

Minutes March 10, 2022

The City of Salisbury Historic Preservation Commission met in a regular session at 5:15 p.m. on Thursday, March 10, 2022, at 217 South Main Street in the Council Chamber.

Present: Steve Cobb, Eugene Goetz, Will James, Sue McHugh, Jon Planovsky, Larry Richardson, and Andrew Walker

Absent: Marcelo Menza and Acey Worthy

Staff Present: Graham Corriber, Emily Vanek

CALL TO ORDER AND INTRODUCTIONS

The meeting was called to order by the Chairperson, Andrew Walker. Members introduced themselves.

PURPOSE AND PROCEDURE

The purpose and procedure of the meeting was presented by Chairperson, Andrew Walker.

EX PARTE COMMUNICATION/ CONFLICT OF INTEREST OR APPEARANCE OF CONFLICT

Steve Cobb recused himself from H-06-2022, as he is the applicant.

Emily Vanek was sworn in.

NEW CERTIFICATES OF APPROPRIATENESS

H-01-2022, 115 South Jackson Street; Dyke Messenger, Applicant; Bill Burgin, Agent; Bell Tower Green, LLC, Owner; (Parcel ID: 010 153)

Request

Installation of elevator and introduction of windows on planned addition.

Identification of Property

Emily Vanek made a staff presentation. The Applicant is returning for approval of the above request.

Staff Findings

Staff finds the following elements of the project to be <u>not incongruous</u> with the character of the West Square Local Historic District:

- 1) The applicant has requested approval to install an elevator inside the second wing of the Wrenn House. Though it is inside the building, the elevator would breach the roof, and requires review by the Historic Preservation Commission. <u>Standard 3.4.1</u> says to retain original, historic roof forms. Additions should be placed as inconspicuously as possible on the least character-defining elevation of the building, according to <u>Standard 5.4.1</u>. All four elevations of the building are highly visible within the Bell Tower Green park, but the addition would not be visible from the front, as the roof ridge is aligned with the existing roof (Standard 5.4.3), or direction of traffic on South Jackson Street.
- 2) The portions of the elevator shaft that will be visible from the outside will be finished with wood, clapboard siding and have a standing seam metal shed roof. These materials are consistent with those found on the building and meet <u>Standard 5.3.1</u>. <u>Standard 5.4.8</u> states that roof forms on additions should be compatible with the building.
- 3) <u>Standard 5.4.7</u> states that additions should be designed to be removable. Though the elevator shaft would require removal of roof elements and support, the proposed elevator does not affect exterior walls and therefore may have greater removability than the previous elevator proposal.
- 4) HPC approved an addition at the eastern portion of the property at the February 10, 2022 meeting. A condition of the approval was that the applicant return with a treatment to the southern wall of the addition to meet <u>Standard 5.3.7</u>. The applicant has proposed the introduction of two 6/9 light windows to meet this standard. The parapet walls on both ends of the addition now have five steps instead of three, as well.

Staff Recommendations

Based on the preceding findings, staff recommends that the Commission approve H-01-2022 at the Wrenn House located at 115 South Jackson Street, within the West Square Local Historic District (Parcel ID: 010 153) subject to the following conditions:

- 1) The applicant shall receive, prior to commencement of the work, all other required permits or permissions from governmental agencies;
- 2) Commission staff shall review and approve any revisions or deviations to any other portion of the as-submitted work that qualifies as a Minor Work, prior to commencement of that portion of the project.

Applicant Testimony

Bill Burgin was sworn in.

Mr. Burgin distributed a 3-D rendering to the Commissioners, and mentioned that the steps and windows were not a problem. The new elevator location is an improvement, as it has less visual impact than elevator approved by HPC in 2020, and cannot be seen from any street.

In response to questions from the Commission, Mr. Burgin said that this request for the elevator is a different location than previously approved. This option opened up when the operator decided to move the entrance to the restaurant.

The awning is not shown in the drawing because it can be drawn back when not in use.

Public Comment

None.

Deliberation

The Members complimented Mr. Burgin on working with the HPC to make these changes, and that they are definite improvements. The adjusted request meets the Standards.

