Parsons, owner**, appeared before the Commission and sought a Certificate of Appropriateness for the property located at **225 West Thomas Street** and designated within the **West Square** Local Historic District.
- 2) The proposed project is **not incongruous** as detailed in the application and staff finding number 1 and incorporated herein; the request also meets standards 3.8.2 and 3.8.5, which address accessibility.”

Acely Worthy seconded the MOTION with all members present VOTING AYE (7-0), via voice vote.

Action

Jon Planovsky continued, “I, therefore, move based on the testimony presented, the adopted Findings of Fact, and the adopted Local Historic Design Standards that the Commission: **Approve H-11-2023** subject to any conditions detailed in the Findings of Fact.”

Acey Worthy seconded the MOTION with all members present VOTING AYE (7-0), via voice vote.

H-12-2023, 119-121 North Main Street; Skadoosh Enterprises, LLC, Owner; Natalie Morgan, Applicant/Agent (Parcel ID: 105 483)

Request

Exterior modifications to building, including adding windows, doors, removing rear roof, and adding balcony.

Identification of Property

Emily Vanek made a staff presentation, including COA history. The commercial building is classified as “Contributing” to the Downtown Local Historic District. It was built in the 1890’s.

Staff Findings

Staff finds the following elements of the project to be not incongruous with the character of the Downtown Local Historic District:

- 1) The applicant has requested approval for several exterior modifications to the building to create four apartments and two commercial spaces.
- 2) Existing windows will be repaired as needed, with no changes to materials or design. Standard 3.3.2. says to repair original windows and their frames rather than replace, if feasible.
- 3) Existing mortar will be repaired with same color mortar as needed. Standard 3.2.1. says to preserve original walls and their materials, textures, and color.
- 4) Three windows on the first floor and seven windows on the second floor are proposed to be added on the south elevation facing Hogan’s Alley. The windows will be wooden, one-over-one, double-hung windows to match windows on the front elevation. The windows will have a strip of red brick as the caps and granite sills. A side door is proposed to be added on the south elevation as well. The door will be wooden, with two panels with transom above. Two back elevation doors will be added. Standard 3.3.11. says to not introduce new windows if it would diminish the historic character of the building.
- 5) The rear door near Hogan’s Alley will be replaced. The proposed door has full view glass with wooden trim and an arched transom to keep the same shape as the existing door. Standard 3.3.3. says to replace doors with new that match the original in size, materials, panel division, and method of operation.
- 6) The roof on the back extension is proposed to be removed to create a courtyard. The brick and granite wall will be retained, but the door will be removed in place for an iron gate. Another iron gate will be installed inside the courtyard. Standard 3.2.1. says to preserve original walls and their materials, textures, and color.

- 7) A rear balcony is proposed for one of the second story apartments. A door will be installed to lead to the balcony. The height of the floor of balcony is 14'4", but may be a few feet lower depending on SHPO approval to remove the mezzanine level. Standard 5.5.1. says to locate balconies as inconspicuously as possible and Standard 5.3.1. says to use traditional materials.
- 8) HVAC utilities will be located on the roof. Standard 3.7.8. says to install mechanical equipment in areas requiring the least amount of alteration to the appearance and materials of the building.
- 9) Exterior lighting is proposed at each exit door as a wall sconce. Standard 4.3.2. says to select unobtrusive fixtures and Standard 4.3.4. says to introduce lighting that provides adequate security, but does not overly emphasize the property.

Staff Recommendation

Staff finds the findings numbered 1-9 consistent with the Local Historic Design Standards, and therefore recommends that the Commission approve H-12-2023 at the commercial building located at 119-121 North Main Street, within the Downtown Local Historic District (Parcel ID: 105 483).

Applicant Testimony

Natalie Morgan was sworn in. Shae answered questions during the Members' deliberation.

Public Comment

Whitney Peckman, a neighbor of the building, was sworn in. She wanted to know where the garbage cans for the building would be housed. Otherwise, she approves of the plan.

