



**Minutes
April 13, 2023**

The City of Salisbury Historic Preservation Commission met in a regular session at 5:30 p.m. on Thursday, April 13, 2023, in City Council Chambers at 217 South Main Street.

Present: Steve Cobb, Ellie Goodnow, Will James, Sue McHugh, Marcelo Menza, Jon Planovsky, Jeff Richen, Spencer Dixon

Absent: Larry Richardson

Staff Present: Graham Corriher, Hannah Jacobson, Jenni Pfaff, Emily Vanek

CALL TO ORDER AND INTRODUCTIONS

The meeting was called to order by the Vice-Chair, Ellie Goodnow. Jeff Richen was administered the Oath of Office.

PURPOSE AND PROCEDURE

The purpose and procedure of the meeting was presented by the Vice-Chair, Ellie Goodnow.

**EX PARTE COMMUNICATION/
CONFLICT OF INTEREST OR APPEARANCE OF CONFLICT**

None.

Emily Vanek was sworn in.

NEW CERTIFICATES OF APPROPRIATENESS

H-14-2023, 209 South Ellis Street, Stephanie and Robert Potter, Owners; Edward Norvell, Applicant/Agent (Parcel ID: 010 033)

Request

Install two PTAC units on second story and replace side door.

Identification of Property

Emily Vanek made a staff presentation that included COA history. The house was built in 1880, in the Victorian Style, and is considered "Contributing" to the West Square Local Historic District.

Staff Findings

Staff finds the following element of the project to be not incongruous with the character of the West Square Local Historic District:

- 1) The applicant has requested after-the-fact approval for the installation of two PTAC units. The units replaced two windows units that were previously installed, which had similar visual impacts as the current PTAC units. There is one unit on the south side elevation and one on the north side elevation. The south unit is located near the rear of the house and the north unit in front of the dormer window. Standard 3.7.8. says to install HVAC units that require the least amount of alteration to the appearance and material of the building.
- 2) The units are installed on non-original portions of the house. The siding that clads the addition is wood, but has a different profile as the siding on the original portion of the house. Standard 3.2.1. says to retain original walls, including their materials, form, pattern, color, texture, and details. Standard 3.2.6. says to locate new mechanical equipment through historic walls on non-character defining areas. The attic addition was constructed in such a way to not leave room between the walls and ceiling and the roof for interior ventilation systems, according to the applicant.
- 3) The applicant has also requested approval to replace the 6-panel side door with a wooden 5-panel Dutch door on the northern side elevation. Standard 3.3.3. says to replace doors when necessary with new that match the original in size, panel division, and material.

Staff Recommendation

Based on the preceding findings, staff recommends that the Commission approve H-14-2023 at the house located at 209 South Ellis Street, within the West Square Local Historic District (Parcel ID: 010 033).

Applicant Testimony

Edward Norvell was sworn in. Mr. Norvell is the previous owner, and testified that he applied for a COA to install the PTAC unit to replace a window unit. He was under the impression that the COA was approved, so the unit was installed.

Alvin Brown, of the heating and air company, was sworn in. Mr. Brown testified that this was the only option available due to issues involved with running condenser lines to the unit. He illustrated on photos his contention that there is no appropriate place to install a condenser.

Robert Potter, current owner, was sworn in. Regarding the door replacement, he testified that the original door has decayed along the lock area. He has found one similar to the original, except with 5 panels instead of 6. It will be cut into a Dutch door, and will provide them with a secure lock. In response to questions from the board, Mr. Potter said the new door would be wooden.

Public Comment

None.

Deliberation

Discussion included options available to the owner, and how they could be integrated within the façade and landscaping. There was disagreement among members regarding effects of alteration to the house, and the temporary nature of the units. The case was brought before the HPC as an after-the-fact issue because the original applicant has moved forward in good faith, believing he had approval for the PTAC unit.

Members agreed the replacement door request meets standards. They requested that, in the future, staff separate these types of requests into two motions.