Findings of Fact

Sue McHugh made the following MOTION, "I have reviewed the case and all presented testimony and facts and am familiar with the property in question and, therefore, move that the Commission find the following facts concerning HPC case #H-01-2022

- 1) That Bill Burgin, agent for Bell Tower Green, LLC, owner, appeared before the Commission and sought a Certificate of Appropriateness for the property located at 115 South Jackson Street and designated within the West Square Local Historic District.
- 2) The proposed project is not incongruous as detailed in the application and staff finding numbers 1-4 and incorporated herein; no further testimony was provided.
- 3) The findings are subject to the 2 conditions recommended by staff and incorporated herein."

Jon Planovsky seconded the MOTION with all members present VOTING AYE. (7-0)

Roll Call: Steve Cobb (AYE), Gene Goetz (AYE), Will James (AYE), Sue McHugh (AYE), Jon Planovsky (AYE), Larry Richardson (AYE), Andrew Walker (AYE).

Action

Sue McHugh continued, "I, therefore, move based on the testimony presented, the adopted Findings of Fact and the adopted Historic District Design Standards that the Commission: **Approve** H-01-2022 subject to the conditions detailed in the Findings of Fact."

Jon Planovsky seconded the MOTION with all members present VOTING AYE (7-0)

Roll Call: Steve Cobb (AYE), Gene Goetz (AYE), Will James (AYE), Sue McHugh (AYE), Jon Planovsky (AYE), Larry Richardson (AYE), Andrew Walker (AYE).

H-02-2022, 716 South Fulton Street, Daphne Safrit and Ashton Pryor, Owners; C.J. Peters, Applicant/Agent; (Parcel ID: 015 047)

Request

Installation of fencing, expansion of gravel driveway, construction of rear porch steps, and addition of 8' by 12' accessory building.

Identification of Property

Emily Vanek made a staff presentation that included COA history. The Hunter-Purvis House is classified "Contributing" to the West Square Local Historic District. It is a Bungalow style house, built in 1917.

Staff Findings

Staff finds the following elements of the project to be <u>not incongruous</u> with the character of the West Square Local Historic District:

- 1) The applicant has requested approval to expand the existing driveway with gravel for a turnaround area. The existing rear yard fence would be moved to border the new driveway area. The location of the turnaround area is appropriate according to <u>Standard 4.2.4</u>. The material meets <u>Standard 4.2.10</u>, though this standard also states that driveways should be kept to their original size.
- 2) The applicant has requested approval to install an 8' by 12' pre-fabricated accessory building. The building would be set on blocks. The building has wooden, vertical siding and a gambrel, standing seam metal roof. <u>Standard 3.6.6</u> states that new outbuildings should use traditional roof forms, materials, and details compatible with the main building.
- 3) The applicant has requested approval to construct a new set of wooden steps on the rear yard deck. The steps should be stained a natural wood color, according to Standard 5.5.9.

Staff Recommendations

Based on the preceding findings, staff recommends that the Commission approve H-02-2022 at the Hunter-Purvis House located at 716 South Fulton Street, within the West Square Local Historic District (Parcel ID: 015 047) subject to the following conditions:

- 1) The applicant shall receive, prior to commencement of the work, all other required permits or permissions from governmental agencies;
- 2) Commission staff shall review and approve any revisions or deviations to any other portion of the as-submitted work that qualifies as a Minor Work, prior to commencement of that portion of the project.

Applicant Testimony

C.J. Peters was sworn in.

In response to Commissioners' questions, Mr. Peters verified the placements of the fence, steps, and shed.

Public Comment

None.

Deliberation

Commissioners found no issue with the driveway, as it cannot be seen from the street. They found no issues with the fence and back steps. The shed, as designed in the request, does not follow Standard 3.6.6, in that it should complement the style of the original structure. The gambrel roof style is the main issue.

Findings of Fact

Sue McHugh made the following MOTION, "I have reviewed the case and all presented testimony and facts and am familiar with the property in question and, therefore, move that the Commission find the following facts concerning HPC case #H-02-2022:

- 1) That CJ Peters, agent for Daphne Safrit and Ashton Pryor, owners, before the Commission and sought a Certificate of Appropriateness for the property located at 716 South Fulton Street and designated within the West Square Local Historic District.
- 2) The proposed project is <u>not incongruous</u> as detailed in the application and staff finding numbers 1-3 and incorporated herein; however, Commission discussion has shown that item #2 is incongruous with the design standards.
- 3) The findings are subject to the 2 conditions recommended by staff and incorporated herein. The additional condition to be applied is that a different shed design should be submitted for approval because the current design does not meet the Standard 3.6.6 in roof style.

