



**Minutes
November 9, 2023**

The City of Salisbury Historic Preservation Commission met in a regular session at 5:30 p.m. on Thursday, November 9, 2023, in the Plaza Second Floor Conference Room, 100 North Main Street.

Present: Steve Cobb, Spencer Dixon, Ellie Goodnow, Will James, Sue McHugh, Marcelo Menza, Jon Planovsky

Absent: Larry Richardson, Jeff Richen

Staff Present: Emily Vanek

CALL TO ORDER AND INTRODUCTIONS

The meeting was called to order by the Chair, Sue McHugh, at 5:30 pm.

PURPOSE AND PROCEDURE

The purpose and procedure of the meeting was presented by the Chair, Sue McHugh.

**EX PARTE COMMUNICATION/
CONFLICT OF INTEREST OR APPEARANCE OF CONFLICT**

None.

Emily Vanek was sworn in.

SALISBURY NATIONAL REGISTER HISTORIC DISTRICT SURVEY

Heather Carpini, Principal Historian/Architectural Historian with S&ME gave an update on the completion of an architectural survey update project for the Salisbury Historic District. The survey was partially funded by a matching grant from the National Park Service. It involved an intensive survey of the existing Salisbury National Register Historic District, as well as exploring the possibility of a potential expansion of the Period of Significance and a possible boundary increase for the district.

NEW CERTIFICATES OF APPROPRIATENESS

There were no new Certificates of Appropriateness.

LOCAL HISTORIC LANDMARK APPLICATIONS

HL-03-2023, 229 West Bank Street; Andrew Murphy House; Frank Labagnara and David Garling, Owners; Karen Lilly-Bowyer, Applicant

Request

Local Historic Landmark property application.

Identification of Property

Emily Vanek made a staff presentation, including local historic landmark criteria. The Andrew Murphy house, built in 1853, in the Greek Revival style, is classified as “Contributing” to the West Square Local Historic District and Salisbury National Register Historic District.

Staff Findings

Special Significance

The applicant is requesting consideration for Local Historic Landmark-Property designation for the Andrew Murphy House under Criteria B and C. The house is proposed for designation from association with Walter “Pete” Murphy and Spencer Murphy. The house is also proposed for designation as an example of the southern Greek revival style.

Integrity

Staff finds that the Andrew Murphy House retains integrity in all seven aspects.

- Location – The house sits where it was originally constructed and has not been moved.
- Design – The house has a two-tier, full-width porch that dominates the front elevation. The symmetrical façade consists of a central double entry door, with eight-pane transom and eight-pane sidelights, flanked by a single six-over-six, double hung, wood sash window on either side; the second story also has a double entry door flanked by six-over-six windows. The casing on each door and window features decorative corner blocks. The deep porch has a wide eave overhang and is supported by single Tuscan columns on each tier, with the first level columns being proportionally larger than the second level. Each side elevation has an exterior brick chimney, and the windows are generally six-over-six, double hung, wood sashes. On the east elevation, a two-bay side projection appears to be an original sleeping porch that has been enclosed, with four-over-two, wood sash windows on the upper story; this sleeping porch wraps around to the rear elevation, where there is a one-story, hip-roofed addition and a shed-roofed section that may be an enclosed rear porch, as well as a third exterior chimney. The corner trim throughout the house, including on the additions, is styled to resemble pilasters and there is a wide frieze trim along the eaves.
- Setting – The house remains on a corner lot within the West Square neighborhood. The house sits on its original parcel. The modern fountain is a mild detraction to an otherwise very intact setting.