Findings of Fact

Will James made the following MOTION: “I have reviewed the case and all presented testimony and facts and am familiar with the property in question and, therefore, move that the Commission find the following facts concerning HPC case #**H-14-2023**

- 1) That **Edward Norvell, agent for Stephanie and Robert Potter, owners,** appeared before the Commission and sought a Certificate of Appropriateness for the property located at **209 South Ellis Street** and designated within the **West Square** Local Historic District.
- 2) The proposed project is **not incongruous** as detailed in the application and staff finding number 1-3 and incorporated herein; additional testimony provided by Edward Norvell, previous owner, and Allen Brown, provided evidence that that the current PTAC units have the same visual impact as the units they replaced, and the attic addition was constructed in a way that leaves no room for installation of another type of unit. Robert Potter, current owner, testified that the new door would be made of wood, and be constructed to resemble the current door.”

All members present VOTED (7-1), via voice vote.

Action

Will James continued, “I, therefore, move based on the testimony presented, the adopted Findings of Fact, and the adopted Local Historic Design Standards that the Commission: **Approve H-14-2023** subject to any conditions detailed in the Findings of Fact.”

All members present VOTED (6-2), via voice vote.

H-15-2023, 1300 North Main Street; IRA Club, Owner; Richard, Malu, and Travis Howard, Applicants (Parcel ID: 007 051)

Request

Modifications to front and rear porches.

Identification of Property

Emily Vanek made a staff presentation, including COA history. The Mowery-Talton House is classified as “Contributing” to the North Main Street Local Historic District. It was built in 1925, in the Victorian style.

Staff Findings

Staff finds the following element of the project to be not incongruous with the character of the North Main Street Local Historic District:

- 1) The applicant has requested approval for renovations to the front and rear porches. The porches were significantly altered by a previous owner in 2012 and never returned to their original state after the COA was denied. The applicant has replaced portions of the back porch and railing. The balustrade posts were changed from a square post to a Victorian style, which is more appropriate for style of the house. The back porch was previously enclosed before the 2012 changes.
- 2) The applicant has requested approval to replace the balustrade on the front porch with the same balustrade as the back porch. The porch previously had brick walls with tapered columns. Standard 3.5.4. says to replace missing historic porches based on accurate documentation or a new design that is compatible with the historic character of the structure. Standard 5.5.9. says that unfinished lumber is not an appropriate finished appearance for porches.

Staff Recommendation

Based on the preceding findings, staff recommends that the Commission approve H-15-2023 at the Mowery-Talton House located at 1300 North Main Street, within the North Main Street Local Historic District (Parcel ID: 007 051), subject to the following condition:

- 1) The wooden features of the porches shall be painted or stained a color that is compatible with the structure.

Applicant Testimony

Richard Howard was sworn in. Mr. Howard provided the board with examples of the spindles he would like to use on the front porch. He has paused work until he receives approval. Both porches are in very poor condition, and the front porch had been completely destroyed by the former owner, then restored in a manner that did not match the original style of the house. Mr. Howard is making every effort to restore the house to its former style, but admits that will take a lot of effort and cost.

Mr. Howard made additional requests for the board to consider, which are discussed in Deliberation.

Public Comment

None.

Deliberation

Members discussed the 10-year gap between restorations, which includes a caveat that the current owner is not required to restore to the original style. The owner must make every effort to replace or reconstruct as compatible as possible. Mr. Howard will try his best to copy the original style when possible.

In response to a question regarding the size of the replacement columns for the porch, Mr. Howard said they would be 6x6 square.

Members disagreed that the request follows the standards, in light of the previous owner's actions. Mr. Howard has already done work prior to this hearing, however, has stopped in anticipation of this decision.

Mr. Howard asked to add the replacement of the porch ceiling to the request.

