



**Minutes
May 9, 2024**

The City of Salisbury Historic Preservation Commission met in a regular session at 5:30 p.m. on Thursday, May 9, 2024, in Salisbury City Council Chambers, 217 South Main Street.

Present: Spencer Dixon, Ellie Goodnow, Will James, Michael Kepley, Sue McHugh, Marcelo Menza, Schwartz

Absent: Larry Richardson, Jeff Richen

Staff Present: Graham Corriher, City Attorney; Hannah Jacobson, Planning Director; Jenni Pfaff, Secretary; Emily Vanek, Staff Liaison

CALL TO ORDER AND INTRODUCTIONS

The meeting was called to order by the Chair, Sue McHugh, at 5:30 p.m. Members introduced themselves.

PURPOSE AND PROCEDURE

The purpose and procedure of the meeting was presented by the Chair, Sue McHugh.

**EX PARTE COMMUNICATION/
CONFLICT OF INTEREST OR APPEARANCE OF CONFLICT**

None.

Emily Vanek, and HPC members were sworn in.

NEW CERTIFICATES OF APPROPRIATENESS

COA03-2024-00035, 103 South Main Street; Griffin Brothers, Owner; Lori Konawalik, Applicant (Parcel ID: 105 519)

Request
Awning installation

Identification of Property

Emily Vanek made a staff presentation. The Victory Theater was built in 1920, in the standard commercial style. The building is classified as “Contributing” to the Downtown Local Historic District.

Staff Presentation

Staff finds the following elements of the project to be not incongruous with the character of the Downtown Local Historic District:

- 1) The applicant has requested approval to install a 22’ wide cloth storefront awning. The awning will be installed above the recessed storefront and windows and cover the black flashing from the canopy removal. Standard 4.7.15, says that new awnings should be based on historic documentation or from examples of other building of similar styles. The design of the proposed awning is similar to those found on other commercial buildings located across the street.
- 2) Standard 4.7.16, says to mount awnings in a way that does not obscure or damager historic features. No significant features of the building are located in the location of the proposed awning.

Staff Recommendation

Based on the preceding findings, staff recommends that the commission approve COA03-2024-00035 at the Victory Theater (Parcel ID: 105 519) located at 103 South Main Street within the Downtown Local Historic District.

Applicant Testimony

Lori Konawalik was sworn in. Ms. Konawalik explained that the previous awning was in place for a long time, and that the design and dimensions they have put forward will complement the surrounding businesses.

Public Comment

Pam Coffield was sworn in. She owns a business across the street, and is very excited about what the applicant will offer downtown. She is in favor of the request.

Deliberation

Members felt no need to deliberate, as the applicant had included the previously requested information in their application.

Findings of Fact

Marcelo Menza made a MOTION, “I have reviewed the case and all presented testimony and facts and am familiar with the property in question and, therefore, move that the Commission find the following facts concerning HPC case #**COA03-2024-00035**

- 1) That **Lori Konawalik, agent for Griffin Brothers Properties, LLC, owner,** appeared before the Commission and sought a Certificate of Appropriateness for the property located at **103 South Main Street** and designated within the **Downtown** Historic District.

- 2) The proposed project is **not incongruous** with the special character of the historic district as detailed in the application and staff findings 1-2 and incorporated herein. Pam Coffield, owner of a business across the street from the applicant, spoke in favor of the project.”

Will James seconded the MOTION with all members present VOTING AYE (7-0), via voice vote.

Action

Marcelo Menza made a MOTION, “I, therefore, move based on the testimony presented, the adopted Findings of Fact, and the adopted Local Historic Design Standards that the Commission: **Approve COA03-2024-00035** subject to any conditions detailed in the Findings of Fact.”

Spencer Dixon seconded the MOTION with all members present VOTING AYE (7-0), via voice vote.

COA04-2024-00044, 115 East Steele Street, Camille Yetter, Owner; Clarissa Yetter, Applicant (Parcel ID: 011 177)

Request

Brick paver driveway installation.

Identification of Property

Emily Vanek made a staff presentation, including COA history. The King-Raley-Poole House was built in 1908, in the Late Victorian Cottage style. The house is classified as “Contributing” to the North main Street Local Historic District.