Ms. Morgan pointed out on the plans where the cans would be located, and the process for garbage removal. Ms. Peckman indicated that she was satisfied.

Deliberation

Ms. Morgan answered several questions for Members:

- The rear, exterior door will have heavy use, so it makes sense to have a metal frame. Other doors will be made of wood.
- Ms. Morgan clarified on the plan where the balcony will be located, how it will be designed, and the intention to use a masonry wall.
- Caps and lentils will be retained.
- Regarding the addition of windows in the alley, she said it would not be a prominent façade, and that there is evidence of windows there in the past.

Ms. Vanek said that there has been no request for windows from the building on the other side of the alley. Ms. Morgan said that Sanborn maps show windows on the alley side. She added that they are also in the process of getting approval from SHPO. Any changes will be brought back to HPC.

Members discussed the fact that metal is an approved material, and the use of the back door dictates that it should be substantial. They were assured that changes to the storefront will be purely cosmetic.

Findings of Fact

Jon Planovsky made the following MOTION: “I have reviewed the case and all presented testimony and facts and am familiar with the property in question and, therefore, move that the Commission find the following facts concerning HPC case **#H-12-2023**

- 1) That **Natalie Morgan, agent for Skadoosh Enterprises LLC, owner,** appeared before the Commission and sought a Certificate of Appropriateness for the property located at **119-121 North Main Street** and designated within the **Downtown** Local Historic District.
- 2) The proposed project is **not incongruous** as detailed in the application and staff finding number 1-9 and incorporated herein; Whitney Peckman, a neighbor, testified that she was in favor of the request, and was satisfied with the location of garbage cans. Windows in the alley are appropriate, as there is evidence windows existed there previously. Metal is an appropriate material for the back door, as it will need to be sturdy.”

Larry Richardson seconded the MOTION with all members present VOTING AYE (7-0), via voice vote.

Action

Jon Planovsky continued, “I, therefore, move based on the testimony presented, the adopted Findings of Fact, and the adopted Local Historic Design Standards that the Commission: **Approve H-12-2023** subject to any conditions detailed in the Findings of Fact.”

Larry Richardson seconded the MOTION. The motion carried with members present VOTING (7-0), via voice vote.

H-013-2023, 706 North Main Street; J2 Land Investment, LLC, Owner; John Lambert, Applicant/Agent (Parcel ID: 011 110)

Request

Construction of three single family houses.

Identification of Property

Emily Vanek made a staff presentation. The vacant lot is located in the North Main Street Local Historic District.

Staff Findings

(Findings that are inconsistent with the Local Historic Design Standards are bolded)

Staff finds the following element of the project to be incongruous with the character of the North Main Street Local Historic District:

- 1) The applicant has requested approval to construct three single-family houses at 706 North Main Street. The lot will be subdivided into three lots, two facing North Main Street and one facing West Lafayette Street that are 50' wide and 100' deep.

Buildings Setbacks and Orientation

- 2) Standard 5.1.1. says to keep setbacks in new construction consistent with other buildings in the district on the same block. The front setbacks for the proposed and existing structures are below:

	Front Setbacks
Proposed Houses	12'
116 W Lafayette	12'
710 N Main	12'
714 N Main	10'
716 N Main	18'
703 N Main	17'
705 N Main	17'
709 N Main	10'

- 3) **Standard 5.1.3. says to make the distances between buildings consistent with the spacing of other buildings in the district. The average spacing between buildings on this block is 14.8 feet. The distance between the proposed house and 710 North Main Street is 20 feet and between the two proposed houses on North Main Street is 23 feet. The house on West Lafayette Street is proposed to be 11 feet away from 116 West Lafayette Street.**
- 4) Two houses will face North Main Street and one will face West Lafayette Street, to be consistent with other buildings on those blocks. Standard 5.1.4. says that new buildings should face the street to be consistent with other building.