Findings of Fact

H-15-2023-A – Porch Railing Replacement

Sue McHugh made the following MOTION: "I have reviewed the case and all presented testimony and facts and am familiar with the property in question and, therefore, move that the Commission find the following facts concerning HPC case #**H-15-2023-A**

- 1) That **Richard Howard, agent for IRA Club, owner,** appeared before the Commission and sought a Certificate of Appropriateness for the property located at **1300 North Main Street** and designated within the **North Main Street** Local Historic District.
- 2) The proposed project is **not incongruous** as detailed in the application and staff finding number 1-2 and incorporated herein; the applicant has requested approval to replace the balustrade on the front porch with the same balustrade as the back porch."

Jon Planovsky seconded the MOTION with all members present VOTING (5-3), via voice vote.

Action

Sue McHugh continued, "I, therefore, move based on the testimony presented, the adopted Findings of Fact, and the adopted Local Historic Design Standards that the Commission: **Approve H-15-2023-A** subject to any conditions detailed in the Findings of Fact."

Jon Planovsky seconded the MOTION. The motion failed to carry with members present VOTING (4-4), via voice vote.

Spencer Dixon made a MOTION to reconsider. Sue McHugh seconded the MOTION with all members present VOTING AYE (8-0).

Spencer Dixon then made a MOTION for the Commission to find the previous facts concerning the case. Jon Planovsky seconded the MOTION with all members present VOTING (7-1), via voice vote.

Sue McHugh made a MOTION, "I, therefore, move based on the testimony presented, the adopted Findings of Fact, and the adopted Local Historic Design Standards that the Commission: **Approve H-15-2023-A** subject to any conditions detailed in the Findings of Fact."

Jon Planovsky seconded the MOTION with all members present VOTING (7-1), via voice vote.

H-15-2023-B – Porch Ceiling Replacement

Sue McHugh made the following MOTION: “I have reviewed the case and all presented testimony and facts and am familiar with the property in question and, therefore, move that the Commission find the following facts concerning HPC case #**H-15-2023-B**

- 1) That **Richard Howard, agent for IRA Club, owner,** appeared before the Commission and sought a Certificate of Appropriateness for the property located at **1300 North Main Street** and designated within the **North Main Street** Local Historic District.
- 2) The proposed project is **not incongruous** as detailed in the application and staff finding number 1-2 and incorporated herein; the applicant has requested approval to replace the porch ceiling. The condition to be applied is that the applicant will use tongue-in-groove material per Standard 3.5.2.”

Spencer Dixon seconded the MOTION with all members present VOTING AYE (8-0), via voice vote.

Sue McHugh continued, “I, therefore, move based on the testimony presented, the adopted Findings of Fact, and the adopted Local Historic Design Standards that the Commission: **Approve H-15-2023-B** subject to any conditions detailed in the Findings of Fact.”

Spencer Dixon seconded the MOTION. The motion carried with all members present VOTING AYE (8-0), via voice vote.

H-16-2023, 221 South Main Street; Andrew and Machele Frick, Owners/Applicants; (Parcel ID: 106 571)

Request

Renovate rear courtyard.

Identification of Property

Emily Vanek made a staff presentation, including COA history. Trexler’s Building is a commercial structure, built in 1955. It is classified as “Non-Contributing” to the Downtown Local Historic District.

Staff Findings

Staff finds the following element of the project to be **not incongruous** with the character of the Downtown Local Historic District:

- 1) The applicant has requested approval for renovations to the rear courtyard to create a terrace. Concrete pavers are proposed to create a solid surface and turf, which is found at the Bell Tower Green and Easy Street alley, is also proposed to be used in the courtyard. **Standard 5.5.1.** says to construct terraces on the rear elevation and **Standard 5.5.2.** says to construct terraces so there is the least possible loss of historic fabric.

Staff Recommendation

Based on the preceding findings, staff recommends that the Commission approve H-16-2023 at the Trexler's Building located at 221 South Main Street, within the Downtown Local Historic District (Parcel ID: 106 571).

Applicant Testimony

Andy Frick was sworn in. He testified that they would like to renovate the back courtyard to hold events for the store. He called upon Chris Queen, the landscaper, to give more detailed information.

Chris Queen was sworn in. Mr. Queen walked the members through his landscaping plan.