Staff Presentation

Staff finds the following elements of the project to be not incongruous with the character of the North Main Street Local Historic District:

- 1) The applicant has requested approval to install a 9’ x 18’ brick paver driveway with basket weave pattern in the northern-side yard of the property. The driveway will be accessed from East Steele Street and use an existing curb cut. Standard 4.2.2. says to construct new driveways to conform with the spacing, width, configuration, and materials of existing driveways. The proposed driveway is similar to size, location, and material to the driveway located at 117 East Steele Street. Standard 4.2.11. says that brick is an appropriate material for new driveways. There is no rear access available at this property.

Staff Recommendation

Based on the preceding findings, staff recommends that the commission approve COA04-2024-00044 at the King-Raley-Poole House (Parcel ID: 011 177) located at 115 East Steele Street within the North Main Street Local Historic District.

Applicant Testimony

Clarissa Yetter was sworn in. The applicant wants to stay consistent with the historic nature of the neighborhood, and believes the requested design will do that.

She clarified that the material will not be stamped, but real brick.

Public Comment

Dan Waggoner was sworn in. He represents the owner of the house next door. The owner is in favor of the project, but requests that she obtain a survey of her property to ensure the driveway is in the appropriate place, and that she install a retaining wall to prevent water run-off.

Gene Goetz was sworn in. He lives across the street, and is in favor of the project.

Deliberation

Members asked if the neighbor's requests for a survey and retaining wall are under their purview. The City Attorney responded that these decisions are not within the HPC standards.

Findings of Fact

Will James made a MOTION, "I have reviewed the case and all presented testimony and facts and am familiar with the property in question and, therefore, move that the Commission find the following facts concerning HPC case #COA04-2024-00038:

- 1) That **Clarissa Yetter, agent for Camile Yetter, owner**, appeared before the Commission and sought a Certificate of Appropriateness for the property located at **115 East Steele Street** and designated within the **North Main Street** Local Historic District
- 2) The proposed project is **not incongruous** with the special character of the district as detailed in the application and staff finding number 1 and incorporated herein;

Dan Waggoner spoke on behalf of the owner of a neighboring house, and requested a survey and retaining wall. Gene Goetz spoke in favor of the project."

Spencer Dixon seconded the MOTION with all members present VOTING AYE (7-0), via voice vote.

Action

Will James made a MOTION, "I, therefore, move based on the testimony presented, the adopted Findings of Fact, and the adopted Local Historic Design Standards that the Commission: **Approve COA04-2024-00044** subject to any conditions detailed in the Findings of Fact."

Spencer Dixon seconded the MOTION. The motion passed with members present VOTING AYE (7-0), via voice vote.

Will James seconded the MOTION with all members present VOTING AYE (6-0), via voice vote.

LOCAL HISTORIC LANDMARK APPLICATIONS

Emily Vanek reviewed the local historic landmark background and process for members, and answered questions. She explained that landmark designation recommendations are not a quasi-judicial process.

HL-08-2023, 228 West Bank Street, The McKenzie-Grimes House; Randall Cernohorsky and John Causby, Owners; Karen Lilly-Bowyer, Agent

Request

Local Historic Landmark property application, and designation report review.

Identification of Property

Emily Vanek made a staff presentation, including local historic landmark criteria. The McKenzie-Grimes House, built in 1902, in the Queen Anne Free Classic style, is classified as “Contributing” to the West Square Local Historic District and the Salisbury National Register District.

Staff Findings

Special Significance

The applicant has requested consideration for landmark designation under Criteria C as an excellent example of the Queen Anne Free Classic style. Queen Anne Free Classic are a bit of a contrast from the typical Queen Anne style, thought of with delicate spindle work and ornamental detailing, Free Classic have classic columns and thick porch columns, similar to the Colonial Revival style. Like other Victorian styles, Free Classic homes are often asymmetrical with character-defining cornice and eaves details, large front porches, and multi-sashed windows. Free Classic peaked in popularity between 1900-1910. Though the McKenzie-Grimes House is a great example of the Queen Anne Free Classic, it is not the only structure in Salisbury built in this style. Other examples include the Gaskill House (402 S. Ellis Street) and Clement House (302 S. Ellis Street), among others.

The applicant has also requested consideration under Criteria A for the property’s association with the conservation movement in Salisbury. The house was the first property purchased by the Historic Salisbury Foundation using a revolving fund model. The property was purchased by the foundation in 1974.