- Workmanship – Transom and front door detailing reflect the ability of the craftsman who constructed them. Architectural details in cornices and wooden windows, doors, and reflect the period in which the house was built.
- Materials – Original materials in windows and doors have been well-maintained. Siding, architectural details, columns, and railings all appear original and have been well cared for. Use of vernacular granite in front steps is well preserved.
- Feeling – The house retains many original materials, details, and workmanship that allow the property to convey its historic character on the front elevation. The rear elevation has been modified, but not to an extent to negatively impact the character of the house.
- Association – The house is able to retain its southern Greek revival character. The connection to the productive lives of Pete and Spencer Murphy has not been proven, but based on information collected, seems that the property was the primary residence of five generations of Murphys.

Designation

The landmark application report proposes the entire exterior of the house and site to be included in the landmark designation. Since the property is within the West Square Local Historic District, the exterior of all buildings and site features will still be subject to the Certificate of Appropriateness process and the Local Historic Design Standards, regardless of landmark designation.

No portions of the interior have been proposed for designation. Since the property is located within a Local Historic District, the Landmark designation would create new local review protections to historic features.

HPC Pre-Application Decision

At the August 10, 2023, HPC meeting, HPC determined that the Andrew Murphy House is likely to have special significance and integrity warranting designation as a Local Historic Landmark-Property.

SHPO Comment

The report was submitted to the State Historic Preservation Office (SHPO) for their review and comment period, as required by NCGS 160D-946. SHPO does not make a recommendation on the approval of a landmark, but determines if there is sufficient information to make a decision on a landmark application. On October 11, 2023, SHPO's response was received and provided to the applicant. Jeff Smith, National Register Coordinator's response is below:

The report, as prepared by Ms. Karen Lilly-Bowyer, provides a good architectural summary and it highlights the achievements of two descendants of Andrew Murphy: Walter "Pete" Murphy and Spencer Murphy were remarkable humanitarians who left indelible legacies. Their work for equity and inclusion of the disenfranchised and those otherwise disconnected from society should not go unnoticed.

There is a technical error on page 9 (“... to accommodate a more kitchen space and a sunroom.”) that should be reviewed. Near the end of the first paragraph on page 9 (the paragraph begins at the bottom of page 8), it appears that either the “a” is not needed or a word is missing in the discussion about the kitchen space. I believe that correcting that presumed omission will help to provide greater clarity about the addition.

Based on information presented in the submitted report, the Andrew Murphy House appears to meet the criteria for local landmark designation.

HPC Action

The HPC shall make a recommendation to City Council whether the property has been found to exhibit special significance and integrity worthy of the Local Historic Landmark – Property designation.

Applicant Testimony

Ms. Lilly-Bowyer answered questions from the board.

Motion

Marcelo Menza made a MOTION, “I move that the Commission find that the Andrew Murphy House at 229 West Bank Street has special significance for its historical, prehistorical, architectural, or cultural importance in at least one of the special significance criterion and all seven aspects of integrity to qualify as a Local Historic Landmark – Property and recommend the designation to City Council.”

Spencer Dixon seconded the MOTION. The motion carried with all members present VOTING AYE (7-0), via voice vote.

HL-04-2023, 203 West Bank Street, Murdoch-Wiley House; Carol Palmer, Owner; Karen Lilly-Bowyer, Applicant

Request

Local Historic Landmark property application.

Identification of Property

Emily Vanek made a staff presentation, including local historic landmark criteria. The Murdoch-Wiley house, built in 1869, in the Italianate style, is classified as “Pivotal” to the West Square Local Historic District and the Salisbury National Register District.

Staff Findings

Special Significance

The applicant is requesting consideration for Local Historic Landmark-Property designation for the Murdoch-Wiley House under Criteria C. The house was constructed by William Murdoch who was known as a bridge builder, and constructed Grant’s Creek Viaduct and Yadkin River Railroad Bridge (no longer standing) in Salisbury.

Integrity

Staff finds that the Murdoch-Wiley House retains integrity in all seven aspects.