Jon Planovsky seconded the MOTION with all members present VOTING AYE (7-0)

Roll Call: Steve Cobb (AYE), Gene Goetz (AYE), Will James (AYE), Sue McHugh (AYE), Jon Planovsky (AYE), Larry Richardson (AYE), Andrew Walker (AYE).

Action

Sue McHugh continued, "I, therefore, move based on the testimony presented, the adopted Findings of Fact and the adopted Historic District Design Standards that the Commission: **Approve** H-02-2022 subject to the conditions detailed in the Findings of Fact.

Jon Planovsky seconded the MOTION with all members present VOTING AYE (7-0)

Roll Call: Steve Cobb (AYE), Gene Goetz (AYE), Will James (AYE), Sue McHugh (AYE), Jon Planovsky (AYE), Larry Richardson (AYE), Andrew Walker (AYE).

H-03-2022, 428 East Fisher Street; Peggy Bocanegra and Yimmy Gomez, Owners – Withdrawn

H-04-2022, 229 West Bank Street; David Garling and Frank Labagnara, Owners; Steve Beck, Agent/Applicant; (Parcel ID: 010 165)

Request

Installation of side yard fountain.

Identification of Property

Emily Vanek made a staff presentation that included COA history. The Murphy House is classified "Contributing" to the West Square Local Historic District. It is a Greek Revival style house, built in 1853.

Staff Findings

Staff finds the following elements of the project to be <u>not incongruous</u> with the character of the West Square Local Historic District:

1) The applicant has requested approval to install a 12' by 26' fountain in the Jackson Street side yard of the property. The outside of the fountain will be finished with tile, stucco, and stone. The proposed materials meet Standard 5.3.1. A fountain similar to the one located at 301 West Fisher Street will be installed at the center. While Chapter 4.5: Landscaping says that fountains contribute to the character of a site, there are no standards specific to fountain installation. Development Services has recommended a 5 foot setback of the fountain from the side property line.

Staff Recommendations

Based on the preceding findings, staff recommends that the Commission approve H-04-2022 at the Murphy House located at 229 West Bank Street, within the West Square Local Historic District (Parcel ID: 010 165) subject to the following conditions:

- 1) The applicant shall receive, prior to commencement of the work, all other required permits or permissions from governmental agencies;
- 2) Commission staff shall review and approve any revisions or deviations to any other portion of the as-submitted work that qualifies as a Minor Work, prior to commencement of that portion of the project.

Applicant Testimony

Mr. Beck illustrated the location of the fountain using the drawings and photos provided in Staff Findings. It will be situated 8.5 to 9 feet away from the side of the house and property line. While his drawing is to scale, the size of the fountain is relatively small based on the profile of the house. Tile has not been chosen yet, but will be similar to that shown in the inspiration photograph.

Public Comment

None.

Deliberation

No specific standards exist for a fountain, however, dimension, scale, and material match the character of the structure. A short discussion addressed the Italianate style of the fountain with a Greek Revival style house, but that it can be considered art, and temporary. The Applicant was reminded that this house has covenants from Historic Salisbury Foundation, so will need permission from them as well. It was also suggested the owners should address the safety issues that accompany a water structure.

Findings of Fact

Sue McHugh made the following MOTION, "I have reviewed the case and all presented testimony and facts and am familiar with the property in question and, therefore, move that the Commission find the following facts concerning HPC case #H-04-2022

- 1) That Steve Beck, agent for David Garling and Frank Labagnara, owners, appeared before the Commission and sought a Certificate of Appropriateness for the property located at 229 West Bank Street and designated within the West Square Local Historic District.
- 2) The proposed project is **not incongruous** as detailed in the application and staff finding number 1 and incorporated herein; there was no further evidence or testimony provided.
- 3) The findings are subject to the 2 conditions recommended by staff and incorporated herein."