Integrity

Detailing such as the fluted pilasters between grouped windows, dentil blocks, wreath motifs, diamond-patterned windows, Palladian windows, roof finials, and scaled shingles contribute to the unique character of the house. Though the tower is clad with wooden shingles, it’s later covering of vinyl siding on the main house damage the material integrity of the structure. The house has wooden Tuscan columns and square roofline balustrade above the driveway, which solidify the Free Classic style. The house remains on its original location, with an intact setting within the West Square neighborhood among other residences and compatible street character and landscaping.

The McKenzie-Grimes House remains at its original location on a corner lot at the intersection of West Bank and South Jackson Streets. The house remains within its neighborhood context in the West Square neighborhood, as it was built. Some commercial development and parking lots at the AT&T building and Rowan County Library Headquarters have altered the original setting of the property.

Designation

The entire exterior of the house is included in the proposed designation report. The property is located within the West Square Local Historic District, so the property will be subject to the COA process regardless of landmark status. Modern pool and pool house have been excluded from the proposed designation.

Several interior features, including stained glass windows, built in wooden bookshelves with leaded glass doors, and two fireplace mantels are included in the proposed designation. If the landmark ordinance was adopted, these features would be protected through the COA process.

HPC Pre-Application Action

At their December 14, 2023, meeting, HPC members had a discussion regarding the past replacement of siding, portions of the roof, and windows, and whether these made moot the designation of the property as a landmark. Ultimately, HPC voted 6-1 that the property is likely to retain special significance and all seven aspects of integrity worthy of landmark designation.

SHPO Comment

The applicant prepared a full designation report, which was forwarded to the State Historic Preservation Office for their 30-day review and comment. National Register Coordinator Jeff Smith reviewed the report and offered the following comments:

The LDR provides adequate support for local landmark designation of the McKenzie-Grimes House (RW0296) in Salisbury, Rowan County.

Section IV (the assessment) of the report, enumerates the characteristics and hallmarks of the Free-Classic Queen Anne style allowing for the McKenzie-Grimes's architectural significance to be evaluated within an appropriate architectural context. The assessment provides a solid architectural analysis and illustrating how the house indeed exemplifies the Free Classic Queen Anne style.

Despite the application of aluminum siding, the character-defining woodwork remains visible and the houses adequate historic integrity to convey its architectural appearance. It appears that this c. 1902 Queen Anne has been carefully preserved and sympathetically restored, where appropriate.

I would like to mention the following technical anomalies in the report:

- *Use of the word 'agglutinated' (page 5) in this context is confusing. Would massing not achieve the same result?*
- *Architecturally, a turret is a type of tower. It seems redundant to include both words juxtaposed in the architectural description.*
- *Use of the word spiracle in this context should be reconsidered. Is the domed tower roof vented in some way?*
- *The correct spelling of porta cochere is porte cochere.*
- *Current photos should be captioned as "photo (number)" rather than figure. Figure is typically used in captions for maps, documentary photographs, etc.*

Thank you for the opportunity to comment on this report.

Applicant Testimony

Karen Lilly-Bowyer pointed out the criteria within the application that explain why it should receive landmark status for protection of the interior and exterior features. She quoted the SHPO report and assessments, and addressed the installation of aluminum siding. Ms. Lilly-Bowyer believes the siding has not affected the importance of the house.

Public Comment

Jon Planovsky spoke to the difference between national and local standards; that local standards, which already protect the house, are stronger. Since materials are listed within the criteria, they are an important part of the decision. He is opposed to the request.

Steve Cobb spoke in opposition. He quoted the materials section of the landmark criteria, and said that aluminum and vinyl do not protect the underlying wood siding, providing examples. He agrees the house should be preserved, however, to become a landmark, the original wood siding should be restored.

John Schaffer spoke in favor of the request.

CJ Peters spoke in favor of the request.

David Garling, who lives across the street, spoke in favor of the request. He said that he cannot see the siding, and that the owners have already invested a large amount of money in the house. This type of investment is needed in Salisbury.

Deliberation

Members disagreed on the importance of the aluminum siding in the determination of a landmark, as well as the extent of current protection by its location in a local historic district. The weight of comments provided by SHPO was discussed. If the house falls under disrepair, or the owner doesn't follow the standards, the landmark designation can be removed using the same process as the award.