Public Comment

None.

Deliberation

Members agreed that artificial turf is used well in other locations, and that the standards don't specifically mention this material.

Findings of Fact

Sue McHugh made the following MOTION: "I have reviewed the case and all presented testimony and facts and am familiar with the property in question and, therefore, move that the Commission find the following facts concerning HPC case #**H-16-2023**

- 1) That **Andrew Frick, owner**, appeared before the Commission and sought a Certificate of Appropriateness for the property located at **221 South Main Street** and designated within the **Downtown** Local Historic District.
- 2) The proposed project is **not incongruous** as detailed in the application and staff finding number 1 and incorporated herein; additional evidence was provided by Chris Queen, the landscaper, who explained the design."

Jon Planovsky seconded the MOTION with all members present VOTING AYE (8-0), via voice vote.

Action

Sue McHugh continued, "I, therefore, move based on the testimony presented, the adopted Findings of Fact, and the adopted Local Historic Design Standards that the Commission: **Approve H-16-2023** subject to any conditions detailed in the Findings of Fact."

Jon Planovsky seconded the MOTION. The motion carried with all members present VOTING AYE (8-0), via voice vote.

H-17-2023, 509 East Fisher Street; Coy Partners, LLC, Owner; Nate Ochoa and Joe Coy, Applicants (Parcel ID: 009 123)

Request

Install wooden border around vinyl windows and replace front door.

Identification of Property

Emily Vanek made a staff presentation, including COA history. The Atwell-Thompson House was built in 1900, in the Victorian style. It is classified as “Contributing” to the Brooklyn-South Square Local Historic District.

Staff Findings

Staff finds the following element of the project to be incongruous with the character of the Brooklyn-South Square Local Historic District:

- 1) The applicant has requested approval to install wooden borders around the previously denied vinyl windows to have the same exterior appearance as wooden windows. In the front right windows, the bottom sash behind the screen has not been altered and has a vinyl border. Standard 3.3.3. says to replace doors when necessary with those that match the original in size, material, and panel division.
- 2) The applicant has replaced the front door after the previous front door was denied by HPC. The new front door has one large lite with two vertical panels, which is similar to the door that was on the house in 2008. Standard 3.3.3. says to replace doors when necessary with those that match the original in size, material, and panel division.

Staff Recommendation

Based on the preceding findings, staff recommends that the Commission approve H-17-2023 at the Atwell-Thompson House located at 509 East Fisher Street, within the Brooklyn-South Square Local Historic District (Parcel ID: 009 123), subject to the following condition:

- 1) The replacement windows shall be replaced with wooden true divided paned windows. The applicant shall submit specifications to staff before installation.

Applicant Testimony

Joe Coy was sworn in. This is an after-the-fact request, as vinyl windows have been installed despite the request being denied. Instead of replacing with wood windows, Mr. Coy chose to face them with wood.

Members asked why Mr. Coy didn’t replace the windows with wood, as requested. He said that the windows had been constructed especially for the house, so were a non-standard size. He was able to find wood windows that fit, but explained that they consisted of 50% vinyl. Because of this, he decided to cover the vinyl with wood.

Public Comment

None.

Deliberation

Steve Cobb provided context for this case within the permission given to Mr. Coy by the Historic Salisbury Foundation, of which he no longer serves as a board member. HSF placed covenants on the property when it sold. They gave permission to install the vinyl windows, with the caveat that Mr. Coy obtain a COA from the HPC. HSF had no knowledge of the wood frame replacement.

Members deliberated on past approvals of vinyl windows, and the reasonings behind them. Several members took issue with the applicant returning twice with after-the-fact applications. Discussion continued, regarding fragile neighborhoods such as Brooklyn-South Square, and the balance of the standards (which don't take cost into account) vs. eventual demolition.

Ellie Goodnow suggested looking to the Parks Service guidelines for direction, which say that vinyl can be used when wood is not available, or when originals are missing or irreparable. In response to the question of whether the HPC can consider these guidelines, Mr. Corriher said they can use them when HPC standards are not clear.