Jon Planovsky seconded the MOTION with all members present VOTING AYE (7-0)

Roll Call: Steve Cobb (AYE), Gene Goetz (AYE), Will James (AYE), Sue McHugh (AYE), Jon Planovsky (AYE), Larry Richardson (AYE), Andrew Walker (AYE).

Action

Sue McHugh continued, "I, therefore, move based on the testimony presented, the adopted Findings of Fact and the adopted Historic District Design Standards that the Commission: **Approve** H-04-2022 subject to the conditions detailed in the Findings of Fact.

Jon Planovsky seconded the MOTION with all members present VOTING AYE (7-0)

Roll Call: Steve Cobb (AYE), Gene Goetz (AYE), Will James (AYE), Sue McHugh (AYE), Jon Planovsky (AYE), Larry Richardson (AYE), Andrew Walker (AYE).

H-05-2022, 1300 North Main Street; Syed Mehdi, Owner; Michael Cotilla, Applicant; (Parcel ID: 007 051)

Request

Demolition

Identification of Property

Emily Vanek made a staff presentation. The Mowery-Talton House is classified "Contributing" to the North Main Local Historic District. It is a Victorian-Vernacular style house, built in 1925.

Staff Findings

Staff finds the following elements of the project to be <u>not incongruous</u> with the character of the North Main Street Local Historic District:

1) The applicant has requested full demolition of the Mowery-Talton House. Michael Cotilla, Code Enforcement Manager, has stated this is because the house has failed to meet

Salisbury's Minimum Housing Standards. HPC has the authority to delay demolition for up to 365 days to allow time for all alternatives to demolition to be considered (<u>Standard 6.5.1</u>). The demolition should follow <u>Standard 6.5.2</u>.

Staff Recommendations

Based on the preceding findings, staff recommends that the Commission approve H-05-2022 at the Mowery-Talton House located at 1300 North Main Street, within the North Main Street Local Historic District (Parcel ID: 007 051) subject to the following conditions:

- 1) HPC shall instate a demolition delay of 365 days;
- 2) The applicant shall receive, prior to commencement of the work, all other required permits or permissions from governmental agencies;
- 3) Commission staff shall review and approve any revisions or deviations to any other portion of the as-submitted work that qualifies as a Minor Work, prior to commencement of that portion of the project.

Applicant Testimony

Michael Cotilla and Syed Mehdi were sworn in.

Officer Cotilla testified to the state of the house and its minimum housing violations. He said the house has been a hotbed for illegal dumping since 2012, and that he's held multiple public hearings and been in communication with the owner.

When Mr. Mehdi purchased the house in 2012, he immediately began work that had to be halted due to non-compliance with HPC standards.

Mr. Mehdi testified that power is now restored to the house. He would like the property to be removed from the North Main Local Historic District due to the cost of restoring the house under HPC standards. He claims that no contractor is willing to work with him.

Mr. Mehdi was informed that the HPC does not have the authority to remove his property from the district. They can only make a recommendation to City Council, who has final approval. Contractors and materials are readily available for his use. The Historic Salisbury Foundation can share these resources with him. If properties are indiscriminately taken out, the entire district is at risk of losing its designation, which would remove grant opportunities for the residents, of which Mr. Mehdi would be eligible.

Public Comment

Leonard Hoyle, 1300 North Main Street, was sworn in. Mr. Hoyle recently purchased the house adjacent from 1300 North Main Street with the understanding that it would be renovated. He understands the Owner's attachment to the house, but would like him to improve the property as soon as possible to avoid continued damage to the house or a fire. The current condition reduces the property value of his own house.

Jennifer Hoyle, 1300 North Main Street, was sworn in. Ms. Hoyle expanded on her husband's lamentation of the condition of the house. They are enjoying Salisbury, and would like the house

to be renovated and kept in good condition. She reiterated Mr. Hoyle's comment that they purchased their home with the expectation that this house would be renovated.

Commissioner Richardson commented that students skipping class at Henderson School have been using this house as a hiding place. Teachers don't want to follow them into the house as it is seen as dangerous. Photos show broken windows and doors left open, leaving the house open to nefarious activity.