Size and Scale

- 5) The proposed houses are two stories with square proportions. This block of North Main Street has a mix of one- and two-story buildings and a few examples of square proportions at 703 and 727 North Main Street. Standard 5.2.1. says to design the height of new buildings to be consistent with historic buildings on the block and Standard 5.2.2. says to design the proportion of the front elevation to be consistent with contributing structures.
- 6) The proposed windows are one-over-one with a mix of grouped and single windows, both of which can be found on other houses within this block. Standard 5.2.3. says to introduce windows and doors that are compatible with others on contributing structures in the district. The roof styles are a mix of gable and hipped with shed style roofs over the porches. Standard 5.2.4. says to keep the roof shapes consistent with others in the district.

Materials, Design, and Rhythm

- 7) **Proposed materials include cementitious lap (8" exposure with 5/16" thickness) and board and batten siding, wooden windows, fiberglass doors, asphalt shingle roof, brick and stone veneer, aluminum garage door, and cementitious fascia, vented soffit, and bead board for porch ceiling. Standard 5.3.1. says to use materials commonly found in the district in new construction. Standard 5.3.2. says that cementitious siding can be considered in new construction if it is non-grained and has the same thickness and vertical exposure as wooden siding.**
- 8) Colors include grey and alabaster paint colors for siding, white paint for trim, La Cava Meridian Brick, Phantom Shadow Evolve Stone veneer, and black and slate grey asphalt shingles.
- 9) Standard 5.3.4. says to ensure that architectural details of the new construction complements architectural features of contributing structures. Square columns similar to the one found on the proposed houses are found at 715 North Main Street.
- 10) Standard 5.3.6. says to avoid large expanses of blank walls in new construction. The applicant has revised the elevation plans to introduce walls on the previously blank elevations.

Paving, Driveways, and Site Features

- 11) **Front loading garages are not typical features of historic neighborhoods. The only example of a front-loading garage within the North Main Street district is at 116 West Lafayette Street. This property is half within the district and half outside, and the garage is outside the historic district. Standard 4.2.4. says it is not appropriate to locate off-street parking in the front yard.**
- 12) The applicant has revised the site plans to keep the driveways a consistent width as other driveways on the block. Driveways on this block range from 8-10 feet wide. Standard 4.2.2. says to construct new driveways to be the same width as existing driveways within the district and Standard 4.2.11. says that appropriate materials for driveways include concrete, gravel, stone, granite, and brick.
- 13) The applicant has revised the plans to create concrete front walkways that lead from the public sidewalk to the front porch. Standard 4.2.10 says that appropriate materials for walkways are brick, stone, or gravel.
- 14) One light fixture is proposed next to each front door. Standard 4.3.2. says to select unobtrusive fixtures and Standard 4.3.4. says to introduce lighting that provides adequate security, but does not overly emphasize the property.

Staff Recommendation

Staff finds the findings numbered 1, 2, 4, 5, 6, 8, 9, 10, 12, 13, and 14 consistent and findings numbered 3, 7, and 11 inconsistent with the Local Historic Design Standards, and therefore recommends that the commission deny H-13-2023 at the vacant lot located at 706 North Main Street, within the North Main Street Local Historic District (Parcel ID: 011 110).

Applicant Testimony

John Lambert was sworn in. He made himself available for questions, and mentioned that he also owns the house mentioned in Finding 11, at 116 W. Lafayette. HPC recommended a stay of demolition for that house, and he plans to renovate it.

Public Comment

None.

Deliberation

After considerable discussion regarding design elements, elevations, and garage location, the owners decided to withdraw their application.

LOCAL HISTORIC LANDMARK APPLICATIONS

HL-01-2023, 126 East Steele Street; Christine and Gene Goetz, Owners; (Parcel ID 011 398)

Identification of Property

The Mary Steele Scales House was built in 1893, in the Victorian style, and is considered “Pivotal” to the North Main Street Local Historic District.