Findings of Fact

Spencer Dixon made the following MOTION: "I have reviewed the case and all presented testimony and facts and am familiar with the property in question and, therefore, move that the Commission find the following facts concerning HPC case **#H-17-2023**

- 1) That **Joe Coy, agent for Coy Partners LLC, owner,** appeared before the Commission and sought a Certificate of Appropriateness for the property located at **509 East Fisher Street** and designated within the **Brooklyn-South Square** Local Historic District.
- 2) The proposed project is **not incongruous** as detailed in the application and staff finding number 1-2 and incorporated herein; Joe Coy provided evidence regarding the replacement of wood frames to the vinyl windows. The replacement door matches one that was installed at the house in 2008.
- 3) In approving the request, HPC referred to sustainability standards outlined by the National Parks Service."

Jon Planovsky seconded the MOTION with all members present VOTING (7-1), via voice vote.

Action

Spencer Dixon continued, "I, therefore, move based on the testimony presented, the adopted Findings of Fact, and the adopted Local Historic Design Standards that the Commission: **Approve H-17-2023** subject to any conditions detailed in the Findings of Fact."

Jon Planovsky seconded the MOTION. The motion carried with all members present VOTING (7-1), via voice vote.

H-18-2023, 201 West Fisher Street; Rowan County, Owner; Paul Whitley, Applicant (Parcel ID: 009 123)

Request

Repair dormers and replace windows.

Identification of Property

Emily Vanek made a staff presentation, including COA history. The Rowan County Library was built in the early 1960's, in the Georgian style. It is classified as "Non-Contributing" to the West Square Local Historic District.

Staff Findings

Staff finds the following element of the project to be incongruous with the character of the West Square Local Historic District:

- 1) The applicant has requested approval for repair work to the four dormers which include replacing the windows and siding. The work will require the temporary removal of slate roof tiles. The tiles will be reused and replacement slate tiles will be used to replace damaged tiles as needed. Ridge and hip caps will be replaced to match the original metal as needed. Standard 3.4.2. says to retain character defining roofing and replace with material that matches the original.
- 2) Proposed replacement windows are aluminum with true divided panes with the same design as the existing windows. Standard 3.3.3. says if replacement of windows is necessary to replace with windows that match the existing in size, design, pane division, method of operation, and material.
- 3) Proposed replacement siding is smooth cementitious siding with the same thickness and vertical exposure as the existing wood siding. Standard 3.1.10. says that cementitious siding can be considered on a case by case basis if it is used in a traditional matter that includes corner boards and architectural trim and have the same thickness and profile of the original material. The cementitious siding will be painted the same color as the rest of the siding.

Staff Recommendation

Based on the preceding findings, staff recommends that the Commission approve H-18-2023 at the Rowan County Library located at 201 West Fisher Street, within the West Square Local Historic District (Parcel ID: 010 157), subject to the following condition:

- 1) The replacement windows shall be composed of wood with true-divided panes. The applicant shall submit specifications to staff before installation.

Applicant Testimony

Paul Whitley was sworn in. He explained that replacement is needed due to extensive damage, and they are using materials that would reduce maintenance.

In response to questions from members, Mr. Whitley said that siding would be used only on the dormers. When a cementitious material would not work for trim, or other pieces, they would use wood, including the trim on the front. The physical shape for every piece being replaced would not change. The replacement windows include a grid in between the panes. The grid could be placed on the outside to add dimension to the windows.

Public Comment

None.

Deliberation

Members discussed the location of siding and windows; the fact that all is located on the roof, and far from view makes the request appropriate. The modern age of the building was also a consideration. Dimension on the window glass was determined a necessity.

Ms. McHugh reminded the applicant that there are qualified manufacturers in town that can build wood replacement windows.