Deliberation

Staff reminded the Commissioners that they have the ability to simply extend the demolition up to 365 days. This case is comprised of two issues:

- 1. The house is currently in violation of minimum housing code. Code Enforcement has given the Owner 90 days to bring the house up to code, which would only include plumbing, electricity, protection from the elements by boarding up any holes, and making sure doors and windows are closed and secured.
- 2. The violations the Owner incurred from the HPC for non-approved work are currently null due to the 7 year statute of limitations on zoning violations. While bringing the house up to minimum housing standards, the owner will need to follow HPC standards.

In reviewing demolition cases, the HPC considers the intent of the owner in completing the work needed to restore the house to standards. They expressed confusion as to why the Owner hasn't made any improvements in the 10 years he has owned the house.

A discussion followed regarding the length of time that would be appropriate to bring the house to minimum standards. Once that is done, the Owner could either sell the house, or begin the process to bring it to HPC standards.

Findings of Fact

Sue McHugh made the following MOTION: "I have reviewed the case and all presented testimony and facts and am familiar with the property in question and, therefore, move that the Commission find the following facts concerning HPC case #H-05-2022

- 1) That Michael Cotilla, applicant, and Syed Mehdi, owner, appeared before the Commission and sought a Certificate of Appropriateness for the property located at 1300 North Main Street and designated within the North Main Street Local Historic District.
- 2) The proposed project is <u>not incongruous</u> as detailed in the application and staff finding number 1 and incorporated herein; additional evidence and testimony was provided by Leonard Hoyle, who lives next door to this property at 1304 North Main Street, who requests that the Commission enforce the timeline and the security components of this house, and that the current condition of the property affects the overall property values of the neighborhood. Additional testimony was also provided by Jennifer Hoyle, who says that the property is currently completely not maintained, including grass, trash, and that no work has been done on the property since they have moved here. She requests upkeep, and that the Commission consider that no upkeep is currently happening.

3) The findings are subject to the 3 conditions recommended by staff and incorporated herein. Staff has recommended a delay of 365 days, and this Commission has agreed on a demolition delay of 120 days."

Jon Planovsky seconded the MOTION with all members present VOTING AYE (7-0)

Roll Call: Steve Cobb (AYE), Gene Goetz (AYE), Will James (AYE), Sue McHugh (AYE), Jon Planovsky (AYE), Larry Richardson (AYE), Andrew Walker (AYE).

Action

Sue McHugh continued, "I, therefore, move based on the testimony presented, the adopted Findings of Fact and the adopted Historic District Design Standards that the Commission: **Approve** H-05-2022 subject to the conditions detailed in the Findings of Fact."

Jon Planovsky seconded the MOTION with all members present VOTING AYE (7-0)

Roll Call: Steve Cobb (AYE), Gene Goetz (AYE), Will James (AYE), Sue McHugh (AYE), Jon Planovsky (AYE), Larry Richardson (AYE), Andrew Walker (AYE).

Jon Planovsky made a motion to recuse Steve Cobb from the next case, and it was approved.

H-06-2022, 326 West Bank Street; Steve Cobb and Jennifer Hubbard, Owners/Applicants; (Parcel ID: 007 051)

Request

Replacement of front porch steps.

Identification of Property

Emily Vanek made a staff presentation, and the COA history. The house is classified "Contributing" to the West Square Local Historic District. It is a Pebble-dash Four Square style house, built in in the early 20th century.

Staff Findings

Staff finds the following elements of the project to be <u>not incongruous</u> with the character of the West Square Local Historic District:

1) The applicant has requested approval to replace the concrete steps with granite steps. Several steps have cracks and there is a hole on the second step up. The granite steps will be 7" tall, 12" deep, and 6' wide, same as the existing concrete steps. The material of the proposed steps matches the material of the exposed foundation. Standard 3.5.2 states that replacement material for porch features should match the historic material in composition, dimension, shape, color, pattern, and texture.

Staff Recommendations

Based on the preceding findings, staff recommends that the Commission approve H-06-2022 at the House located at 326 West Bank Street, within the West Square Local Historic District (Parcel ID: 010 092) subject to the following conditions:

- 1) The applicant shall receive, prior to commencement of the work, all other required permits or permissions from governmental agencies;
- 2) Commission staff shall review and approve any revisions or deviations to any other portion of the as-submitted work that qualifies as a Minor Work, prior to commencement of that portion of the project.