Motion

Spencer Dixon made a MOTION "I move that the Commission find that the McKenzie-Grimes House at 228 West Bank Street has special significance for its historical, prehistorical,

architectural, or cultural importance in at least one of the special significance criterion and retains all seven aspects of integrity to qualify as a Local Historic Landmark – Property and recommend approval of the designation to City Council.”

Will James seconded the MOTION. The motion carried with all members present VOTING (4-3), via voice vote.

HL-01-2024, 201 South Fulton Street, The Franklin Smith House; John and Pamela Schaffer, Owners; Karen Lilly-Bowyer, Agent

Request

Local Historic Landmark property application, and designation report review.

Identification of Property

Emily Vanek made a staff presentation, including local historic landmark criteria. The Franklin Smith House, built in 1902, in the Spanish Mission style, is classified as “Contributing” to the West Square Local Historic District and the Salisbury National Register District.

Staff Findings

Special Significance

The applicant is requesting landmark designation under Criterion C. The house is an excellent example of the Spanish Mission style by showcasing the distinctive characteristics of the style, including a mission shaped dormer with quatrefoil window, large square porch supports with arched arcade balcony above, red tile roof covering, widely overhanging eaves, and smooth stucco wall covering.

Integrity

The property remains at its original location. The property is located within the West Square neighborhood, which was largely developed from the mid 1800’s to the early 1900’s. The property remains in its original setting within the West Square neighborhood. The property is located on a corner lot near other single-family residences and places of worship. Lots in this part of the neighborhood are typically large with mature landscaping. A wall with detailing that relates back to the house and wooden balconies was constructed to enclose the rear yard in 2015, but does not detract from the setting.

The house retains its Spanish Mission design. The house is asymmetrical with entry porch supported by large, square piers with arched, arcaded balcony above. Dormer mimicking typical Spanish Colonial mission buildings with quatrefoil window, clay tile roof, shaped raftertails, and chimney pots decorate the hipped roof. Stucco embellishments are found around the house on square piers and below the roof line. The precision in stucco sculpting, shaped raftertails, and balconies reflect the skill of the artisans that created the elements of the house. The mission dormer, red clay tiles, chimney pots demonstrate a nearly precise example of the Spanish Mission style. Interior mantel, stairs, and plaster that are proposed for designation are well crafted and preserved. Original stucco appliques on brick are in remarkable condition. Original leaded glass casement windows, clay tile roof, quatrefoil window remain.

The house retains integrity of setting, design, and materials in a way that allows the property to express its historic character. The house retains its association with the Spanish Mission style through the preservation of distinctive characteristics of the style.

Designation

The landmark application report proposes the entire exterior of the building and site to be included in the landmark designation. Since the property is within the West Square Local Historic District, the exterior of all buildings and site features will still be subject to the Certificate of Appropriateness process and the Local Historic Design Standards, regardless of landmark designation.

Interior features to be designated include English Oak woodwork, stained glass features, 18th century marble mantel, oak stairway, restored plaster crown moldings and medallions, and restored gas light fixtures. If designated, these features would be protected through the COA process.

HPC Pre-Application Action

At their January 11, 2024, meeting, the HPC voted unanimously that the property is likely to retain special significance and all seven aspects of integrity worthy of landmark designation.

SHPO Comment

The applicant prepared a full designation report, which was forwarded to the State Historic Preservation Office for their 30-day review. SHPO's role in the landmark application process is to ensure that the designation report provides enough evidence for HPC and City Council to make a decision on a landmark. National Register Coordinator Jeff Smith reviewed the report and offered the following comments:

I've reviewed the Landmark Designation Report for the F.F. Smith House (RW1132) in Salisbury, Rowan County, NC. Although the report needs to be edited, the house certainly qualifies as a local landmark.

Applicant Testimony

Karen Lilly-Bowyer reiterated points within the report as to the significance of the house, as well as major features that illustrate the style.

Public Comment

CJ Peters spoke in favor of the application, saying it is one of the most special homes in Salisbury. He would like all landmarks approved, so special homes such as this one can be protected.

Jon Planovsky held this house as an example of the highest degree of integrity. He is in support of the request.