Findings of Fact

Steve Cobb made the following MOTION: "I have reviewed the case and all presented testimony and facts and am familiar with the property in question and, therefore, move that the Commission find the following facts concerning HPC case #H-18-2023

- 1) That **Paul Whitley, agent for Rowan County, owner,** appeared before the Commission and sought a Certificate of Appropriateness for the property located at **201 West Fisher Street** and designated within the **West Square** Local Historic District.
- 2) The proposed project is **not incongruous** as detailed in the application and staff finding number 1-3 and incorporated herein; the HPC has determined that the location of the windows is such that it is difficult to see they will be vinyl.
- 3) The findings are subject to the condition that the window dividers be applied to the outside of the glass, and incorporated herein."

Sue McHugh seconded the MOTION with all members present VOTING AYE (8-0), via voice vote.

Action

Steve Cobb continued, "I, therefore, move based on the testimony presented, the adopted Findings of Fact, and the adopted Local Historic Design Standards that the Commission: **Approve H-18-2023** subject to any conditions detailed in the Findings of Fact."

Spencer Dixon seconded the MOTION. The motion carried with all members present VOTING (7-1), via voice vote.

H-19-2023, 706 North Main Street; J2 Land Investment, LLC, Owner; John Lambert, Applicant (Parcel ID: 009 123)

Request

Construct three single-family houses.

Identification of Property

Emily Vanek made a staff presentation, including COA history. The vacant lot is located in the North Main Local Historic District.

Staff Findings

Staff finds the following elements of the project to be incongruous with the character of the North Main Street Local Historic District:

- 1) The applicant has requested approval to construct three single-family houses at 706 North Main Street. The lot will be subdivided into three lots, two facing North Main Street and one facing West Lafayette Street that are 50' wide and 100' deep.

Buildings Setbacks and Orientation

- 2) Standard 5.1.1. says to keep setbacks in new construction consistent with other buildings in the district on the same block. The front setbacks for the proposed and existing structures are below:

Addresses	Front Setbacks
Proposed Houses	12'
116 W Lafayette St	12'
710 N Main St	12'
714 N Main St	10'
716 N Main St	18'
703 N Main St	17'
705 N Main St	17'
709 N Main St	10'

- 3) Standard 5.1.3. says to make the distances between buildings consistent with the spacing of other buildings in the district. The spacing of proposed houses and adjacent are below:

Addresses	Northern Spacing	Southern Spacing
Proposed House 1	16'	14'
Proposed House 2	14'	14'
710 N Main St	10'	14' (proposed)
714 N Main St	15'	10'
716 N Main St	15'	15'
722 N Main St	11'	15'
728 N Main St	15'	11'
730 N Main St	0'	15'
Average	13.2'	13.2'

- 4) Two houses will face North Main Street and one will face West Lafayette Street, to be consistent with other buildings on those blocks. Standard 5.1.4. says that new buildings should face the street to be consistent with other building.

Size and Scale

- 5) The proposed houses are one story with elongated proportions. This block of North Main Street has a mix of one- and two-story buildings and examples of elongated proportions at 709, 722, and 726 North Main Street, 722 is listed as contributing to the district. Standard 5.2.1. says to design the height of new buildings to be consistent with historic buildings on the block and Standard 5.2.2. says to design the proportion of the front elevation to be consistent with contributing structures.
- 6) The proposed windows are one-over-one with a mix of grouped and single windows, both of which can be found on other houses within this block. Standard 5.2.3. says to introduce windows and doors that are compatible with others on contributing structures in the district.
- 7) The roof style is gable, which is common on the block, but most houses on this block have a mix of roof styles. Standard 5.2.4. says to keep the roof shapes consistent with others in the district.

Materials, Design, and Rhythm

- 8) Proposed materials include lap siding, wooden windows, wooden doors, asphalt shingle roof, brick veneer, and cementitious fascia, vented soffit, and bead board for porch ceiling. Standard 5.3.1. says to use materials commonly found in the district in new construction. Standard 5.3.2. says that cementitious siding can be considered in new construction if it is non-grained and has the same thickness and vertical exposure as wooden siding.
- 9) Standard 5.3.4. says to ensure that architectural details of the new construction complement architectural features of contributing structures. The columns on the proposed houses are half brick and half wood, which is common on this block. Decorative front truss and rafter ends are proposed on the front elevations. Fixed shutters that are not sized to the windows are shown on the front elevation plan.
- 10) Standard 5.3.6. says to avoid large expanses of blank walls in new construction. The applicant has revised the elevation plans to introduce additional windows and door to the side elevations.