Applicant Testimony

Steve Cobb was sworn in.

Mr. Cobb explained that the house has always had concrete steps, since its construction in 1907. He will use reclaimed granite curbing to replace the steps, which will be 6" thick and 16" to 18" deep. Sub-structure will be a masonry frame on either side to suspend the steps.

Public Comment

None.

Deliberation

The Commissioners agreed this was a straightforward case, in which the request met HPC standards.

Findings of Fact

Jon Planovsky made the following MOTION: "I have reviewed the case and all presented testimony and facts and am familiar with the property in question and, therefore, move that the Commission find the following facts concerning HPC case #H-06-2022

- 1) That Steve Cobb, owner, appeared before the Commission and sought a Certificate of Appropriateness for the property located at 326 West Bank Street and designated within the West Square Local Historic District.
- 2) The proposed project is <u>not incongruous</u> as detailed in the application and staff finding number 1 and incorporated herein; no additional evidence or testimony was provided.
- 3) The findings are subject to the 2 conditions recommended by staff and incorporated herein."

Will James seconded the MOTION with all members present VOTING AYE (6-0)

Roll Call: Gene Goetz (AYE), Will James (AYE), Sue McHugh (AYE), Jon Planovsky (AYE), Larry Richardson (AYE), Andrew Walker (AYE).

Action

Jon Planovsky continued, "I, therefore, move based on the testimony presented, the adopted Findings of Fact and the adopted Historic District Design Standards that the Commission: **Approve** H-06-2022 subject to the conditions detailed in the Findings of Fact."

Sue McHugh seconded the MOTION with all members present VOTING AYE (6-0)

Roll Call: Gene Goetz (AYE), Will James (AYE), Sue McHugh (AYE), Jon Planovsky (AYE), Larry Richardson (AYE), Andrew Walker (AYE).

Sue McHugh made a motion to reinstate Steve Cobb to the dais, which was approved.

H-07-2022, 918 North Main Street; Carlos Cardenas, Owner; Abby Gamboa and Rog Santiago, Applicants; (Parcel ID: 011 135)

Request

New house construction.

Identification of Property

Emily Vanek made a staff presentation. The property is a vacant lot.

Staff Findings

Staff finds the following elements of the project to be <u>not incongruous</u> with the character of the North Main Street Local Historic District:

1) The applicant has proposed the construction of a new house on a vacant lot. The previous house, the Grimes-Russel House, was approved for demolition by HPC in July 2020 and demolished in January 2022. The Grimes-Russel House was a late Victorian working cottage.

Setbacks and Orientation

2) <u>Standard 5.1.1</u> states that the setbacks of new construction should be consistent with adjacent buildings and <u>Standard 5.1.3</u> states that the distance between buildings should be consistent in new construction. <u>Standard 5.1.4</u> states that new buildings should be oriented towards the street.

Size and Scale

- 3) Standard 5.2.1 states that the height of new buildings should be compatible with the heights of historic buildings on the block. The proposed house is about 22' tall, two stories, similar to many houses on the block. Standard 5.2.2 states that the proportions of the house should be compatible with other houses on the block. Several houses, including 910 North Main Street, 923 North Main Street, and 905 North Main Street have roughly equal heights and widths, similar to the proposed house.
- 4) <u>Standard 5.2.3</u> states that windows and doors should be compatible in proportion, shape, position, location, pattern, and size with windows and doors of contributing structures within the district. Small square window above the porch, that are on the proposed house, are similar to those found on 926 North Main Street. The front door with sidelights and grouped windows are similar to those found on 925 North Main Street.

5) <u>Standard 5.2.4</u> states that the roof of the proposed building should be consistent with other roof shapes in the district. The proposed roof is a cross-gabled shape with a shed roof over the front porch. The front gables have roof slopes of 12/12, the cross gable has a slope of 12/6, and the porch roof has a slope of 12/4.