Local Historic Landmark Criteria

Local Historic Landmark—Property (LHL-P): A building, structure, site, or object, which may or may not be listed on the National Register of Historic Places, and is an outstanding example of a historic resource and is intended to be recognized for its architectural integrity. In addition to documented special significance, these properties maintain the highest degree of integrity and are further recognized for their rarity among properties in Salisbury.

Criteria to Establish a Local Historic Landmark Overlay.

Special significance

- Criterion A: Association with events that have made a significant contribution to the broad patterns of our history.
- Criterion B: Association with the lives of significant persons in our past.
- Criterion C: Embody the distinctive characteristics of a type, period, or method of construction, or that represent the work of a master, or that possess high artistic values, or that represent a significant and distinguishable entity whose components may lack individual distinction.

- Criterion D: Yield or may be likely to yield, information important in history or prehistory.

Integrity

- Location: Where the historic property was constructed or the place where the historic event occurred.
- Design: The combination of elements that create the form, plan, space, structure, and style of a property.
- Setting: The physical environment of a historic property.
- Workmanship: The physical evidence of the crafts of a particular culture or people during any given period in history or prehistory.
- Materials: The physical elements that were combined or deposited during a particular period of time and in a particular pattern or configuration to form a historic property.
- Feeling: The property's expression of the aesthetic or historic sense of a particular period of time.
- Association: The direct link between an important historic event or person and a historic property.

Criteria to Designate as a Local Historic Landmark—Property (LHL-P)

- The proposed property must be found to have special significance for its historical, prehistorical, architectural, or cultural importance in at least one of the special significance criterion, as defined in this section.
- The proposed property must be found to have integrity in all seven aspects.

Staff Findings

Special Significance

The applicant is requesting consideration for Local Historic Landmark for the Mary Steele Scales House under Criteria B and Criteria C. Though the background on Mary Steele Scales is interesting, there is not specific information about her personal impact on Salisbury's history. Therefore, staff recommends applying Criterion C, and not Criterion B, to this application.

Integrity

Staff finds that the Mary Steele Scales House retains integrity in all seven aspects.

- Location – Though local tradition suggests that the house had been rotated from facing Richard Street to its current frontage on East Steele Street, the house remains at the same location as it was constructed. The house sits on a slightly terraced, nearly half acre lot and was once part of the Steeleworth Planation.
- Design - Barber's Design #12 is an example of a Queen Anne style home. The Mary Steele Scales house is missing ornamental details on its roof, siding, and porch commonly found on Queen Anne style homes and that were included in the catalog's design. The roof lines, fenestration patterns, massing, size, and scale of the house match the design. Comparing the roofs of the two, several ornamental details, including finials,

decorated verge boards, and a truss in the front gable, are not present on the house. Decorative siding from the top gable and decorative wainscoted belts are included in Design #12, but are not found on the house. The porch wraps the front and to the right around the house, but only a front veranda exists in Design #12. The layout of the interior of the house has been altered from the design as well, including an additional bathroom on the second floor, a utility room on the first floor, and access from the parlor to the living room with the deletion of a built in bookcase. Barber was known for introducing a customization process, and differences observed between the house and the Catalog design may be results of that process.

- Setting - The original setting of the Mary Steele Scales house was within the Steeleworth Plantation. Lombardy, located at 1010 Richard Street, about two blocks away from the Mary Steele Scales house, was the main building on the plantation. Today, the Mary Steele Scales house sits on a comparatively larger half-acre corner lot within a neighborhood context in the North Main Street neighborhood.
- Workmanship - The detailing of the trims and pediments of the door and windows, porch brackets, and spindlework are typical of Victorian styled homes and are well preserved. The craftsmanship of interior features, including pine floors, wooden wainscoting, bead board ceiling, and the staircase, including millwork, balustrade, and newel posts, have been preserved as well.
- Materials - The Mary Steele Scales house retains its original wooden windows, wooden, clapboard siding, and wooden porch columns, balustrade, and decorative elements. Original wainscoting, pine floors, bead board ceiling, and staircase have been well preserved. Portions of the interior have been updated, but the changes do not affect the materiality of remaining original features.
- Feeling – The house retains many original details, materials, and workmanship that allow the property to express its historic character.
- Association – Despite some disparities from Design #12 to the Mary Steele Scales House, the house is still an identifiable Barber design. It sufficiently retains its association with George Barber.