Paving, Driveways, and Site Features

- 11) The applicant has revised the site plans to keep the driveways a consistent width as other driveways on the block. Driveways on this block range from 8-10 feet wide. Standard 4.2.2. says to construct new driveways to be the same width as existing driveways within the district and Standard 4.2.11. says that appropriate materials for driveways include concrete, gravel, stone, granite, and brick.

12) Front walkways that lead from the public sidewalk to the front porch are proposed. Standard 4.2.10 says that appropriate materials for walkways are brick, stone, or gravel.

13) One light fixture is proposed next to each front door. Standard 4.3.2. says to select unobtrusive fixtures and Standard 4.3.4. says to introduce lighting that provides adequate security, but does not overly emphasize the property.

Staff Recommendation

Based on the preceding findings, staff recommends that the commission approve H-19-2023 at the vacant lot located at 706 North Main Street (Parcel ID: 011 110) within the North Main Street Local Historic District, subject to the following condition:

1) The applicant shall develop and implement a landscaping plan to meet Standard 4.5.6.

Applicant Testimony

John Lambert was sworn in. The plans changed after packet was sent to HPC. Mr. Lambert thanked the HPC and staff for working with them on recommendations to adjust the home designs to make them more compatible with the district. The new plans reflect these recommendations. He believes the additions will add value to the neighborhood, especially the forward edge of the district.

Mr. Lambert answered questions from members:

- All trim, and exposed rafters will be painted white. Had not considered the shingles, but will.
- As recommended, they will use brick in the foundation, as well as smooth cementitious siding.
- Two driveway options were displayed.
- Mr. Lambert explained the siding design, and will ask the designer to make it consistent on all sides.
- They are using cementitious board and brick as soffit material.
- Windows will be single pane.
- Front doors will be wood and glass.
- Gutters and downspouts will be glass.

Public Comment

None.

Deliberation

Ms. Vanek said the landscape plan will be designed with assistance from the City's landscape architect.

The applicant has taken the suggestions made by staff and HPC to heart, and designed houses that will fit into the district.

Findings of Fact

Marcelo Menza made the following MOTION: “I have reviewed the case and all presented testimony and facts and am familiar with the property in question and, therefore, move that the Commission find the following facts concerning HPC case #H-19-2023:

- 1) That **John Lambert, agent for J2 Land Investments LLC, owner,** appeared before the Commission and sought a Certificate of Appropriateness for the property located at **706 North Main Street** and designated within the **North Main Street Local** Historic District.
- 2) The proposed project is **not incongruous** as detailed in the application and staff finding number 1-13 and incorporated herein;
- 3) An additional condition is the house built on the corner lot will have horizontal siding installed on the front and side.”

Jon Planovsky seconded the MOTION with all members present VOTING AYE (8-0), via voice vote.

Action

Marcelo Menza continued, “I, therefore, move based on the testimony presented, the adopted Findings of Fact, and the adopted Local Historic Design Standards that the Commission: **Approve H-19-2023** subject to any conditions detailed in the Findings of Fact.”

Spencer Dixon seconded the MOTION. The motion carried with all members present VOTING AYE (8-0), via voice vote.

H-20-2023, 422 East Fisher Street; Balbina Soriano and Alfredo Liborio, Owners; Nelly Olivares, Applicant (Parcel ID: 009 123)

Request

Replace standing seam metal roof with asphalt shingles.

Identification of Property

Emily Vanek made a staff presentation, including COA history. The Shaver-Crowell-Fisher House, a Victorian Cottage, was built in 1875. It is classified as “Contributing” to the Brooklyn-South Square Local Historic District.