Materials, Design Elements, and Rhythm

- 6) The applicant has proposed the use of asphalt shingles, composite shakes, fiber cement siding, brick, wooden dentil blocks, wooden, square columns, wooden balustrade, masonry crawlspace, concrete slab on rear and front porches, fiberglass doors, and vinyl windows. Standard 5.3.1 says to use materials that are commonly found in the district such as stone, brick, wood, and metal. Standard 5.3.2 states that contemporary substitute materials may be considered if they are used on a limited basis. The first floor of the house is finished with brick, while the roof gables are finished with substitute materials.
- 7) <u>Standard 5.3.5</u> states that the architectural details on the new building should complement the architectural details of surrounding, contributing structures. Though the house next door, 914 North Main Street, has tapered columns typical of Craftsmen styled homes, 910 and 907 North Main Street have squared column similar to the proposed columns.
- 8) <u>Standard 5.3.7</u> states that large expanses of blank walls should be avoided in new construction. The back wall does not have any windows or other design elements.

Driveway

9) The applicant has proposed to install a new 18' wide, concrete driveway in the southern yard of the property. Standard 4.2.10 states that new driveway should be consistent in proportion to existing driveways in the district. Existing driveways on that block of North Main Street range from 8-10 feet in width.

Staff Recommendations

Based on the preceding findings, staff recommends that the Commission approve H-07-2022 at the Vacant Lot located at 918 North Main Street, within the North Main Street Local Historic District (Parcel ID: 011 135) subject to the following conditions:

- 1) The applicant shall revise the plans to introduce windows to the blank wall on the rear elevation;
- 2) The applicant shall receive, prior to commencement of the work, all other required permits or permissions from governmental agencies;
- 3) Commission staff shall review and approve any revisions or deviations to any other portion of the as-submitted work that qualifies as a Minor Work, prior to commencement of that portion of the project.

Applicant Testimony

Abby Gamboa and Rog Santiago were sworn in.

In response to questions about the driveway, Ms. Gamboa said that there is no formal agreement for a shared driveway. The majority of the driveway is on the neighbor's property, so they are planning for a private one, and would need an apron added. DOT may need to be consulted for that. Note: Graham Corriber has since confirmed that the existing driveway is a shared driveway between the two properties.

Ms. Gamboa verified that the front door is to be fiberglass, and the plan is to install vinyl windows. The shakes are a composite material and the rest of the siding is cementitious siding. There will be access to a crawl space in the back, and the house will be elevated 3 to 4 feet from the ground. They want to follow HPC standards, but need to make the construction as financially feasible as possible.

Public Comment

None.

Deliberation

In discussing the use of vinyl windows and doors, Commissioners were reminded that a past applicant was required to use wood doors, and decided not to build. Historic districts universally require wooden windows and doors; such requirements preserve the neighborhood quality and value.

They noted the balance of materials to be used, including brick. Standard 4.2.10 states that a driveway should be consistent in size with surrounding houses, calling into question the plan for an 18 foot wide driveway.

Findings of Fact

Will James made the following MOTION: "I have reviewed the case and all presented testimony and facts and am familiar with the property in question and, therefore, move that the Commission find the following facts concerning HPC case #H-07-2022

- 1) That Abby Gamboa and Rog Santiago, owners, appeared before the Commission and sought a Certificate of Appropriateness for the property located at 918 North Main Street and designated within the North Main Street Local Historic District.
- 2) The proposed project is **not incongruous** as detailed in the application and staff finding numbers 1-9 and incorporated herein; however, the proposed vinyl door and windows are incongruous, and the width of the driveway is incongruous.
- 3) The findings are subject to the 3 conditions recommended by staff and incorporated herein. Additionally, all exterior doors shall be composed of wood, all window shall be wooden, true divided light windows, and any new driveway shall not exceed a 12' width.

Sue McHugh seconded the MOTION with all members present VOTING AYE (7-0)

Roll Call: Steve Cobb (AYE), Gene Goetz (AYE), Will James (AYE), Sue McHugh (AYE), Jon Planovsky (AYE), Larry Richardson (AYE), Andrew Walker (AYE).

Action

Will James continued, "I, therefore, move based on the testimony presented, the adopted Findings of Fact and the adopted Historic District Design Standards that the Commission: **Approve** H-07-2022 subject to the conditions detailed in the Findings of Fact.

Sue McHugh seconded the MOTION with members present VOTING AYE (5), NO (2).