Deliberation

Members agreed with the integrity of the house, and that it is a good example of the Spanish Mission style. Staff clarified that a landmark designation does not heighten the protection granted from the COA process than any other property within a local historic district.

Motion

Spencer Dixon made a MOTION “I move that the Commission find that the Franklin Smith House at 201 South Fulton Street has special significance for its historical, prehistorical, architectural, or cultural importance in at least one of the special significance criterion and retains all seven aspects of integrity to qualify as a Local Historic Landmark – Property and recommend approval of the designation to City Council.”

Will James seconded the MOTION. The motion carried with all members present VOTING AYE (7-0), via voice vote.

HL-02-2024, 424 Park Avenue, McCubbins-McCanless House; CJ and Robbie Peters, Owners; Pete Prunkl, Agent

Request

Local Historic Landmark property pre-application review.

Identification of Property

Emily Vanek made a staff presentation, including local historic landmark criteria. The McCubbins-McCanless House, built in 1891, in the Queen Anne style, is classified as “Pivotal” to the North Long Street-Park Avenue National Register Historic District. The house is a George Barber design, and is not located in a local historic district.

Staff FindingsDesignation

The landmark application report proposes the entire exterior of the building and site to be included in the landmark designation. If designated, the exterior of the building and site features will still be subject to the Certificate of Appropriateness process and the Local Historic Design Standards.

Interior features to be designated include staircase, wainscoting, baseboards, and trim. If designated, these features would be protected through the COA process.

HPC Pre-Application Decision

The HPC shall determine if the McCubbins-McCanless-Clark House is likely to have special significance for its historical, prehistorical, architectural, or cultural importance in at least one of the special significance criterion and all seven aspects of integrity to qualify as a Local Historic Landmark – Property and accept the Landmark Pre-application.

Applicant Testimony

CJ Peters, the owner, emotionally listed the virtues of the house, as well as the reasons he purchased it. Mr. Peters noted that there are not many houses of this design left in the country, and mentioned the improvements he would like to make.

Mr. Peters responded to questions from the board:

- In addition to the exterior, he is applying for the stairwell, baseboards, and wainscoting in side.
- The original roof was cedar shake.

Public Comment

Gene Goetz spoke in favor of the request, comparing George Barber to Frank Lloyd Wright.

Deliberation

Members discussed the need to be cautious in approving a pre-application due to the amount of preparation involved. This house is not located in a local historic district, so a landmark designation will provide protection.

Motion

Spencer Dixon made a MOTION “I move that the Commission find that the McCubbins-McCanless House at 424 Park Avenue is likely to have special significance for its historical, prehistorical, architectural, or cultural importance in at least one of the special significance criterion and all seven aspects of integrity to qualify as a Local Historic Landmark – Property and accept the Landmark Pre-application.”

Will James seconded the MOTION. The motion carried with all members present VOTING AYE (7-0), via voice vote.

OTHER BUSINESS

Committee Reports

There were no updates on the Landmark, Grants, or Cultural Preservation committees.

Minor Works Report

Spencer Dixon made a motion to approve the report as written, Marcelo Menza seconded the motion; all members present voted AYE via voice vote.

Approval of Minutes

Spencer Dixon made a motion to approve the April, 2024 minutes as written. Marcelo Menza seconded the motion. All members present voted AYE via voice vote.

Election of Chair and Vice-Chair

Sue McHugh made a motion to accept the following slate: Marcelo Menza as Chair, and Spencer Dixon as Vice-Chair. Spencer Dixon seconded the motion, which passed with all members present voting AYE via voice vote.

Chestnut Hill Update

Emily has prepared a report for Chestnut Hill to be added as a national register district. She has sent it to SHPO, and is awaiting a decision.

Historic Preservation Commission

May 9, 2024

Page 12

Summer Interns

Planning and Neighborhoods will have two interns this summer who will be working with Emily on historic preservation projects. Both are studying historic preservation, one at Tulane University, and the other at UNC-Greensboro. Their major project will be the Salisbury National Register Historic District update.

ADJOURNMENT

The meeting adjourned at: 7:14 p.m. The next meeting will be held on Thursday, June 13, 2024, in Council Chambers at Salisbury City Hall, 217 South Main Street.

DocuSigned by:



2DE5109AA726491
Marcelo Menza, Chair

Jennifer Pfaff, Secretary