Designation

The landmark application report proposes the exterior of the house, garage, and picket fence to be designated. The gazebo, which was added in the 1980's, is not proposed to be included in the landmark designation. Staff recommends that the picket fence also be excluded from the designation since it was constructed in 1984 and has no association with George Barber. Since the property is within the North Main Street Local Historic District, the exterior of all buildings and site features will still be subject to the Certificate of Appropriateness process and the Local Historic Design Standards, regardless of landmark designation.

The report proposes the entirety of the interior to be designated. Within the interior architectural description, several features, including pine floors, bead board ceiling, wainscoting, fireplaces, and the staircase, including millwork, balustrade, and newel posts, and built-in shelving in the living room are listed as original features or are documented in the Design #12 plans. Staff recommends that only those features documented as original to the house be included in the landmark designation.

SHPO COMMENT

The report was submitted to the State Historic Preservation Office (SHPO) for their review and comment period, as required by NCGS 160D-946. SHPO does not make a recommendation on the approval of a landmark, but provides advice on if there is sufficient information to make a decision on a landmark application. On December 3, 2021, SHPO's response was received and provided to the applicant.

HPC Pre-application Decision

At the February 10, 2022, HPC meeting, the commission found that the Local Historic Landmark pre-application for the Mary Steele Scales house (Parcel ID: 011 398) may be found to qualify as a Local Historic Landmark.

HPC Action

The HPC shall make a recommendation to City Council whether the property has been found to exhibit special significance and integrity worthy of the Local Historic Landmark – Property designation.

Public Comment

Ellie Goodnow opened the floor for public comment. Owner, Gene Goetz, spoke in favor of his application. Mr. Goetz explained that he had spent a year re-evaluating his application after initial discussions with City staff, and is focusing on Criteria C. He gave an overview of the architect, George Barber, and how progressive he was in designing houses for the public. He was one of the first tradesmen in the country to use mail order catalogs for his products.

Mr. Barber felt that everyone deserved to own an architect-designed house, despite what they could afford. He was known for adjusting his plans to suit the buyer, which was the case for the Mary Steele Scales house. This house was designed for Barber's nephew, and built during the financial panic of 1893. In an effort to save money, therefore, the design was altered by adding an extra room, and removing ornamentation.

Recommendation

Mr. Goetz was asked if the application was weakened or strengthened by the addition of the garage and fence to the application. He replied that he was neutral, but wanted to include the garage so it would be protected.

Ellie Goodnow made a MOTION to recommend the interior and exterior facets of the application for classification as a historic landmark. The recommendation excludes the garage and fence. Spencer Dixon seconded the MOTION, and all Members present voted AYE (7-0).

OTHER BUSINESS

Minor Works Report

The Minor Works report was approved.

Approval of Minutes

February, 2023 HPC minutes were approved as written by all Members present.

Nominating Committee

Ellie Goodnow appointed Steve Cobb, Jon Planovsky, and Larry Richardson to the nominating committee, which will decide a slate in April. She suggested postponing officer elections until May, so the new members can participate after settling into their positions.

Spencer Dixon made a MOTION to hold officer elections in May. Larry Richardson seconded the MOTION and all Members present voted AYE (7-0).

Training

Ms. Vanek will be attending the Commissioner Assistance and Mentoring Program (CAMP), on April 21 in Asheville. Ms. Goodnow and Mr. Planovsky volunteered to accompany her. Other Members interested are welcome to join them.

ADJOURNMENT

The meeting adjourned at 7:16 pm. The next meeting will be held on Thursday, April 13, 2023, in City Council Chambers.

Ellie Goodnow, Vice-Chair

Jennifer Pfaff, Secretary