Roll Call: Steve Cobb (AYE), Gene Goetz (AYE), Will James (AYE), Sue McHugh (AYE), Jon Planovsky (NO), Larry Richardson (NO), Andrew Walker (AYE).

HISTORIC LANDMARK APPLICATIONS

None.

OTHER BUSINESS

Minor Works Report

CASE#	PROJECT ADDRESS	тм&Р	LOCAL DISTRICT	ZONING	SUMMARY	PROPERTY OWNER	APPLICANT	PRIMARY CONTACT
HS-11-	129 N	105	DWNTWN	DMX	COA TO REPLACE HVAC UNIT. UNIT WILL BE	RICHARD	JACKIE - AIR	SAME
2022	MAIN ST	531			PLACED IN SAME LOCATION. UNIT MUST BE SCREENED FROM VIEW OF STREET	REAMER ET AL	MASTER TECHNOLIGIES	
HS-12-	428 E	013	B-SSQ	HR	COA TO REPAINT SIDING BEHR ALMOND BUTTER,	PEGGY	SAME	SAME
2022	FISHER ST	376			TRIM WHITE	BOCANEGRA		
HS-13-	420 E	019	B-SSQ	HR	COA TO REPLACE GUTTER (CROWN MOLDING TO	TFL	TODD LITTLETON	SAME
2022	BANK ST	082			REMAIN), REPLACE ASHPHALT ROOF (TAN TO OYNX BLACK), REPAINT HOUSE AND FENCE (ALL COLORS TO STAY AS EXISTING)	PROPERTIES LLC		
HS-14- 2022	218 W HORAH	010 172	WSQ	HR	COA TO INSTALL AC UNIT IN REAR YARD BEHIND HOUSE.	MICHAEL AND PHYLLIS	STOUT HEATING AND AIR	MIKE SIDES
2022	ST	1/2			HOUSE.	EHART	AND AIK	SIDES
HS-15- 2022	619 S MAIN ST	015 397	LANDMARK	DMX	COA FOR TAX CREDIT PROJECT, PROJECT NUMBER 43200	SANDRA TOSCANNO	SAME	SAME
HS-16- 2022	627 W LIBERTY ST	006 187	ELLIS	HR	COA TO INSTALL AC UNIT IN REAR YARD BEHIND HOUSE	JONATHAN POST	SAME	SAME
HS-17- 2022	223 W BANK ST	010 166	WSQ	HR	COA TO REMOVE AND REINSTALL TILES ON ROOF ABOVE PORCH. ANY REPLACEMENT TILES MUST BE SAME SHAPE, COLOR, AND TEXTURE AS EXISTING.	SHAWN AND LEAH CAMPION	HAL GIBSON, STATESVILLE ROOFING AND BUILDING RESTORATION	SAME
HS-18- 2022	1122 N MAIN ST	003 268	NMAIN	RMX	COA TO INSTALL HVAC UNIT	BEN ERESE	DILLARD HEATING AND AIR	SAME
H-19- 2022	619 S MAIN ST	015 397	LANDMARK	DMX	COA TO INSTALL FREESTANDING, MONUMENT SIGN. MATERIALS INCLUDE METAL, STONE, AND WOOD	SANDRA TOSCANO	SAME	SAME

Approval of Minutes

February, 2022 minutes were approved as written.

Meeting Time Change

Ms. Vanek asked if the Commissioners would approve changing the starting time to 5:30 pm. They agreed to extend the meeting start time.

Other Business

Steve Cobb expressed his dismay at the situation that led to the demolition of the house at 918 North Main Street. The HPC awarded a 365 delay in the hopes the house would be renovated,

Historic Preservation Commission March 10, 2022

Page 16

however, very little work was done, and the house languished for a full year before the eventual demolition. The Applicants for the new construction will be closing soon on the property. The Commissioners had a discussion regarding a balance of standards for new construction in an attempt to encourage infill development in local historic districts.

Ms. Vanek was asked about the two businesses downtown that currently have tinted windows. She replied that Vibez will be taking theirs down and Backcountry and Beyond is coming to next month's HPC meeting.

ADJOURNMENT

The meeting adjourn	ned at 7:45 p.m.		
Andrew Walker, Ch	 nair		
Jennifer Pfaff, Secre	 etary		