- Location – The house sits where it was originally constructed and has not been moved.
- Design – The Italianate style is known for elaborate designs in windows, cornices, porches, and doorways. On the house, windows with granite crowns, grouped columns on the porch with matched brackets above, which is repeated above the pilasters on the second floor, and the front doorway with sidelights distinguish the Italianate design. The house also reflects the phasing of Italianate design, from simple detailing, shown in the windows, preferred from 1840's to 1860's, to more High Victorian preferences, shown in the front porch, from 1860's to 1880's. The surviving Belvidere is a rare occurrence in southern Italianate houses.
- Setting – The house remains on a corner lot within the West Square neighborhood. The house sits on its original parcel surrounded by period landscaping elements.
- Workmanship – The house is an example of the common simple hipped roof subtype of the Italianate style, with less common stenciling work, and rare surviving Belvidere. The craftsmanship of the stenciling has been well preserved. Vernacular brick and granite are used throughout the house and prepared by stonemason William Murdoch, who was both builder and first owner of the house.
- Materials – Wooden windows, columns, balustrade, and brackets and vernacular brick and granite have been well preserved.
- Feeling – The house retains many original details, materials, and workmanship that allow the property to express its historic character.
- Association – The house retains its association with its builder, William Murdoch, who was also the first owner. William Murdoch came to North Carolina from Scotland in the 1830's to work on the North Carolina State Capitol and moved to Salisbury in the 1850's. He was known as a bridge builder, and constructed Grant's Creek Viaduct and Yadkin River Railroad Bridge (no longer standing) in Salisbury and built the Murdoch-Wiley House in 1869.

Designation

The landmark application report proposes the entire exterior of the house and site to be included in the landmark designation. Since the property is within the West Square Local Historic District, the exterior of all buildings and site features will still be subject to the Certificate of Appropriateness process and the Local Historic Design Standards, regardless of landmark designation.

No portions of the interior have been proposed for designation. Since the property is located within a Local Historic District, the Landmark designation would create new local review protections to historic features.

HPC Pre-Application Decision

At the September 14, 2023, HPC meeting, HPC determined that the Murdoch-Wiley House is likely to have special significance and integrity warranting designation as a Local Historic Landmark-Property.

SHPO Comment

The report was submitted to the State Historic Preservation Office (SHPO) for their review and comment period, as required by NCGS 160D-946. SHPO does not make a recommendation on the approval of a landmark, but determines if there is sufficient information to make a decision on a landmark application. On October 27, 2023, SHPO's response was received and provided to the applicant. Jeff Smith, National Register Coordinator's response is below:

The Murdoch-Wiley House at 203 W. Bank Street in Salisbury is an excellent example of the Italianate architectural style. The overall massing and architectural finishes and features embody this post-bellum style that could be found in an urban townhouse setting just as easily as in a pastoral rural village setting. The property exhibits a high degree of historic integrity. The property possesses integrity of location, setting, design, workmanship, materials, as well as feeling and association. The house's owner and its builder have an important place in the history of Salisbury's built environment. Given its age, integrity, and local significance, the 1868 Murdoch-Wiley House appears to be a good candidate for local landmark designation.

HPC Action

The HPC shall make a recommendation to City Council whether the property has been found to exhibit special significance and integrity worthy of the Local Historic Landmark – Property designation.

Applicant Testimony

Ms. Lilly-Bowyer answered questions from the board.

Motion

Steve Cobb made a MOTION, "I move that the Commission find that the Murdoch-Wiley House at 203 West Bank Street has special significance for its historical, prehistorical, architectural, or cultural importance in at least one of the special significance criterion and all seven aspects of integrity to qualify as a Local Historic Landmark – Property and recommend the designation to City Council."

Spencer Dixon seconded the MOTION. The motion carried with all members present VOTING AYE (7-0), via voice vote.

HL-07-2023, 121 West Council Street, The Salisbury; Josh Barnhardt, Owner; Karen Lilly-Bowyer, Applicant

Request

Local Historic Landmark property pre-application.

Identification of Property

Emily Vanek made a staff presentation, including local historic landmark criteria. The Salisbury building, built in 1929, in the Art Deco style, is classified as “Contributing” to the Downtown Local Historic District and the Salisbury National Register District.