Staff Findings

Staff finds the following elements of the project to be **incongruous** with the character of the Brooklyn-South Square Local Historic District:

- 1) The applicant has requested approval to replace the standing seam metal roof with asphalt shingles. Standard 3.4.2. says to retain character defining roofing and replace with material that matches the original.

Staff Recommendation

Staff finds the finding number 1 inconsistent with the Local Historic Design Standards, and therefore recommends that the commission deny H-20-2023 at the Shaver-Crowell-Fisher House located at 422 East Fisher Street, within the Brooklyn-South Square Local Historic District (Parcel ID: 010 377).

Applicant Testimony

Nelly Olivares was sworn in. Before her testimony, she had a question related to the chimney. It is leaning, and getting worse. She was advised that a COA is necessary for replacement of the chimney.

The current roof is leaking, and needs to be replaced. She was under the impression that an asphalt roof would be sturdier and longer-lasting.

Public Comment

None.

Deliberation

Members agreed with staff that replacing the roof with asphalt is not appropriate, as the material is not like-for-like, as stated in the Standards. The current roof is a replacement; however, the house most likely had a metal roof when built.

Ms. Olivares was advised that replacing with a metal roof would be a more prudent decision, as it would be more durable than asphalt. An added advantage is that a metal replacement would only require staff approval.

Findings of Fact

Sue McHugh made the following MOTION: "I have reviewed the case and all presented testimony and facts and am familiar with the property in question and, therefore, move that the Commission find the following facts concerning HPC case #H-20-2023

- 1) That **Nelly Olivares, agent for Balbina Soriano, owner,** appeared before the Commission and sought a Certificate of Appropriateness for the property located at **422 East Fisher Street** and designated within the **Brooklyn-South Square** Local Historic District.
2. The proposed project is **incongruous** as detailed in the application and staff finding number 1 and incorporated herein; no additional evidence/testimony was provided."

Spencer Dixon seconded the MOTION with all members present VOTING AYE (8-0), via voice vote.

Action

Sue McHugh continued, "I, therefore, move based on the testimony presented, the adopted Findings of Fact, and the adopted Local Historic Design Standards that the Commission: **Deny H-20-2023** based on the following: the request does not meet design standards."

Spencer Dixon seconded the MOTION. The motion carried with all members present VOTING AYE (8-0), via voice vote.

OTHER BUSINESS

Minor Works Report

Regarding a question on replacement of asphalt shingles for the same material in H-13-2023, Ms. Vanek explained the applicant was replacing like-for-like.

Approval of Minutes

March, 2023 HPC minutes were approved as written by all Members present.

Nominating Committee

The Nominating Committee made a recommendation of Sue McHugh as Chair, and Steve Cobb, Vice-Chair. There were no other nominations from the floor. All members present VOTED AYE (8-0) for the recommended slate. Ellie Goodnow expressed her pleasure with the slate, as she prefers to serve as a regular member.

Historic Preservation Incentive (HPI) Grants

Spencer Dixon, Marcelo Menza, Ellie Goodnow, and Sue McHugh volunteered to serve on this committee. Ms. Vanek would like them to review requirements when they meet.

Training

Ms. Vanek reminded members of the Commissioner Assistance and Mentoring Program (CAMP), on April 21 in Asheville.

Sign Toppers

Toppers have been ordered for the rest of the districts. Downtown toppers will be installed on lower signs.

Architectural Survey Update

An architectural survey is underway to document all structures within the Salisbury National Register Historic District and 15 surrounding blocks. The district was originally documented in 1975 with several updates completed in the 1980s and 1990s. HPC will host an informational meeting for property owners and residents at the May 11 HPC meeting. Information about the survey and the grant the city received to conduct it is on the website:

salisburync.gov/preservation

ADJOURNMENT

The meeting adjourned at 9:06 pm. The next meeting will be held on Thursday, May 11, 2023, in City Council Chambers.

Ellie Goodnow, Vice-Chair

Jennifer Pfaff, Secretary