Staff Findings

Special Significance

The applicant is requesting consideration for Local Historic Landmark-Property designation for The Salisbury building under Criteria C. The building is the only Art Deco commercial structure in the downtown. The building was designed by Marye, Alger, and Vinour, a firm that specialized in Art Deco and Beaux Arts designs. The building was originally the offices of the Southern Bell Telephone and Telegraph Company; in 1984, it was sold by Southern Bell and rented as office suites. In 2021, it was converted into apartments.

Integrity

Staff finds that The Salisbury building retains integrity in all seven aspects.

- Location – The building remains at its original location.
- Setting – The building remains in its original downtown setting between religious and office uses. Though the use of the building has changed from office to residential, the change in use has not significantly altered traffic or surrounding features in a way that would detract from its setting.
- Design – The exterior plan, fenestration pattern, and detailing has remained constant. The front façade is arranged vertically into the three bays with the west bay being more pronounced than the other two bays; the main entrance is on the first floor of the west bay. The west bay steps out slightly on the north and west elevations and is slightly taller than the other two bays creating a tower effect. The main entrance is centered within the west bay and is a set of doors with decorative glass panes on the top two-thirds and wood panels on the bottom third. Above the door is a transom with decorative glass. The door surround angles in, with stone quoining and decorative carved stone embellishments above and flanking the door. The interior lobby was retained when converting to residential units.
- Workmanship – The high quality of the artisan’s labor and skills is evident in the building brick construction and in the well-preserved ornamental detailing. The ornate carved stone continues to carry to the top of the building creating the vertical arrangement.

- Materials – All of the building’s significant materials have been preserved. Exterior yellow and brown brick and Indiana limestone have been restored.
- Feeling – The building expresses all of the aesthetic and historical sense of the Art Deco period. The building retains integrity of setting, design, and workmanship that allows the building to express its historic character.
- Association – The historical purpose of the building was business and the setting still reflects that purpose. However, many apartment buildings were built in the Art Deco style. Therefore, the current function of the building does not distract from the original purpose.

Designation

The landmark application report proposes the entire exterior of the building and site to be included in the landmark designation. Since the property is within the West Square Local Historic District, the exterior of all buildings and site features will still be subject to the Certificate of Appropriateness process and the Local Historic Design Standards, regardless of landmark designation.

Interior features to be designated include original terrazzo floors, decorative radiators covers, and original entryway light fixture. If designated, these features would be protected through the COA process.

HPC Pre-Application Action

The HPC shall find whether the property is likely to exhibit special significance and integrity worthy of a Local Historic Landmark – Property designation.

Applicant Testimony

Ms. Lilly-Bowyer answered questions from the board.

Motion

Will James made a MOTION, “I move that the Commission find that the Salisbury Building at 121 West Council Street is likely to have special significance for its historical, prehistorical, architectural, or cultural importance in at least one of the special significance criterion and all seven aspects of integrity to qualify as a Local Historic Landmark – Property and accept the Landmark Pre-application.”

Jon Planovsky seconded the MOTION. The motion carried with all members present VOTING AYE (7-0), via voice vote.

OTHER BUSINESS

Minor Works Report

Jon Planovsky made a motion to approve the report as written, Spencer Dixon seconded the motion; all members present voted AYE via voice vote.

Approval of Minutes

Spencer Dixon made a motion to approve the October, 2023 minutes as written. Jon Planovsky seconded the motion. All members present voted AYE via voice vote.

ADJOURNMENT

The meeting adjourned at: 8:45 pm. The next meeting will be held on Thursday, December 14, 2023, in City Council Chambers, 217 South Main Street.

DocuSigned by:

Sue McHugh

USAF18807FF74C9...
Sue McHugh, Chair

Jennifer P. Raff

Jennifer P. Raff, Secretary

